

# Policy & Practice

## A Development Education Review

ISSN: 1748-135X  
Editor: Jenna Coriddi

*"The views expressed herein are those of individual authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the official opinion of Irish Aid."*

© Centre for Global Education 2010

The Centre for Global Education is accepted as a charity by Inland Revenue under reference number XR73713 and is a Company Limited by Guarantee Number 25290

# Contents

## Editorial

*Ruairi Brugha* 1

## Focus

The authority of a lived experience': An investigation of study visits as a professional development opportunity for post-primary development educators

*Mella Cusack & Aoife Rush* 9

Situated learning methodologies for activism in development education and education for sustainable development

*Nancy L. Serrano & Roland Tormey* 25

Music listening circles: Contributions from development education to democratising classical music

*Danilo Martins de Castro Chaib* 42

Does development education 'fit' into adult education?: Offering adult learners the opportunity to engage with development issues

*Natasha Bailey* 59

Grounding Higher Education in the Community: The Case of Waterford Women's Centre & Waterford Institute of Technology

*Eleanor D'alton, Mary Fenton, Helen Maher and Maeve O'Grady* 78

## Perspectives

Best practice in North-South research relationships in higher education: The Irish African partnership model

*Mary Goretti Nakabugo, Eimear Barrett, Peter McEvoy & Ronaldo Munck* 89

Naming the world: Coming to terms with complexity

*Helen Young* 99

Art imitating reality: the screening and non-screening of the film <i>Balibo</i> and the ongoing struggle for truth recovery and human rights in Indonesia and Timor-Leste <i>Paul Hainsworth</i>	105
Global education and music <i>Alexandra De La Torre</i>	113
Let us walk the talk: Successes and struggles in implementing global education as a regular course at university level <i>Otilia Chareka, Garry Leyte &amp; Alicia Mills</i>	120
Tales of hunting <i>Jaya Graves</i>	127
<b>Resource reviews</b>	
Promoting Development Education in Youth Work Training <i>Hilary Tierney</i>	135
Global Education Guidelines: Concepts and Methodologies on Global Education for Educators and Policy Makers <i>Charo Lanao-Madden</i>	139

# Editorial

## OVERCOMING FRAGMENTATION IN IRELAND'S DEVELOPMENT COMMUNITIES THROUGH AN ALL IRELAND GLOBAL DEVELOPMENT FORUM

Ruairi Brugha

The establishment of the Millennium Development Goals in 2000 and commitments by the G8 (Group of Eight) countries and the United Nations General Assembly in 2001 to increase funding for the fight against HIV and AIDS launched a decade of renewed commitment to development worldwide. It was also a decade where Ireland's official overseas development assistance (ODA) rose dramatically, both in absolute amounts and in proportions of gross national income (GNI): increasing from 255 million (0.30 per cent of GNI) in 2000 to 921m (0.59 per cent of GNI) in 2008. By 2007, Ireland's ODA of 0.54 per cent of GNI proportionately exceeded that of the United Kingdom (UK) (0.36 per cent of its GNI), based on a higher per capita GNI.

Moving swiftly on from mention of Ireland's economic shooting star, more important than the levels of Ireland's ODA was the high reputation that Irish Aid programmes had earned, as can be attested by those working in international development during this period. Irish Aid, working closely with the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DfID) and the mainly Nordic Group of 'like-minded' countries, often took a leadership role in rolling out new development funding mechanisms, including sector wide approaches (SWAPs) and budget support. Irish Aid was also in the forefront in promoting new strategies such as gender- and HIV-mainstreaming across the development sectors.

Big reductions in Ireland's ODA in 2009 and 2010 (down to 671m – 0.52 per cent of GNI) have been a major setback, but need not result in reversals in gains made towards development goals, if cutbacks are managed well. The jury is still out on their effects. One reason for this has been the lack of concerted action from Ireland's development communities, which should be asking pertinent questions of the Department of Foreign Affairs, and ensuring that its responses are part of a public debate: where precisely were the cuts made? What evidence and criteria were used to determine the distribution and

levels of the cuts to different sectors, recipient organisations or countries? What have been the impacts of cuts on the development sectors and on the overall goal of poverty reduction?

There are other questions that the development education community in Ireland should also be asking. 2007 saw the launch of a five year Programme of Strategic Cooperation between Irish Aid and Higher Education and Research Institutes. The long-term aim of this (hopefully first) five year programme was 'to increase the capacity of [global] Southern institutions to make an effective contribution to poverty reduction'. For this to be achieved, the Report stated: 'Irish Aid recognises that the capacity of the sector in Ireland needs to be strengthened in order to be able to respond to this agenda. Therefore in the initial phase of the programme (2007-11) there will be a more concentrated focus on capacity building of the higher education sector in Ireland' (Irish Aid, 2007).

In 2007 and 2008, eight programmes were funded (up to 1.5m each) spanning different combinations of Irish Third Level Higher Education and Research Institutes (HEIs), south and north of the border. The programmes, which focused on African countries, covered health, education, HIV/AIDS, water and other general development issues (see <http://www.irishaid.gov.ie/article.asp?article=1057>). Irish Aid, working with the Programme Heads, has been developing an evaluation framework and indicators to assess programme performance. Now past the halfway mark of the Programme of Strategic Cooperation, it is time for Irish HEIs to reflect on what they could be doing collectively to increase their effectiveness in contributing to capacity building for development research and education, both in the global North (in Ireland) and in the South (especially in Africa).

In many ways, UK's DfID has been the leader in supporting capacity building for development research in its HEI sector, through its five year 'knowledge programmes', which I first encountered when I joined the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (LSHTM) in 1996, and participated in until my move back to Ireland in 2005. Knowledge programmes have enabled UK HEIs to establish and foster long-term links with research partners in low- and middle-income countries. Follow-on programmes, awarded through competitive tender, have rewarded performance and supported programme sustainability. For example, LSHTM's Health Economics and Financing Programme has been receiving DfID funding for over fifteen years, and has had since its inception some of the same Southern partners, whom it is including as

co-applicants in its 2010 application for a fourth consecutive tranche of funding (see <http://www.crehs.lshtm.ac.uk/>).

While competitive tendering represents the best mechanism for awarding programme grants and rewarding excellence, it also has its downsides. At the stroke of a pen, a programme that may have several ‘soft’ (research) funded staff, in the global South as well as the North, can come to an end with only a few months remaining to find contingency funding or else terminate programme activities. Competitive tendering for programme funding between eligible institutions is essential, but is a mixed blessing. On the one hand, while a ‘wheat and chaff’ metaphor may be harsh, it is not and should not be the objective of tax payer-funded programmes to fund jobs in Ireland, regardless of performance in contributing to development in Africa. However, a second downside is that competition can undermine collaborative approaches between HEIs. Collaboration may be a more important objective in a smaller setting, such as Ireland, which lacks the larger critical mass of development research-focused HEIs found in the UK.

Most of the senior staff in the HEI programmes that Irish Aid funds through the Higher Education Authority (HEA) are doing development research in addition to their ‘day jobs’. They are paid by their HEIs to deliver training programmes and research outputs focused on the Irish market and Irish knowledge priorities. Justification for efforts and use of institutional resources for development research to their Deans, Presidents and Chief Executives – who may be broadly sympathetic but who are also under pressure to deliver more with less resources – inevitably gets translated into the market-metrics of HEIs. These include publications in impact factor-rated journals and citations and attraction of fee-paying students, whether those students are funded by Irish Aid or from other sources.

Khoo and Lehane (2008), in Issue 7 of *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*, contrasted two scenarios for higher education – ‘democratic deliberation’ versus ‘market rationality’ – and suggested that development education fitted with the former. They proceeded to illustrate how Irish HEIs increasingly danced to the tune of market forces and productivity metrics and concluded that ‘their research activities are increasingly eschewing traditional scholarly autonomy in favour of market values and competitive rankings on global league tables’. The reality in Ireland is that development education and research in HEIs have been largely driven by the interests, values and vision of individual academics. Permanent posts, however, are in short

supply and career-security and advancement require that academics dance to the tune of impact factors and citation rates. Therefore academics, as far as possible, need to ensure that the development research they undertake scores well according to such metrics. At the same time, all such academics that I know in Ireland also aim for their research to support an equitable and human rights value-driven approach to global development.

In many ways international development in Ireland and Irish Aid reached a zenith in 2007-08. Thereafter, a perfect storm occurred that combined decentralisation, budget cuts and a major internal re-organisation with significant staff changes, which left Irish Aid reeling and searching for a new equilibrium. In 2010, funding for some of the first tranche of programmes under the Irish Aid-HEA Programme of Strategic Cooperation is due to end. Two complementary approaches could build on what has been achieved and strengthen development research capacity in Irish HEIs and links with our African partners. First, Irish researchers would welcome a Southern-led process, where our African research partners are offered an opportunity to compete for Irish Aid funding to undertake research on country priorities, supported by Irish HEI researchers. The second approach would be agreement among Irish HEIs and support from Irish Aid to establish a Development Forum, to add value to existing efforts in development education and research and to Irish Aid's forthcoming research strategy.

What shape might an Irish Development Forum take? Firstly, it should be an all-Ireland body and encompass all of the HEIs, not just those South of the border and not just the universities. We are a set of relatively small communities, and a critical mass for research and education across the development sectors can only be achieved collectively. Secondly, if we lack the track record and specific-sector expertise of organisations such as the London School of Economics, the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, or the Institute of Development Studies, we have the potential to bring together our sectoral experiences and work in a cross-sectoral way. Such a way of working is not typical of the narrowness and depth with which researchers normally feel comfortable, which means it could produce innovation in development research and education. Cross-sectoral working is an Irish Aid priority.

Thirdly, as a small island with a vibrant history of development work – through missionary orders, non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and by individuals in a range of voluntary, multilateral and bilateral development agencies – there has been a lot of interaction and movement between the

different development communities. Irish Aid seminars were well attended by members of all these different communities, especially HEI-based academics who often contributed to them, when held at Bishop's Square in Dublin up to 2008. A Development Forum that encompassed the needs and aims of these diverse development constituencies – education, research, practice, advocacy and policy development – would be a more ambitious entity than, for example, the UK Development Studies Association (<http://www.devstud.org.uk/>).

Fourthly, just as lack of development up to the 1970s enabled Ireland to leapfrog generations of telecommunication capacity, which along with our education system contributed to rapid economic growth up to 2002, an All Ireland Global Development Forum could leapfrog and adopt new communication technologies for the dissemination of knowledge for development. The Irish Aid-funded HEA Programme Heads have been discussing the possibility of a Web Portal for Development Research, which could provide a forum for researchers, policy-makers, NGOs, funding organisations and others to deposit and freely access development research outputs, exchange ideas and share best practice. This would strengthen linkages and provide multi-directional communication channels for the development partners, in Ireland and among their overseas partners, who generate and use evidence for development. Development staff (including Irish Aid country offices), project and programme managers and policy makers in Africa and beyond could thereby access up-to-date research-based evidence.

Finally, academic researchers, teachers, practitioners, activists and policy makers (and those who wear several hats) should be critical allies of each other. Academic researchers know that a doctorate and a journal publication record is required for survival in a HEI. Just as academics need to develop skills in using other communication media, other development communities can learn from us. Academic research outputs are filtered through an independent peer-reviewed quality assurance process, to which other forms of knowledge are only occasionally subjected. It is far from perfect; but far better than no peer-review process. Development PhD programmes, which several of the HEA programmes established using Irish Aid funding, are the means to ensure that undergraduate, diploma and masters development education programmes, which most development professionals consider a pre-requisite for their practice, are of international quality. They also provide one of the stated 'Gains for Irish Aid': 'Development of a valuable pool of knowledge and expertise in Ireland that can be drawn on for advocacy, policy development and research' (Irish Aid, 2007).



However, although necessary, PhDs and journal articles are not sufficient for ensuring research informs development education, policy and practice. Academic researchers want direct connections to knowledge users – teachers, practitioners, activists and policy makers – who can translate research-based evidence into policies and programmes that directly benefit people’s lives, especially in Africa where most of us did our development work. It is this direct connection, which a Development Forum could support, that makes researchers feel that a life too often consumed by the frustrating pursuit of journal publications is a life well chosen. One of the many unfortunate effects of the decentralisation of Irish Aid to Limerick has been the fragmentation of links and alliances across Ireland’s development communities (not even our colleagues in the Limerick HEIs would argue that the advantages to development compensate for the damage done). Irish Aid now has much less access to the critical and analytical input provided by the other development communities, especially indigenous academics and NGOs, which are among its core constituencies.

No Irish development academic I know would expect payment for providing short technical inputs to Irish Aid, such as giving or responding to a seminar presentation, provision of advice on technical issues, or commentary on a draft document. They would welcome such opportunities. Drastic cut-backs in the Irish Aid budget for consultancies are therefore no reason for Irish Aid to deprive itself from accessing indigenous expertise on development issues. Several senior academics were among the group of national and international development experts who contributed their services to Irish Aid as a free good for three years, 2006-08 (around four meetings per year), on the Technical Advisory Group to support the Taoiseach’s Initiative on HIV/AIDS and Communicable Diseases. Meetings stopped in late 2008 and the members received no further communication, no explanation and no acknowledgement of their contributions.

Development is a life-long commitment and a vocation for those of us fortunate to have progressed from a period of voluntary service or short overseas exposure to development to making it a central focus of our working lives, during and often after what are normal working hours for others. Foregoing any opportunity to make sure that it is done well is not an option we should take, which may sometimes require biting the hand that has fed us. The gap that has opened up between Irish Aid and its core constituencies, especially academic researchers and NGOs, has meant that we as development

communities in Ireland are losing the ability to understand and learn from each other.

We academics are also lacking and in need of the critical engagement that would come from more regular interaction with Irish Aid and the NGO community (which will get us out on parole from our ivory towers). An Irish Global Development Forum could provide a mechanism to support this, building synergies and helping us all to overcome fragmentation. We could use communication technology to get us to work efficiently and overcome the barriers created by decentralisation, until the politicians come to their senses. We are a small island and those of us committed to development need to act on the words used recently by two prominent residents of Phoenix Park: *'Ní neart go cur le chéile* – strength comes from working together.

### **Editor's note**

Ruairí Brughá's examination of the sector draws our attention to the opportunities that exist and are being passed by. His suggestion to create a development forum to promote greater coordination and cooperation in the sector, especially within formal education, is exactly the type of innovation we aimed to examine in Issue 11 of *Policy & Practice*, on the theme Innovations in Development Education. The Focus articles describe recent research and projects aimed to develop and strengthen the sector as a whole. Natasha Bailey looks at how development education can fit into adult education to better engage adults with development issues. Nancy Serrano and Roland Tormey explore how to embed development education and education for sustainable development within the post-primary curriculum in Ireland using situated cognition methodologies. Mella Cusack and Aoife Rush present research findings from study visits involving post-primary teachers related to the effectiveness of short-term study visits as a professional development opportunity. Eleanor D'alton, Mary Fenton, Helen Maher and Maeve O'Grady chart the evolution of an innovative learning partnership between the Waterford Women's Centre and the Waterford Institute of Technology, and summarise the key findings of an evaluation of its effectiveness. Danilo Martins de Castro Chaib examines how music circles can impact and alter our understanding of the relationship between cultural capital and cultural imperialism, and how development education assists these culture circles. I hope that Issue 11 inspires readers to look at how they can implement innovative ideas into their work to increase the quality and effectiveness of development education across the

board. For more information on contributing or to suggest an article topic, please contact the Editor: [jenna@centreforglobaleducation.com](mailto:jenna@centreforglobaleducation.com)

## References

Irish Aid (2007) Programme of Strategic Cooperation between Irish Aid and Higher Education and Research Institutes, 2007-2011, Dublin: <http://www.irishaid.gov.ie/Uploads/Strategic%20Cooperation.pdf>

Khoo, SM & Lehane O (2008) 'Globalisation and the re-imagination of research: Teaching and learning in Irish higher education' in *Policy & Practice: A Development Education Review*, Vol. 7, Autumn 2008.

**Professor Ruairí Brugha** qualified as a doctor at University College Dublin in 1980; spent six years in Africa in the 1980s-1990s, as a clinician, public health specialist and researcher; and 10 years at the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, heading the Health Policy Unit. In 2005, he joined the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland. He conducts health policy and services research in Africa and Ireland (see <http://www.ghinet.org> for some of his research).

# Focus

## ‘THE AUTHORITY OF A LIVED EXPERIENCE’: AN INVESTIGATION OF STUDY VISITS AS A PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITY FOR POST-PRIMARY DEVELOPMENT EDUCATORS

The Irish development agency Trócaire’s post-primary development education (DE) programme involves the participation of teachers and students in thirty schools on the island of Ireland. Each year participants engage with a specific human rights or development issue, raise awareness and promote action within their community. Teachers perceive involvement as particularly beneficial in engendering student interpersonal, communication, presentation and media literacy skills. However, they also find teaching about complex development issues challenging. In 2007 Trócaire restructured the DE programme, with the inclusion of a study or ‘exposure’ visit to one of the organisation’s programme countries in the ‘developing’ world, thus placing greater emphasis on teacher professional development. In this article, **Mella Cusack** and **Aoife Rush** set out the main research findings from two study visits involving eighteen post-primary teachers from both Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland in 2008 and 2009. The article discusses findings relating to the effectiveness of short term study visits as a professional development opportunity; the changes in teacher understandings of development towards perspectives emphasising the interdependency and complexity of issues; and the impact of the study visit on classroom practice. The authors articulate the need for longitudinal research into the impact of teacher study visits as a means of assessing the role of non-governmental organisations (NGOs) as teacher education providers, particularly relevant in the current context of contracting state-funded continuing professional development opportunities.

### Introduction

Trócaire was established in 1973 as the official overseas development agency of the Catholic Church in Ireland. The organisation currently has 127 programmes across Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Middle East. Trócaire’s mandate includes awareness raising and mobilisation of the public (Ireland and internationally) to achieve changes in policies, programmes and behaviours which impact on poverty and injustice. To this end the organisation’s Education Unit aims to embed development education (DE) across all education sectors. Trócaire defines DE as ‘an active and creative process which facilitates

critical thinking in relation to global inequality and engages with a variety of perspectives'. This understanding is informed by the 'values of solidarity, participation, perseverance, courage and accountability'. DE is 'built on awareness, analysis, reflection and action for justice and change' (Trócaire, 2009).

Trócaire's post-primary DE programme was established in 2003 and currently involves thirty schools on the island of Ireland. Each academic year participating teachers and students engage with a specific human right/development issue, raise awareness and promote action within their community (Smith, 2007). Schools are provided with case studies and country statistics and students are involved in media literacy, presenting and campaigning training. A visitor from one of Trócaire's programme countries also visits schools, giving insights into their lives, work and country. In some schools the DE programme is run on an extra-curricular basis, with senior cycle peace and justice groups meeting to plan and execute their campaign projects. In other contexts the programme has been allocated a dedicated time period in Transition Year or is delivered through complimentary curricular areas, such as religious education, geography, economics or civic, social and political education (CSPE).

In 2005 a small-scale survey found that participating teachers perceive involvement in the programme as particularly beneficial in engendering student interpersonal, communication, presentation and media literacy skills. However, a number of teachers pointed out that the complexity of the themes of focus, combined with the action-orientated nature of participating young people and of the structure of the programme itself, at times resulted in a superficial engagement with the development themes (Cusack, 2005). It was obvious that those best placed to bridge student's 'knowledge gap' are the teachers themselves. However, the teachers surveyed in 2005 indicated that they sometimes found it difficult to teach about complex development issues. This echoes findings from research carried out by Gleeson, et al. (2007) into the development education levels of knowledge, attitudes and activism in post-primary schools which found that teachers' knowledge of development and aid issues was 'quite low'. Only 18 per cent regarded themselves as well informed about 'Third World issues'. Despite this, 'their sense that they value and engage with development education is quite high' (Gleeson, et al., 2007:27-28, 60).

In 2007 Trócaire restructured the DE programme placing greater emphasis on teacher professional development. A study visit to one of the

organisation's programme countries in the 'developing' world was integrated into year two of the three year cycle of involvement for participating schools, to provide teachers with 'a firsthand learning experience about another country' (UNICEF, 1995). Trócaire recognises teachers as key multipliers who could benefit from 'exposure' or 'study' visits. The study visits are therefore motivated by a desire to equip key multipliers with the knowledge, skills and confidence to be effective development educators. Over the course of their careers participating teachers potentially impact on large numbers of students, communicating how development happens, what works or does not work in development, how financial contributions are spent and why a long term, human rights based approach to development is needed.

Trócaire staff also hoped that the professional development opportunities provided in the restructured DE programme would facilitate a greater sense of ownership amongst participating teachers. Supported by teaching/learning materials, teachers would then be able to facilitate the annual programme – training, research, campaigning and hosting the visitor – with less direct support from Education Officers. As participating schools progress through the three-year cycle of involvement they would therefore become increasingly self-sustaining.

This article begins with a summary of the literature relating to short term study visits and the research methodologies employed in two study visits involving eighteen practising post-primary teachers from both Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland, organised by Trócaire in 2008 and 2009. Findings and recommendations related to study visits as a professional development opportunity; the changes in teacher understandings of development towards perspectives emphasising the interdependency and complexity of issues; and, the impact of the study visit experience on classroom practice are discussed throughout.

## **Literature review**

The first decade of the twentieth-first century saw a rapid increase in the pace of overseas 'linking' from Ireland. The term 'linking' encompasses a range of possible contacts between people, from non-travelling to immersion activities. Although a number of guides for organisations involved in linking have been produced, only a limited amount of research has been carried out tracking the impact of linking on organising institutions, Irish

participants/volunteers or on partner participants/host personnel (UNICEF, 1995; Comhlámh, 2005; O’Keeffe, 2006; DICE, 2009).

The development education community in Ireland, led by the Irish Development Education Association (IDEA), has initiated a much needed debate about the relative advantages of engaging in linking activities (IDEA, 2007). Until now this debate has tended to focus on identifying good practice in post-primary sector school-to-school linking but has not yet emphasised the need to interrogate linking activities specifically targeting teachers in initial teacher education (short term voluntary placements usually organised by the teacher education provider) or in continuing professional development settings (short term study visits usually organised by a non-governmental organisation).

Limited literature on short-term volunteering placements by primary and pre-service student teachers is available. This research highlights that international cross-cultural experiences, which adhere to recognised good practice, can impact upon participants, their intercultural understandings, and the content and methodologies which they subsequently employ in their teaching (Willard-Holt, 2001; Purves et al, 2005; Martin, 2008; and, O’Dwyer, 2009). However, there continues to be a marked absence of research into the impacts and effectiveness of short-term visits by practicing post-primary teachers to the global South. This article represents an attempt to begin to fill this research gap.

## **Research methodology**

The first study visit process organised by Trócaire involved a residential training session in January 2008, an eleven-day stay in Malawi in February, and a debrief meeting in April 2008. In keeping with Trócaire’s 2008 Lenten Campaign the study visit had a climate-change focus. A researcher (the first author) attended the pre- and post-events and accompanied the eleven participating post-primary teachers and two members of Trócaire’s Education Unit during the study visit. The research element aimed to produce a collaborative record of the experiences of participating teachers and inform good practice in future study visits.

The second study visit process involved a residential training session in October 2009, a week long stay in Zimbabwe at the end of October, and a debrief meeting in February 2010. This study visit had a broader focus than the first, involving visits to projects representing a cross-section of Trócaire’s work

with partner organisations. The researcher attended the pre-event and worked with the Education Officer (the second author) to integrate a research element across the Zimbabwean schedule.

This article draws upon findings detailed in a research report on the first study visit. The article includes quantitative baseline/profiling data but, in keeping with the experiential nature of the study visit, emphasises qualitative findings. Final reports from the eleven participants involved in the first study visit together with outputs from the participatory video (PV) employed on the two study visits, photography, observational notes, extracts from reflective journals, and three semi-structured interviews with Trócaire staff, constitute the qualitative elements of the research process.

### **Study visit destinations**

Malawi and Zimbabwe were chosen as study visit venues for a number of reasons. Trócaire has been working in Malawi since the late 1990s and in Zimbabwe since the early 1970s. The choice of Malawi for the first study visit meant that the pilot process encompassed an element of North-South reciprocity, with the teachers first welcoming a number of Malawians from Trocaire's partner organisations to their schools during the 2007 Gender Equality Lenten campaign. A determining factor in deciding on study visit destinations is the willingness of Trócaire's staff and partners on the ground to facilitate and engage with the group and their capacity to deal with the logistical implications of short term study visits.

### **Study visit participants**

In total eighteen post-primary teachers took part in the two study visit processes. Good practice in the organisation of study visits demands that they are part of a multi-dimensional, experiential learning process. The pre-training and debrief events are necessary for the avoidance of an experience which otherwise could engender or reinforce negative stereotypes or a charity-based approach to development. Eleven teachers participated in the first study visit process and seven in the second. The decrease in participant numbers was a direct result of a recommendation from the first research report which found that too high numbers of participants posed additional logistical challenges.

The majority of the eighteen participants are female (n=12; 66.7 per cent). Four are under thirty years old (n=4; 22.2 per cent); eight are between



thirty-one and forty (n=8; 44.4 per cent); three are between forty-one and fifty (n=3; 16.7 per cent) and the remaining three are over fifty-one years old (n=3; 16.7 per cent). They are all experienced teachers, with all except four having taught for more than five years. Ten currently teach religious education as their main subject but other subject areas include, in order of teaching hours, English, CSPE, history, geography, music, French, mathematics, computer studies, leaving certificate applied (LCA), social and environmental studies (ESS), resource learning support and learning for life and work.

Four (22.2 per cent) of the study visit participants are based in schools in Dublin, three (16.7 per cent) are based in Cork, two (18.2 per cent) in Waterford and two (18.2 per cent) in Meath. The remaining participants from the Republic are based in Mayo (n=1; 5.6 per cent) and Sligo (n=1; 5.6 per cent). The five participants from Northern Ireland teach in schools in Armagh (n=2; 11.1 per cent), Tyrone (n=2; 11.1 per cent) and Down (n=1; 5.6 per cent).

Most teachers in the two study visit groups have experience in teaching development issues and all expressed a belief in the value of development/human rights education.

“I have always been very interested in human rights education and social justice, and really believe it is so important to educate our young people in these issues”.

Of the eighteen participants, ten have been involved in Trócaire’s DE programme for more than two years, five since its inception in 2003. The remaining eight participants included five from Northern Ireland, where the programme is less developed. Through involvement in the programme, teachers and their students have addressed a range of development issues, each year focusing on a particular country.

Academic Year	Country	Theme
2003/4	Rwanda	Genocide
2004/5	Ethiopia	Millennium Development Goals
2005/6	Nicaragua	Child labour
2006/7	Malawi	Gender equality
2007/8	Kenya	Climate change
2008/9	various	People displaced as a result of Conflict
2009/10	Rwanda	Global poverty and hunger

## Impact on classroom practice and beyond

Engagement in a well-planned study visit process should provide teachers with opportunities to network and share information, explore topics of common interest, experience ‘immersion in enquiry’, and ‘engage in the kinds of learning that they are expected to practise with their students’ (Boyle, et al., 2004:48). At the pre-study visit training events teachers spoke about their expectations and highlighted the interconnectedness of personal and professional development. One participant talked about the expected impact on their capacity to be a good parent, while another stated that their ‘world has narrowed because [of] concentrating on family’. The teachers also articulated an expectation that the visit would allow valuable time ‘to reflect on their own professional practice’ (Purves, et al., 2005:546).

### *Learning from other practitioners*

Many participants highlighted the ‘nature and dynamic of the group’ as a professional development opportunity integral to the study visit. Most teachers subsequently reported that expectations regarding group dynamic were fulfilled, with membership described as enjoyable, social and educational. Subject diversity was perceived as an enriching factor in terms of group bonding and in broadening the learning from the study visit experience. One participant commented, ‘I enjoyed finding out the names of the various plants and flowers native to Malawi from [another participant] who is a biology teacher’.

Having diversity within the group was seen to bring a variety of perspectives through which participants viewed the study visit experience. The subject mix provided an opportunity for teachers to learn from professionals beyond their own school, about curricular areas outside of their own sphere of expertise. This type of professional development opportunity is one which seldom arises for post-primary educators.

There was a consensus that inclusion of practitioners from both educational jurisdictions on the island of Ireland was beneficial and ‘energising’ for all. A further advantage of an all-island model was the opportunity to compare education systems, north and south of the border, the opportunity to ‘learn from other educational cultures,’ that of the destination country and also the system across the border (Purves, et al., 2005:546). Participants specifically referred to the opportunity to learn about different education systems and educational approaches as a context within which they would re-examine and re-engage with their own professional world in a more confident way. One teacher

felt that the opportunity to share with professionals from other jurisdictions had the effect of deepening knowledge and awareness of, not just the ‘other’, but also their own education system. The emphasis which participants placed on this aspect of their experience highlights the need for short term study visits to facilitate contact with and between peer groups, ensuring, insofar as is possible, compatibility, shared understandings and equality of relationships.

Since reactions and support from family, friends and work colleagues can vary widely the network created by participation in the study visit is very important in the immediate aftermath of the study visit (UNICEF, 1995:47). Continued communication between group members can help to ease the transition process. Ongoing discussion is an opportunity to voice contradictory feelings and discuss impact and reception of new knowledge and experiences in both a personal and professional sense. Participants need to express or share their reflections in the company of those they journeyed with.

Structured post-meetings are a crucial element in the study visit process. Several participants mentioned the importance of the debrief session as a means of ‘keeping the experience alive’. In line with internationally recognised good practice post-visit debriefings should allocate adequate time and space for sharing and reflection (Comhlámh, 2006:3; UNICEF, 1995:47).

### *Emotional impact and behavioural changes*

The post-visit teacher reports from the first study visit included references to a catalogue of unforeseen impacts and changes both emotional and behavioural. Towards the end of their time in Malawi some participants began to realise that ‘implementing ideas engendered by the visit may not be straightforward’ (Purves, et al., 2005:547). It is clear that upon return a number of participants experienced significant shifts in their perception of lifestyles and societal values. They experienced a type of transitional state where they struggled to find a balance between integrating the study visit experience into their own personal/professional lives and integrating back into their usual daily routines. One participant commented, ‘since I returned reflecting has been constant and an effort was made to try to find some resolution to problems which arose – finding answers in one’s head’.

The transition, or period of ‘reverse culture shock’, was at times very emotional for the study visit teachers (Comhlámh, 2006:1). Several participants mentioned feeling increased levels of awareness, guilt, disempowerment, anger and disgust about the excess availability of, and access to, resources in

Ireland. Unnecessary consumerism was singled out as a particularly distasteful characteristic of Irish society: ‘I am more conscious of the waste generated by all of us and how little appreciation our students have of their textbooks, equipment, etc.’; ‘I felt very angry when I came home, realising how badly the world is divided’.

Emotional responses to global poverty and injustice should not paralyse participants. Study visit participants need support as they ‘integrate’ back into their lives and organisers need to consider ways of channelling emotional energy into worthwhile, feasible educational enterprise. Otherwise there is a danger that participants will be caught up in ‘the tidal wave of global desperation’ and become apathetic about what it is that they can achieve in their personal and professional capacities.

Increased knowledge, firsthand experience of the affect of poverty and climate change on vulnerable populations, and the inventive solutions employed to overcome scarcity led a number of participants to radically change certain behaviours upon return:

“[I am] more aware of living in a self-sufficient way, something I have learned from Malawians who make everything they need. I have observed since my return how wasteful we are in our society. ...I have reduced the amount of ‘stuff’ (mainly unnecessary) that I buy. If I don’t need it, I don’t buy it”.

The sense of community in Malawi/Zimbabwe was often commented upon during and after the visits, and this also impacted on participants’ desire to engage more actively in local communities in Ireland:

“Being influenced by the strong sense of community, I have felt the urge to give something back to my own community. So from next week I will be volunteering at the homework club in the Immigrant Centre in [X] every Thursday”.

In the aftermath of the first study visit three teachers articulated a desire to return to Malawi or another developing world country for a more extended stay. One of these teachers immediately initiated contact with a Trócaire (Malawi) staff member and organised a month-long placement in a secondary school the following July. This unanticipated by-product of the study visit programme obviously has implications for Trócaire (Ireland), Trócaire’s overseas

staff, partner organisations and schools. There needs to be an appropriate strategy in place to ensure that placements of this nature are beneficial to all involved. Organisations involved in short-term study visits need to discuss whether placements are something which they wish to accommodate, taking security arrangements, logistics and additional workload into consideration. A clear message regarding volunteer placements can then be communicated to participating teachers considering this course of action.

### *Understanding of development education*

Most study visit participants had some development education experience before the visit. However, as one participant pointed out, teaching about complex issues like development, even over an extended period of time, does not mean that you ‘know enough about them’. The ever changing nature of development education as a field of study means that even the most experienced development educators can have certain ‘knowledge-gaps’ when it comes to development issues. Upon return most noted a furthering of knowledge combined with an increased sense of the complexities and scope of the challenges involved in overseas development.

Data from the first study visit provides an example of participants’ ‘knowledge gap’. The baseline survey indicated that teachers were not automatically making the connection between climate change and development. Participants’ understanding of climate change was dominated by a domestic focus, a lack of a sense of immediacy and urgency, and a focus on the environmental rather than societal, economic or cultural impacts of climate change. For some participants the visit was their first meaningful introduction to the topic of climate change:

“When Trócaire told me that the [DE Programme] this year was focusing on climate change, I was disappointed as I really wasn’t very knowledgeable about this topic. I had heard about it many times on the news but didn’t pay much attention...now it’s not just a concept but a real issue for millions of people...”

Post-visit teachers commented on a shift in understanding about climate change to encompass a more global focus and increased emphasis on the concept of interdependence. Understanding of climate change also merged with a social justice approach:

“As a result of climate change there are many knock-on effects. For example, drought means family members must walk further still in search of water. This can mean children fetching water instead of attending school, or can reduce the amount of time spent on farming”.

The most common alteration in perception was an increased sense of urgency. Before the visit, although aware of some of the implications of climate change, they had little direct experience of its impact: ‘In Ireland the term is used solely in connection with the weather to complain about a bad summer or an abnormally mild winter. In Malawi it’s about life and death’. The testimony of Malawians about changing weather patterns and the impact that these changes have wrought on their lives brought the issue of climate change to life for the teachers.

In their baseline questionnaires, most (n=16; 88.9 per cent) participants indicated that they expected the study visit to inform their teaching of development issues. Teachers saw the study visit as a ‘natural continuation of what I am doing in class’ and an opportunity to get firsthand experience to ‘challenge mainstream media portrayal of developing countries’, a chance to ‘make my teaching meaningful’. When discussing the aims of development education, the most commonly used word by participants was ‘awareness’: awareness of concepts like social justice, human rights and citizenship; awareness of inequalities; awareness of the interdependent nature of the world and how individual actions can contribute to positive/negative change locally and internationally. This emphasis is perhaps not surprising given involvement with the DE programme, which emphasises student awareness and ability to raise awareness in others through campaigning.

The teachers became increasingly convinced that DE should be a compulsory part of the post-primary curriculum because of the perceived interest levels of, and benefits for, young people and for society generally. The role of DE was seen as particularly important in the current climate of materialism characterised by media reportage on developing countries that emphasised a charity-approach and fund-raising as development solutions: ‘Irish teenagers are much too concerned with mobile phones and hair straighteners and MP3 players and it is a marvellous idea to take them outside their comfort zone once in a while’; ‘I think development education is crucial in Ireland as a way of moving us away from a sense of pity, towards a sense of what can we do to challenge systems that keep people in poverty’.

DE is important not just as a means of sharing the problems of the world but also as a way of celebrating ‘success stories’, ‘what has been achieved to date and what can be achieved when we get involved’. The emphasis on awareness-raising remains evident but, as a result of their experiences, teachers provided more concrete, action-orientated examples of how the aims of development education could be achieved.

### *Classroom practice*

When discussing barriers to the integration of the study visit experience into classroom practice, time was the most commonly cited constraint: ‘once back it is straight back to all the things that have piled up on us while we were away’.

The first study visit occurred in February which meant that teachers arrived back to school at a very busy period. This posed a constraint in terms of what was realistic for them to achieve in that school year and was particularly an issue for those with exam classes. As a result of a subsequent research recommendation the second study visit occurred in October, mitigating some of the timing challenges which arose for the 2008 participants.

The study visits included visits to schools, disaster risk management/livelihoods security projects, feeding programmes, HIV/AIDS programmes, meetings with civil society groups, etc. Teachers therefore experienced a wide range of development terminology in action. Several respondents talked about the subsequent incorporation of ‘appropriate terms into my teaching’, something that they had not previously been positioned to do.

Both study visits involved in-depth discussion about the ethics of collecting visual evidence. All possible care was taken to reduce the risk of exposing local communities to any form of voyeurism. On returning from their visits teachers emphasised the power of images in portraying development issues to students:

“...the greatest challenge here was to communicate my experience in a way which reached my students. In the end it turned out to be far easier than I expected as the pictures, video and telling the story of our visit spoke for themselves”.

The emphasis which teachers placed on visual stimuli as a means of teaching about DE issues meant that the second study visit participants were specifically

trained and involved in the production of a video diary of their experiences which had immediate applicability in their classroom teaching.

After the study visits teachers recommenced work with their DE programme students. In 2008-2009 the focus was on climate change and in 2009-2010 on global poverty and hunger. Several participants specifically mentioned the benefit of the study visit experience for these young people:

“Before I went on the study visit they were not really working that well on the project, they seemed a bit apathetic. When I came back and shared my experience with them, the project just took off. They felt compelled to work at the project, after what they had heard from me”.

The general consensus was that an anecdotal approach to describing development led to richer learning outcomes for students:

“I know that being able to work without a textbook and to describe projects and communities that I visited has made my inputs more interesting. It’s concrete, and I feel that the students appreciate this”.

This growth in confidence to discuss development issues should not be underestimated. This is possibly the most significant professional development emanating from participation:

“...I can now teach from first hand experience and my word carries the authority of a lived experience. This has proved to be invaluable. It is not just somewhere out there, but the country that [X] was in and brought us back photographs and stories”.

Participants commented on the high levels of student engagement and curiosity about the study visit and the reality of life for people in Malawi/Zimbabwe. In one school students raised the topic in classes other than those taught by the participant:

“...colleagues have commented that students have brought up the visit in a variety of contexts in class discussions, reflecting the impact on their learning and understanding of development issues”.

## Conclusion



A recent European non-governmental organisation (NGO) survey on the status of DE in the formal education sector identified limited availability and insufficient levels and quality of teacher education (initial teacher education (ITE) and continuing professional development (CPD)) as the main challenge in member countries (DEF & DEEEP, 2009:23). In the Irish context the current fraught economic climate has meant a restructuring of the Second Level Support Service (SLSS) and a contraction of the professional development opportunities available to practising post-primary teachers. Although a decrease in Department of Education and Science CPD provision is obviously not a welcome development it may involve interesting opportunities for established NGOs, like Trócaire, which has been present within the post-primary system for over three decades. NGOs contributing to the provision of CPD for teachers, through a range of activities, including study visits, may find that their services are increasingly in demand. However, NGOs will need to lobby at a policy level to ensure enhanced recognition of their education remit as providers offering professional support and guidance, training for teachers and other education practitioners, and well researched curriculum and classroom resources. One of the most effective tools in lobbying policy makers will be evidence based research about the impact of this type of work.

An important recommendation from the 2008 and 2009 study visits organised by Trócaire is that research into study visits should be longitudinal. While impacts on classroom practice and beyond were evidenced in the months following the study visits it is unknown whether behaviour changes and altered professional practice will be sustained over time. As a result of this recommendation schools recruited to the DE programme in the 2009-2010 academic year are part of a four year longitudinal study which will track participating teachers/students from recruitment to 'graduated' status, including an investigation of the long term impact of the study visits. Findings from this process will inform the wider debate about effective measurement of development education and will also help to ensure that Trócaire continues to provide quality professional development opportunities for post-primary development educators.

## References

Boyle, B, White, D & Boyle, T (2004), 'A longitudinal study of teacher change: What makes professional development effective?' in *Curriculum Journal*, Vol. 15, pp. 45-68.

Comhlámh (2005) 'Code of Good Practice for Sending Organisations': <http://www.volunteeringoptions.ie>.

Comhlámh (2006) *The Coming Home Book*, Comhlámh, Dublin.

Cusack, M (2005) 'Survey of Trócaire's DE Programme teachers', unpublished internal document.

Cusack, M (ed.) (2009) 'Malawian Memories: Diary of a Study Visit', Trócaire/CDVEC Curriculum Development Unit, Dublin.

Development Education Forum (DEF) & Development Education Exchange in Europe Project (DEEEP) (2009) 'Development Education and the School Curriculum in the European Union: A report on the status and impact of development education in the formal education sector and school curriculum in member states of the European Union', DEEEP, Brussels.

Development and Intercultural Education Network (DICE) (2009) *Volunteering Charter: A charter for volunteer pre-service and practising teachers who wish to work in an educational context in countries of the Global South*, DICE, Dublin.

Gleeson, J, King, P, O'Driscoll, S & Tormey, R (2007) *Development Education in Irish Post-Primary Schools: Knowledge, Attitudes and Activism - Research Report*, funded by Irish Aid, Limerick.

Irish Development Education Association (IDEA) (2007) 'Linking and Immersion Schemes with the Global South: Developing Good Practice', IDEA conference report, IDEA, Dublin.

Martin, F (2008) 'Mutual learning: The impact of a study visit course on UK teacher's knowledge and understanding of global partnerships' in *Critical Literacy: Theories and Practices*, Vol. 2, 1, pp. 60-75.

O'Dwyer, F (2009) 'A Road Less Travelled: The impact of short-term volunteering in developing countries on Irish teachers in a social, emotional and professional capacity', paper presented at the annual DICE conference, February 2009, Dublin.

O'Keefe, C (2006) *Linking between Ireland and the South: Good Practice Guidelines for North/South Linking*, Irish Aid, Dublin.

Purves, R, Jackson, A & Shaughnessy, J (2005) 'A longitudinal study of teachers' professional development through an international exchange' in *Journal of Inservice Education*, Vol. 31, . 3.

Smith, J (2007) 'Development Education in Action: An examination of Trócaire's Development Education Senior Cycle Programme in the context of the formal education

sector', paper presented at Development's Futures Irish Aid Conference, National University of Ireland Galway, 24-25 November, Galway.

Trócaire (2009) 'Education Unit Strategy Plan 2009-2011', unpublished internal document.

UNICEF (1995) *Journeys into global understanding: Organizing a group visit to study development*, UNICEF, New York.

Willard-Holt, C (2001) 'The impact of short-term international experience for preservice teachers' in *Teaching and Teacher Education*, Vol. 17, 4, pp. 505-517.

**Mella Cusack** is Manager of the Citizenship Studies Project, a joint Trócaire/CDVEC Curriculum Development Unit initiative, which aims to inform and support the development of post-primary Citizenship Education. Prior to holding this position Mella spent two years working as Research Officer on the Education for Reconciliation Project and six years as a researcher in the field of early childhood/primary education with the University of Western Sydney (Australia). Mella lectures in initial teacher education and adult education programmes (Australian Catholic University, Trinity College Dublin, UCD and NCAD) and in continuing professional development programmes for teachers (through the Second Level Support Service).

**Aoife Rush** is a Trócaire Education Officer with responsibility for the co-ordination of the organisation's post-primary education programme Pamoja Kwa Haki (Together for Rights), a Human Rights/Development Education project for senior cycle students. This position involves the development of post-primary curriculum resources, the delivery of workshops on development issues and the organisation of overseas study visits for participating teachers. Previously, Aoife worked as a post-primary teacher where she taught business, French, maths and Civic, Social and Political Education (CSPE) for three years.

# SITUATED LEARNING METHODOLOGIES FOR ACTIVISM IN DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION AND EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

In this article, **Nancy L. Serrano** and **Dr. Roland Tormey** explore how to embed development education and education for sustainable development within the post-primary curriculum in Ireland using three situated cognition methodologies: cognitive apprenticeship; knowledge building; and problem-based learning.

## Introduction

Development education (DE) and education for sustainable development (ESD) have both made progress over the last number of years integrating into the Irish post-primary curriculum, as can be seen from the work of Gleeson, et al. (2007). Gleeson's research highlighted the importance of development education in the life of a number of schools, the frequency with which teachers address development issues in their teaching and the opportunities that exist to integrate DE across the curriculum. At the same time, the research also highlights the difficulty in incorporating an action-orientation into the existing curriculum, particularly outside of civic, social and political education (CSPE). As Osler notes, development education '... encourages the linking of ideas with action for change and a radical approach to the issues we all face working for a new international, social and economic order' (1994). As such, a focus on action and on developing an action-orientation should be an essential element of development education in schools.

This article explores why and how situated cognition can be used effectively to integrate ESD and DE into post-primary education to develop an activism-orientation in students. It begins by looking at the factors that contribute to activism/behaviour change in sustainable development issues and identifies the importance of self-determination theory (SDT) and internalisation in explaining sustainable changes in behaviour. Secondly, the article outlines the ways in which DE, ESD and situated cognition are aligned, with reference to the importance of SDT within each. The third section describes and analyses three situated cognition methodologies with applied examples from the RCE-Ireland flagship project on activism and ESD. Finally, the article outlines the main advantages of situated cognition used with DE and ESD, with a call for further research to be carried out in order to integrate them fully into the Irish education system.

## Activism towards sustainable development

Any cursory analysis of government policy on sustainable development will demonstrate the belief that there are two main methods to encourage behavioural change in society: making laws and providing information. However, mainstream psychological evidence indicates that sanctioning systems (e.g. making laws and imposing taxes) are effective in the short-term, but are unlikely to create sufficient behavioural change in people towards sustainability (Osbaldiston & Sheldon, 2002). Instead, they can produce the opposite effect of ‘punishment avoidance’ behaviours (e.g. introduction of a bin charge can lead to roadside dumping) (Lindenberg & Siegwart, 2007) and result in people thinking they have a ‘right’ to pollute, having paid a tax/charge (Kopelman, et al., 2002). Providing information on sustainable development issues will also not cause sufficient change in people’s actions, because this information may clash with previously held lifestyle beliefs and practices (Gladwin, et al., 1997). Another factor could be an uneven distribution of information between those media messages promoting universal over-consumption, and the smaller quantities of media and information campaigns promoting sustainability.

To better understand how to bring about lasting behavioural change towards more sustainable lifestyles, we must look at the factors that influence how people make moral choices. Despite the traditional view of human motivation for taking action, dominated by ‘rational economic choice’ (Miller, 1999), there is evidence that situational factors, such as the existence of supports and incentives to make sustainable development choices (e.g. availability of Fairtrade products in stores), social contexts and people’s own social value orientations (SVO) (competitive, co-operative or individualistic orientations), have substantial influence on how people respond to social dilemmas (Osbaldiston & Sheldon, 2002; Komorita & Parks, 1995).

So what tools, other than legislation, taxation and information, can we employ to create lasting behavioural change? Hines, Hungerford and Tomera (1986) have categorised non-coercive techniques for producing environmental behaviours (and this model is applicable, by extension, to pro-development decisions also). Their model, like that of Osbaldiston and Sheldon above, points to three variables by which people are influenced: situational factors; knowledge and ability factors (e.g. knowing about energy saving and how to do it); and intrapersonal factors (e.g. attitudes, values and acceptance of responsibility). The two former factors tend to emerge from institutional

initiatives (e.g. availability of public transport, information/education campaigns). Although the increase of social and institutional supports is a significant step, these alone cannot secure rapid enough change towards more sustainable behaviour. The intrapersonal factor must also be dealt with to facilitate changes in attitudes and values for lasting behavioural change.

How can we therefore assist changes in attitudes and values for sustainable behaviour? Deci and Ryan (1987; 2000) investigated techniques where one person can help to motivate another to not only take on, but also internalise, new behaviours. From these studies they developed their self-determination theory (SDT) which theorises that motivation exists along a continuous range starting from a sense of being controlled by others or a situation (external motivation), to a sense of being autonomous or self-determining (internal motivation). They proposed three psychological needs that motivate a person to initiate behaviour and specify needs that are necessary for the psychological health and well being of an individual. The three main needs are for competence, autonomy and relatedness:

- Need for competence: the need to experience oneself as capable and competent in controlling the environment and being able to predict outcomes;
- Need for autonomy (or self-determination): the need to participate in determining one's own behaviour. The need to experience one's actions as a result of autonomous choice without external interference; and
- Need for relatedness: the need to care for and be related to others; to experience authentic relatedness from others and to experience satisfaction in participation and involvement with the social world.

Hence, if one can satisfy these needs the probability of creating lasting behavioural change is greatly increased.

In summary, recognising the possibilities and limits of punitive measures and information campaigns highlights the need for a deeper process of engagement with people's intrapersonal factors, towards internalisation of sustainable development values and beliefs as SDT indicates. Deci and Ryan argue that autonomy-supportive teaching in education is highly effective in increasing internal motivation in students (2002:183-203). This could be

achieved by using situated cognition and SDT within education for sustainable development.

### **Situated cognition and self-determination theory**

“Tell me, and I will forget.  
Show me, and I may remember.  
Involve me, and I will understand” (Confucius, 450 B.C).

Relatively recent educational research is bringing to light what has been practiced by many throughout recorded history about how people learn best. The quote above, attributed to Confucius, captures the essence of situated cognition, whereby hands-on experience is crucial for deep learning. ‘Activities, tasks, functions and understanding do not exist in isolation; they are part of broader systems of relations in which they have meaning’ (Lave & Wenger, 1991:53). Consequently, people require hands-on learning with multiple senses to increase their metacognitive skills which facilitate understanding by the learning of how their own learning and thinking is taking place.

Developments in educational psychology over the past two decades in the areas of situated cognition (Lave & Wenger, 1991; Bredo, 1994) have shown that for most people, learning is not readily turned into abstract rules or practices that can easily be transferred from one context to another. This means that learning is primarily situated in a context, and people engage in activities they have learned in relation to specific contexts, and not in abstract terms. At the same time, and given that transferability of what has been learned to new contexts is often a key learning goal, the development of metacognitive capacities is crucial given the role metacognition plays in enabling transfer ([US] National Research Council, 2000).

Situated cognition research has looked at how people learn in day-to-day life, such as in apprenticeship situations (Lave & Wenger, 1991). This research also highlighted that learning in the wider world is a social process, often involving engagement in a community of learners, dealing with real-life tasks, in which learners collaboratively solve problems of increasing complexity.

Applying the three main needs identified previously by SDT, we can better explain how situated cognition can increase the likelihood of lasting behavioural change. The need for competence is addressed as learners are taught to critically think in real-world situations. The need for autonomy fits

within the learner's active participation, and the need for relatedness corresponds to group work, and the community of learners emphasised in situated cognition. These links will become more evident when the three methodologies are discussed later.

## **Learning about community and learning in communities**

What do development education/education for sustainable development and situated cognition have in common? First, let's consider the characteristics of DE/ ESD:

- They focus on the development of critical thinking, and on systemic thinking (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe, 2005; Hogan & Tormey, 2008);
- They contain an ethical dimension (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe, 2005; Osbaldiston & Sheldon, 2002);
- They are contextual, with a focus on the 'experience of life and work beyond the classroom' (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe, 2005:paragraph 24);
- They have a strong focus on the use of participatory and learner-centred active learning methodologies (Freire, 1971; United Nations Economic Commission for Europe, 2005; Hogan and Tormey, 2008).

The core idea in situated cognition is that learning and knowledge acquisition best occurs in context and is significantly enhanced through social interaction. DE and ESD also look to equip learners with the relevant social skills needed to work together (in 'communities of practice') towards creating a more socially and environmentally equitable world (Osler, 1994). DE and ESD emphasise teaching skills such as team work, critical thinking, and problem-solving as well as imparting values such as respect, empathy, responsibility, and solidarity for oneself and others, (Irish Aid, 1999). The situated cognition concept that knowledge is not owned by one individual but belongs to a group strongly links with these DE and ESD values.

So what can situated cognition bring to DE and ESD? DE and ESD subscribe to the motto of 'the medium is the message' thereby engaging participants in educational activities that reflect the skills, behaviours and values being taught. (e.g. role-playing, case-studies, interactive games, etc). However



stimulating and engaging for the learners, these activities sometimes lack practical tasks associated with situated cognition which can help to tie them into the action-dimension of DE and ESD. Consequently, situated cognition can enhance DE and ESD skills to organise in groups and take action together, towards long-term behavioural change.

### Three situated cognition methodologies

#### *Cognitive apprenticeship: Making thinking visible*

Brown, et al. developed cognitive apprenticeship as a teaching methodology to facilitate situated cognition in the classroom environment. Cognitive apprenticeship strives to make the thinking of a teacher/expert learner visible to other learners to facilitate similar learning, even when tasks are not physically visible, such as furniture making. Expert learners (i.e. teachers or more advanced peers) speak aloud strategies they use to tackle a particular task (Brown, et al., 1989).

Cognitive apprenticeship also attempts to situate abstract tasks of the school curriculum in contexts that make sense to students so it can help them to understand the reasons for the learning taking place, and motivate them by seeing the overall model of the 'finished product' of their learning (Collins, et al., 1991).

Furthermore, cognitive apprenticeship incorporates the need for skills transfer in the school environment. The idea is 'to present a range of tasks, varying from systematic to diverse, and to encourage students to reflect on and articulate the elements that are common across tasks' (Collins, et al., 1991). In this way, students can learn to generalise skills, and to transfer them independently where appropriate.

An example of a cognitive apprenticeship strategy is reciprocal teaching developed by Palinscar and Brown, (1984). Their method centres on modelling, coaching and fading tasks being taught. Reciprocity is about the teacher/expert student and students alternating in the role of the 'expert'. Reciprocal teaching enables the more expert students to develop a greater metacognitive understanding of their own expertise and so acquire deeper learning.

Cognitive apprenticeship can also be seen as an overarching learning methodology which can be included within other situated learning methodologies.

### ***Knowledge building***

Knowledge building theory was created and developed by Carl Bereiter and Marlene Scardamalia. They make a distinction between learning and knowledge building (KB). They see learning as an internal, (almost) unobservable process that results in changes of beliefs, attitudes, or skills. In contrast, KB is seen as creating or transforming public knowledge through means that can increase community achievements accomplished together, these being greater than the sum of individual contributions. 'People are not honoured for what is in their minds but for the contributions they make to the organisations' or the community's knowledge' (Scardamalia & Bereiter, 2006).

KB theory sees students not as learners but as 'members of a knowledge building community' (Scardamalia & Bereiter, 2006). It encourages students to build extensive webs of understanding alone or in collaborative groups (Bereiter & Scardamalia, 2003). 'It allows learners to see knowledge advancement as a community rather than individual achievement, as idea improvement instead of progress towards true belief, and discourse as collaborative problem solving rather than argumentation' (Scardamalia & Bereiter, 2006). A practical example of this in the real world could be open source software, and the idea of copyleft (sharing information for non-profit) rather than copyright or patenting of information, thereby restricting people's access to it for financial gain.

By using mind maps, group diaries (written or audio) or other forms of documenting the learning process, a student or group has a physical tool which allows them to reflect on their learning process and therefore better understand how knowledge is constructed.

As with cognitive apprenticeship, the characteristics and principles of KB, DE and ESD, such as co-operation and critical thinking, also correlate strongly. This makes it a very appropriate learning methodology, as it reinforces similar DE/ESD values. KB can create a platform for learners to engage as equals and as part of a wider group striving towards knowledge creation for sustainable development.

### ***Problem-based learning***

Problem-based learning (PBL) is a methodology which involves using complex real-life problems and situations as a basis for presenting a problem/task to learners, thereby allowing learners to acquire particular skills and knowledge. It encourages the growth of student responsibility, initiative, decision-making and

intentional learning. It promotes collaboration among students and teachers. It utilises dynamic, interdisciplinary, generative learning activities that promote higher-order thinking processes to help students develop rich and complex knowledge structures; and assess student progress in content and learning-to-learn within authentic contexts (Grabinger, et al., 1997). PBL has three basic characteristics: problem-solving in ‘real-world’ contexts; self-directed learning; and group work.

PBL is usually organised in small groups of learners, accompanied by a facilitator. A series of problems are provided to the learners by the facilitator, with more facilitator guidance at the beginning through introductory problems, and later phased out as learner expertise increases. In PBL, ‘solving the problem is part of the process, but the focus is on problem management, not on a clear and bounded solution’. Students work out their own learning requirements, and even though the problem scenarios may be chosen by the teacher/facilitator, the students define how and what they learn (Savi-Baden, 2003).

PBL is already used to a certain extent in DE and ESD through the use of case studies and project-based work. However, a better structuring of PBL projects to be more student-centred and reflective on the learning process to enhance transferability of the skills acquired would ensure a more in-depth understanding of sustainable development issues.

To summarise the three methodologies discussed, their common features include co-operative group-work, metacognitive skills development, student-led learning and the teacher in a facilitator role. Cognitive apprenticeship is most useful when teaching a new skill or concept to learners. Knowledge building helps to visualise the learning process for the learners, and enhances their perceptions of knowledge as communal: managed, advanced and owned by their community of learners, who in turn are part of wider communities. Lastly problem-based learning can be used as the main framework into which cognitive apprenticeship and KB can be embedded and utilised together to best deliver DE and ESD in the classroom.

### **Examples of situated cognition methodologies utilised in DE and ESD**

In an action research project conducted by RCE-Ireland, post-primary teachers were asked to use the three situated learning methodologies in their classrooms over a 10-week period. The research specifically looked at increasing activism

among post-primary students by embedding DE and ESD into the curriculum through key skills and situated cognition (NCCA, 2008). The project was conducted with eight teachers in the Limerick region. The following are two practical examples of how the teachers applied the situated learning methodologies with DE and ESD.

A 5th year Leaving Certificate Applied (LCA) Spanish teacher took a problem-based learning approach. She gave the class examples of information on the social, environmental and economic impacts of cobalt mining in the Congo and its links to the international mobile phone industry. This was placed on posters around the classroom. Dividing the class into groups, she gave them particular question sheets for each group to complete together from the posters, to gain an understanding of the topic. The class then discussed the issue together. By looking at and debating the real-life situation of mining in the Congo with its advantages and disadvantages locally and abroad from an environmental, social and economic perspective, the students were able to grasp some of the complex real-life dilemmas from which they were asked to seek solutions in which they could partake.

The task of the groups was then to decide on an activism project they could carry out at school to tackle the impact of the cobalt industry in the Congo. The groups discussed, planned and organised themselves with support from their teacher. Some groups decided to obtain mobile phone recycle bins for their school, while others organised a publicity campaign to be used in the school. Another feature of these projects was the use of mind maps (knowledge building) on a wall of the classroom, whereby weekly updates of information gathered was compiled by the groups. This allowed a visual record of the class learning and project progression. Each group gave a final presentation of their part of the action project to the class.

Another teacher carried out some DE and ESD activities with her class (a wealth distribution activity and an ecological footprint activity) to introduce the concepts and initiate discussion on DE/ESD and its link with her subject, physics. She then asked each student to write a short essay on how physics can affect the environment and people. She grouped the class under common essay themes and told the groups to further research their topics with the final purpose of carrying out an activism project and co-presenting it at the end to the class. This was mostly a PBL approach. A mind map was created on the class wall which each group added to regularly. Through active discussions, each group debated and planned their project and were allocated tasks with guidance

and support from their teacher. These were important KB activities. Students carried out projects on subjects including radiation, recycling and renewable energy. Some carried out action projects such as building a model wind turbine, or contacting charities for more information about their topics (radiation and the weapons industry, global warming and developing countries, etc.).

These two examples clearly illustrate the possibility of using situated cognition methodologies effectively and in tandem, to carry out ESD and DE activities in the classroom.

### **Qualitative data review: Teacher and student interviews**

At the end of the ten-week period, interviews were carried out with both teachers and students. The interview format was semi-structured and recorded. Teachers were interviewed individually, while students were interviewed in focus groups of approximately four-five students. The student groups were comprised of both volunteers and students chosen by their teachers. From the interview transcripts certain common factors emerged among teachers and students, which were then categorised under four main headings: structural; operational; learning experience; and action-orientation of participants. Below each factor is discussed in greater depth, with reference to sample quotations from the interview transcripts.

#### ***Structural factors***

Most teachers and students identified various structural factors that affected their interaction with the action research project, mostly focused on the limited time of the project. The delivery time of the project was often identified as being too short, as well as quite sporadic for many teachers and students. Transition year teachers (TYs) especially found that work experience and other extra-curricular activities in which TYs engage in limited their contact hours and made for discontinuous teaching periods. This made it harder to re-engage the students in the DE/ESD topics being covered and their activism projects when sometimes class had not convened for weeks at a time.

Some teachers found that preparation time for classes was lacking given that this was a substantially new departure for many teachers. Some teachers were familiar with sustainable development themes, but not with interactive situated learning methodologies, and vice versa. Even though sample teaching materials were provided for all the teachers, some identified the need for more support materials; however a few enjoyed the freedom of being able to

create their own materials during the course of the project and fine-tune them to the needs of their particular class, subject and personal interests with sustainable development.

Curriculum and exam pressures were identified by all as limiting factors, which should be considered when introducing any new element into a classroom as the curriculum and exams do not value and examine these new methodologies. These are structural factors commonly recognised as restrictive when introducing new teaching styles into the post-primary curriculum. In the Report on The National Education Convention (1994), it was recognised that examination formats ‘are neglecting areas and approaches...including active learning and student activity’. In the teacher interviews, a TY history teacher stated the following:

“The exams do act as barriers. You have to be focused in on that. At the end of the day, schools and parents want results”.

One last important structural factor identified was the possible impression that the different class format could have on other teachers if observed in passing without being fully aware of the situated learning techniques. This teacher felt that because group work naturally means a higher level of verbal interaction between students during class time, a colleague may consider this extra noise level an indication of the teacher’s inability to control her class. However, despite this drawback, the teacher was very interested in trying situated learning approaches with her students the following year.

In general we can say that the structural factors identified above were predictable as they are regularly identified impediments in the mainstream education system when attempting to introduce changes. An over-loaded curriculum and assessment methods were identified by the NCCA as impediments to introducing key skills changes into the post-primary cycle (National Council for Curriculum and Assessment, 2003).

### *Operational factors*

The second main group of factors identified in the interviews were operational in nature. Students noted some difficulty in researching certain data for their project, citing a lack of relevant data available online for Ireland on certain topics, such as climate change statistics. The internet was the main source of information for most students, yet there was little criteria observed in terms of

the validity of information sources. Research skills were therefore somewhat lacking, and students could have benefited from more guidance in this.

Another unforeseen weak area for students was related to presentation skills. Although it was not necessary for student groups delivering activism projects to present their completed work, most teachers opted for this approach. However, teachers were quite surprised to find that even the older classes (5th and 6th years) lacked in confidence and basic presentation skills to accomplish this task. Some teachers presumed that seemingly expressive outspoken students were confident enough to give presentations, but found their students very much worried about having to present to their peers. A 5th year LCA Spanish teacher said the following:

“They got very nervous at the end at presenting their own topics...it was a massive panic attack...We presumed they were more advanced than they were and they need more structure with this. That was our fault, not theirs”.

Finally, skills for working effectively in groups were also identified by both students and teachers as lacking. Although teachers did support the group work as needed, some basic skills and guidelines could probably have been imparted to anticipate certain situations and be aware of possible group dynamics, particularly as very few students had previously participated in any kind of group work at school. All of the teachers recognised the need for more time than usually allotted for the delivery of group work.

### *Learning experience*

The learning experience of the students as noted by both themselves and their teachers was very positive, despite the restricting factors mentioned above. In general, there was an increased interest and motivation among students towards sustainability issues, which included some students who normally do not engage much in class discussion.

“The only thing that surprised me was that some people who usually do nothing, in the groups excelled more than usual. It was great. Obviously it’s the type of learning they like to do...I think it’s a mix of both the topics and the group work” (5th year LCA Spanish teacher).

It seems that the students’ response to group work was significant and productive. Many students expressed their preference for group work over

working individually, due to added active discussion on topics of interest. One 1st year CSPE student stated that the class was ‘more relaxed, easier...You get into groups and talk with your friends. Your teacher actually talks to you about the world and stuff and what’s going on’.

This naturally leads us into the next factor: interactive situated learning methodologies. Most students enjoyed the experience of working in groups, engaging more with situated interactive activities and recognising their practical relevance and value while integrating sustainable development topics with group work, into the subject area. For example, a 5th Year LCA Maths student said ‘We got a break from doing maths, but it was maths as well. We weren’t writing down stuff. It was active like. We got to do it with poker chips and using cards’.

Lastly, the response to democratic education was favourable and added to their level of interest in their projects. Some teachers let the students pick their project topics, and pick their own groups. Others drew names from a hat, or formed groups depending on topic interests among students. A 5th LCA Spanish teacher stated the following: “They love being active. Being involved in the decision-making process was good”.

### ***Action-orientation***

In terms of seeing a change of motivation in the participants towards increased activism, the qualitative data showed a reasonably positive response from many students who openly identified with their particular project themes and how they were thinking more about it, and taking steps towards more sustainable living. The knock-on effects of influencing their parents with their new-found knowledge were also noted. Two students offered the following statements in the group interviews:

“Yeah...Fairtrade products... If I saw a bar I’d probably buy it. My mother buys the coffee or the tea. She didn’t buy it before” (1st year CSPE student).

“We didn’t know what the phone bins were about till the man came in to talk to us and since then there’s loads of phones in the bins” (5th year LCA mathematics student).

## **Conclusions**



This paper has outlined how situated cognition can enhance the experience of DE and ESD by creating deeper learning, engaging participants in more real-world action tasks, making certain complex concepts more accessible through cognitive apprenticeship techniques and by expanding DE and ESD values further into the teaching methods themselves.

From the qualitative data obtained we can see some important insights into particular factors which enhanced and impeded students and teachers during the intervention. Obviously, we must consider that the qualitative focus groups are not the majority of the students, though it did include all teachers. However, due to common issues arising from different student focus groups, we can conclude there is reasonable validity in the factors identified. The operational factors identified are probably the easiest to overcome, were this intervention to run again. The structural factors however, require changes in the post-primary school structures which are beyond the scope of this intervention. The positive learning experiences and positive change in action-orientation among students points toward the important benefits that integrating such DE/ESD topics and methodologies would have at post-primary level.

In conclusion, the case for using situated cognition to integrate DE/ESD into mainstream education is strong for both educational and personal development benefits of the learners, but also from evidence-based research in self-determination theory which indicates high probabilities of creating long-term behavioural changes in learners. There is an opportunity to further develop this proposal with more thorough action research, with a long-term view of integrating these methodologies into the mainstream curriculum.

## References

- Bereiter, C & Scardamalia, M (2003) 'Powerful learning environments: Unravelling basic components and dimensions ' in Corte, ED, Verschaffel, L, Entwistle, N & Merriënboer, JV, (eds.) Learning to work creatively with knowledge, Elsevier Science, Oxford, pp. 73-78.
- Bredo, E (1994) 'Reconstructing educational psychology: Situated cognition and Deweyan pragmatism' in Educational Psychologist, Vol. 29, 1, pp. 23-36.
- Brown, JS, Collins, A & Duguid, P (1989) 'Situated Cognition and the Culture of Learning' in Educational Researcher, Vol. 18, 1, pp. 32-42.

Collins, A, Brown, JS & Holum, A (1991) 'Cognitive Apprenticeship: Making thinking visible' in *American Educator*, Vol. 6, 11, pp. 38-46.

Deci, EL & Ryan, RM (1987) 'The support of autonomy and the control of behaviour' in *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, Vol. 53, pp. 1024-1037.

Deci, EL & Ryan, RM (2000) 'The "What" and "Why" of Goal Pursuits: Human Needs and the Self-Determination of Behavior' in *Psychological Inquiry*, Vol. 1, 4, pp. 227-268.

Deci, EL & Ryan, RM (2002) *Handbook of self-determination research*, University of Rochester Press, Rochester.

Freire, P (1971) *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, Penguin, Harmondsworth.

Gladwin, TN, Newburry, WE & Reiskin, ED (1997) 'Why is the northern elite mind biased against community, the environment, and a sustainable future?' in Bazerman, MH, Messick, DM, Tenbrunsel, AE, & Wade-Benzoni, KA (eds.) *Environment, Ethics, and Behaviour: The Psychology of Environmental Valuation and Degradation*, The New Lexington Press, San Francisco, pp. 234-274.

Grabinger, S, Dunlap, JC & Duffield, JA (1997) 'Rich environments for active learning in action: Problem-based learning' in *ALTJ*, Vol. 5, 2, pp. 5-17.

Hines, JM, Hungerford, HR & Tomera, AN (1986) 'Analysis and synthesis of research on responsible environmental behaviour: A meta-analysis' in *Journal of Environmental Education*, Vol. 18, pp. 1-8.

Hogan, D & Tormey, R (2008) 'A perspective on the relationship between development education and education for sustainable development' in *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*, Vol. 6, pp. 5-17.

Irish Aid (1999) *Irish Aid and Development Education: describing...understanding...challenging*, Irish Aid, Dublin.

Komorita, SS & Parks, CD (1995) 'Interpersonal relations: Mixed Motive Interaction' in *Annual Review of Psychology*, Vol. 46, pp. 183 - 207.

Kopelman, S, Weber, JM & Messick, DM (2002) 'Factors influencing cooperation in commons dilemmas: A review of experimental psychological research' in Ostrom, E, Dietz, T, Dolsak, N, Stern, PC, Stonich, S & Weber, EU (eds.) *The drama of the commons*, National Academies Press, Washington, DC, pp. 113-156.

Lave, J & Wenger, E (1991) *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Lindenberg, S & Siegwart, L (2007) 'Normative, Gain and Hedonic Goal Frames Guiding Environmental Behavior' in *Journal of Social Issues*, Vol. 63, 1, pp. 117-137.

Miller, TD (1999) 'The norm of self interest' in *American Psychologist*, Vol. 54, pp. 1053 - 1060.

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) (2003) *Developing Senior Cycle Education - Report on the consultative process*, NCCA, Dublin

National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA) (2008) *Key Skills at Senior Cycle*, NCCA, Dublin.

Osbaldiston, R & Sheldon, KM (2002) 'Social Dilemmas and Sustainability: Promoting People's Motivation to Co-operate with the Future' in Schmuck, P & Schultz, PW (eds.) *Psychology of Sustainable Development*, Kluwer Academic, Dordrecht, pp. 37-57.

Osler, A (1994) *Development Education: Global Perspectives in the Curriculum*, Council of Europe, Cassell.

Palinscar, AS & Brown, AL (1984) 'Reciprocal Teaching of Comprehension-Fostering and Comprehension-Monitoring Activities' in *Cognition & Instruction*, Vol. 1, 2, p. 117.

Savi-Baden, M (2003) *Facilitating Problem-Based Learning*, Society for Research into Higher Education & Open University Press, New York.

Scardamalia, M & Bereiter, C (2006) 'Knowledge building: Theory, pedagogy, and technology' in Sawyer, IK (ed.) *Cambridge Handbook of the Learning Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, New York, pp. 97-118.

The Convention Secretariat (1994) *Report on The National Education Convention*, Dublin:

United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (2005) *UNECE Strategy for Education For Sustainable Development*, March 17-18 2005, United Nations Economic and Social Council, Geneva.

**Nancy Serrano** has a Masters in Environmental Management and Sustainable Development. She has significant experience in environmental awareness campaigns and youth education, with a strong interest in activism. She is currently a research assistant at the University of Limerick and the administrator of RCE-Ireland

(United Nations Regional Centre for Expertise in Education for Sustainable Development), a nationwide network of organisations involved in Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) ([www.rce-ireland.ie](http://www.rce-ireland.ie)). Her research interests include education for sustainability, situated cognition methodologies and evaluation of ESD.

**Dr. Roland Tormey** is Head of the Department of Education and Professional Studies at the University of Limerick. His research on development education and related topics has been published nationally and internationally and he played a central role in the development and writing of the NCCA Intercultural Education Guidelines for Primary and Post-primary schools (which won a Media and Multiculturalism Award in 2006, and a citation from the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe). He is academic coordinator of Ubuntu Network: Teacher Education for Sustainable Development and National Contact Point for the RCE Ireland - the Irish Regional Centre for Expertise in Education for Sustainable Development.

## MUSIC LISTENING CIRCLES: CONTRIBUTIONS FROM DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION TO DEMOCRATISING CLASSICAL MUSIC

Development education (DE) has made and continues to make a significant contribution to music education. Specifically, Freire's culture circles have evolved into two musical and literacy education approaches towards dialogic learning in Spain. Through the work of many scholars these Freirean circles have now morphed into two new categories: a) 'tertulias dialógicas literarias' or 'dialogical literacy circles' reflecting the literacy approach; and b) 'tertulias dialógicas musicales' or 'dialogical music listening circles', reflecting the musical education approach. In this article, **Danilo Martins de Castro Chaib** examines how the theory underlining the practice of the music circle impacts and alters our understanding of how Pierre Bourdieu's theory of cultural capital relates to Iris Young's cultural imperialism. It will look at the social groups that support these circles such as the federations and confederations created by the participant groups. It will also examine how particular practices coming from the field of development education assist these culture circles in achieving their key objective, i.e. the wider appreciation of music and literature by facilitating the creation of new interpretations and developing tastes born of the particular cultural background of each participant.

### Introduction: The Freirean culture circles

The Brazilian philosopher, educator and activist Paulo Freire has both historical and present day significance for development education in Brazil as well as many countries around the world (Freire, 1969; 1970; 1993; 1997; 1997a; 1997b; 1998; 2001). His work has influenced various educations, including peace education (Atack, 2009) and music education (Chaib, 2006b). This article focuses on how practices formed in development education in Barcelona can change the perspective and approach of musical education as a whole.

Freirean liberation theory underpins development education (Hogan & Tormey, 2008), promoting problem-based learning, dialogue and participation within a co-operative learning environment where the teacher engages in learning with the student, and the student engages with other students in addition to learning with the teacher. Similar practices exist in music education, and this article examines music circles based on Freirean culture circles in Barcelona, which demonstrate how an educator's approach can facilitate the demystification of classical music, and turn the music as a tool to understand others' cultures and perspectives.

The 'dialogical action' written about in Freire's *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (Freire, 1970), years before Habermas published his *Theory of Communication Action* (2004a; 2004b - originally published in 1981), was based on years of Freire's practice of teaching illiterate people in Brazil in the 1950s and 1960s. The axis of his practice was what he called 'culture circle', which is basically Habermas' theory of free speech put into action. This action through dialogue has had great relevance for development education, becoming a cornerstone of its pedagogical philosophy. The culture circles, organised by Freire and his followers in Brazil in the 1950s, are now being developed for other fields of education, for example music circles as a new approach to music education since 2003 in Barcelona. I will consider how those culture circles are organised, and then look at their implications towards social theories and concepts linked to DE such as cultural capital and cultural imperialism.

The organisation of a culture circle (Bahruth & Steiner, 2000) requires constant reflection and criticism of one's own pedagogy. A circle is created in an attempt to provide pedagogical spaces in which students can develop their voices in a human environment of respect and affirmation. However, other changes must accompany this rearrangement if a culture circle is to evolve. Eye contact among the learners is important, as it can capture the curiosity and imagination of students. The teacher must also consider a change in discourse patterns and views of authority, knowledge, curriculum, and learning. A culture circle does not evolve simply by having students sit in a circle. The challenge for the educator is to provide a focus without dismissing the voices of participants in the dialogue. Teachers must recognise both conscious and unconscious attempts to derail the discourse. The focus can be maintained by asking follow-up questions. Knowing absolutely where a circle is headed would be antithetical to critical pedagogy and would exclude the teacher as a participant-learner in the circle; in essence, this practice promotes the notion that the curriculum should be dynamic, always in construction, and responding to the needs of the learners. Rather than dismissing the life experiences of each student, the teacher recognises that students can only make new meanings based upon prior understandings anchored in the organic nature of their knowing.

This type of knowing has been labelled by Ramon Flecha as 'cultural intelligence'. Cultural intelligence is a crucial principle of dialogic learning, and for this it is imperative that the teacher provide a space in which all views can be voiced freely and safely. Only when all views are heard can we claim that the heterogeneous nature of our culture (Bahruth & Steiner, 2000) is most widely represented in the circle. Flecha (2000) calls this heterogeneous nature of our

culture an 'equality of differences' when describing how dialogic learning can awaken the meaning of learning among students as a way of being recognised positively and respected by others. Culture circles, as such, deconstruct prior mainstream school experiences (Bahruth & Steiner, 2000).

### **Culture circles in Spain: The dialogic 'tertulias'**

The culture circles were further developed in the 1980s and are currently used in several Spanish schools for adult education in a type of reading group called 'tertulia literaria' (Aubert & Soler, 2001; Flecha, 2000). These 'reading circles' target adult literacy learners with no academic background, i.e., those who attend adult basic education, and they focus on reading literary classics. As part of this experience, adults come to read, discuss, and enjoy what are generally regarded as classic works of literature by authors that they would not have read up to that point such as Franz Kafka, James Joyce, Émile Zola, and Federico García Lorca (Soler, 2001). These tertulias literarias are defined by three main characteristics (Puigvert, et al., 2000):

- a) The programme targets adult learners with low literacy skills;
- b) The readings are widely regarded as literary classics; and
- c) The process is based on dialogic learning.

Both tertulia literaria and tertulia musical are models of cultural circles derived from the field of development education. Using these approaches it has been possible to extend these techniques to areas such as professional training (Soler, 2004; Chaib 2006a), prison rehabilitation programmes (Loza Aguirre, 2004), and music education (Chaib, 2006b).

Following the example of the tertulias literarias in Barcelona, this pedagogical approach was applied to music education and implemented in 2004 (Chaib, 2006b) at the education centre Escola de Persones Adultes La Verneda-Sant Martí (Sánchez Aroca, 1999; Valls, 2000). The music listening circles approach changed focus from reading to listening to classical music. Participants listen, discuss and enjoy classical music compositions they had not heard before such as Haydn's Quartets, Beethoven's Symphonies, Bach's Suites, and Stravinsky's Symphonic Poems and Ballets, i.e. music that is regarded as 'erudite' and generally falling into the 'snobbish' category of the type of music more commonly associated to people with a certain level of academic background. With the same characteristics as tertulia literarias, but in the field of music, the programme targets adult learners with very low standards of

‘academic listening skills’ e.g. people who have never attended an orchestral performance or possibly even seen instruments like cellos or oboes. This pedagogical model focuses on listening to Western classical music, from Gregorian chant to contemporary classical, and has been developed on the basis of dialogic learning principles.

Similar to the Freirean culture circles, each music listening circle has a co-ordinator who attempts to maintain the egalitarian nature of the dialogue both among the participants and between the participants and him/herself. A selected piece of music is played and ideally each participant will have also listened to it independently prior to the session and have a comment prepared. Each comment becomes a ‘contribution’ to the dialogic process and all contributions must be equally listened to and considered (Puigvert, et al., 2000). In dialogic learning, the co-ordinator’s opinion is only as valid as the participants’ opinions and not accorded a higher value (Gomez, 2000). Ideas and contributions made by people, whether in class or in the management and decision-making bodies, are valued according to the validity of the arguments made rather than to the position of power of the person who makes them (Habermas, 1987; 2004a; 2004b). These communicative skills of dialogue are inherent in all people and are optimised through the interaction among equals with the common purpose of expanding knowledge (Fisas, et al., 2000). The act of sharing previously unfamiliar knowledge transforms it into a new democratic knowledge, with the help of teachers who practice Freire’s ideas. These educators are referred to as ‘transformative intellectuals’, a term meaning educationalists who render curricula and schooling problematical in the minds of their students, interrogating the ideologies, values and interests at work in education, with a view to raising the political consciousness of students and students’ insights into their own life situations (Aronowitz & Giroux, 1986).

## **Classical music as cultural capital**

Pierre Bourdieu and Jean-Claude Passeron (1977) have written extensively about how the relatively autonomous character of a school conceals its function as the most effective means for the cultural reproduction of the privileges of the dominant class. The formalised character of the school, such as its fixed curriculum, syllabi, examinations and school regulations, authorises it to transmit selected middle-class knowledge to all pupils.



Music classrooms are no exception to this socio-cultural school rule (Koizumi, 2002). Formal features include: being under constant surveillance by adults; being under pressure from others' evaluations; playing and listening to music not for the primary purpose of enjoyment but rather of becoming 'educated'; and acquiring musical cultural capital through systematic and scholastic means (Bourdieu, 1984:63–83). This cultural capital is being neglected by both the mass media as well as the sectors that educate the working class. It creates two types of knowledge and musical taste, i.e. that which belongs to those who are 'educated' (in music schools and familiar with orchestras and classical music) and those who are less 'educated' i.e. do not possess the tools to decode the language of classical music and extract their own interpretations from the many possible meanings available within the music.

Cultural capital is identified by Bourdieu (1986) as existing in three different states:

“First, it exists in the ensemble of cultivated dispositions that are internalized by the individual through socialization and that constitute schemes of appreciation and understanding. Second, Cultural Capital exists in the objectified form of objects, such as books, works of art, and scientific instruments, which require specialized cultural abilities to use and understand. Third, Cultural Capital exists in an institutionalized form, by which Bourdieu means the educational credential system” (Swartz, 1997).

Classical music assumes the form of cultural capital in all those states, as the appreciation and understanding require specialised cultural abilities to use musical instruments and understand musical phrases and meanings. Classical music assumes many institutionalised forms such as symphonic orchestras for performing and producing music commodities and conservatoires for music education. Classical music as cultural capital displays a fetishist behaviour (Adorno, 1983) inasmuch as the values inherent in the music are intrinsically impregnated with the idea of class stratification. It is regarded as the music of the élite, and it is ideologically understood that only a few can understand its language.

We can understand that music education rooted in development education, specifically Paulo Freire's work, can become a site for resistance. Such a form of music education has the potential to make classical music more democratic, a site of praxis where classical music can be

reinterpreted through dialogue, with each piece listened to by students juxtaposed with their reality. From this perspective, the heretofore hidden codes of this type of cultural capital start to become clearer/more explicit or simply vanish to give way to codes that make more sense to the reality of the listener.

## **Transforming cultural capital and overcoming cultural imperialism**

The theory developed by Paulo Freire (1970) relates the reality of the reader/listener to the object of study and engages the commitment of communities to education developed in their geographical environment (Elboj, et al., 2002). Participants are re-interpreting and, through dialogue, changing the dominant meanings of cultural imperialism. According to Young (1990) cultural imperialism involves the universalisation of a dominant group's experience and culture, and its establishment as the norm. Because the values and perspectives of dominant groups permeate cultural and institutional norms, members of oppressed groups have their lives interpreted through the lens of the dominant group, defined as 'common sense'. Furthermore, oppressed groups often internalise the negative stereotypes to which their group is subjected (Baker, et al., 2004; Bell, 1997; Freire 1997a; 1997b). The focus of the music circles is on listening to what would be regarded by the dominant groups as the pinnacles of musical achievement, and to act as a culture study (Giroux, 1986). The procedure followed within these circles tries to change the meaning of those cultural products which express the dominant group's perspective on and interpretation of events and elements in society, including other groups in society, insofar as they attain cultural status at all (Young, 1990). Thus the challenge of these circles is, through dialogue, to change the cultural status and meaning of those products.

A significant consequence of the establishment of these circles has been the formation of social organisations, such as the Catalan FACEPA (Federació d' Associacions Culturals de Persones Adultes), the Catalan federation of participant associations, which began in 1996 with four participants based in adult school associations. By 2005 there were fourteen federated associations plus other non-federated ones participating in FACEPA's activities (FACEPA 1998, 2005). Another example is the Spanish CONFAPEA (2005) (Confederation of participants in adult education and democratic cultural federations and associations), where participants from all schools can share their experiences and promote local and national activities. This democratic approach is evident from the preamble of CONFAPEA Participants' Bill of Rights:

“Education, an inalienable right of adults, has to serve as an instrument for emancipation, which makes possible the overcoming of social inequalities and power relations” (FACEPA, 1998).

In the academic field, there is CREA (the Centre of Research for Education of Adults in theories and practice that overcome inequalities) located in the University of Barcelona which conducts research rooted in Freirean principles (CREA, 1992, 1993, 1994a, 1994b, 1995-98). These culturally specific networks and organisations (FACEPA, CONFAPEA and CREA) demonstrate the benefits of experiences and affirmations gained through practices as a cumulatively progressive movement where the five different modalities of oppression proposed by Young (violence, cultural imperialism, exploitation, marginalisation and powerlessness) are recognised (1990). Music listening circles challenge cultural imperialism principally through one of CREA’s principles: cultural intelligence (Aubert, et al., 2004; Flecha, 2000).

According to Baker, et al., 2004, the idea of interculturalism involves critical dialogue among people with different cultural commitments in which participants try to engage constructively in challenging each others’ prejudices and develop a truly egalitarian ethos. Within musical circles, every person becomes more consciously aware of their own cultural intelligence, present at any age and regardless of his or her prior practical or academic experience (CREA, 1995-98).

Through the practice of egalitarian dialogue within the music circles, participants can overcome the oppression exercised by cultural imperialism through its marginalisation of certain groups toward an awareness of the historical repertoire of music of the Western world. In this way, Freire’s model of education can help challenge social-class based on inequalities in education, transforming oppressive limits and expanding frontiers to acquire knowledge formerly restricted to cultural capital.

### **Acknowledging cultural intelligence**

Cultural intelligence takes effect when people use the knowledge gained as cultural capital and relate it to their own reality. This results in individuals gaining new meaning, comparing different point of views and creating new solutions defying the logic imposed by the academy and the standard knowledge. This means that when working class meets cultural capital, it

manifests itself in the form of a critical encounter which transforms and incorporates this cultural capital into its own cultural intelligence. This is not an easy task, as the working class has to emancipate itself from the ideological notion that certain knowledge is too ‘complicated’ or ‘impossible’ for the working classes to understand. As Freire comments:

“(Literacy circles in poor areas) only make sense in the context of a humanising process. In other words, they should open up conjointly the possibility of a socio-historical and political equivalent of psychoanalysis whereby the sense of self-blame that has been falsely interjected can be cast out. This expulsion of self-blame corresponds to the expulsion of the invasive shadow of the oppressor that inhabits the psyche of the oppressed” (Freire, 1998:78).

This self-blame that Freire refers to in *Pedagogy of Freedom* leads people to use power claims to hide behind ideological values for fear of confronting another opinion, for fear of the possibility of dialogue. Dialogue helps us better understand the music we are listening to. People realise that there is no shame in not being familiar with the work of Cervantes, Joyce, Bach or Beethoven, and instead bring them to their realities. Below are quotes from literacy and music circle participants:

“I had never gone to school... and when they decided to start the literacy circle they told me ‘why don’t you come?’ and I had never been in such a thing, and I said, ‘I don’t even know what this is!’ and we started with a book, and in so little time, I say ‘my God!’ I had never thought I would be able to read something like that!” (Reme, participant, in Soler, 2001).

“If it was to only listen to music, I would decide to stay at home. What brings me here to this school is my opportunity to share my impressions and listen to other opinions, to appreciate more the music that I am listening to” (Julia, participant of Music Circle, La Verneda, Barcelona, 2008).

“In my house music was nothing but noise – then my wife insisted for me to come and now I can understand more about the music she used to listen to. I feel now part of it” (Juán, participant of Music Circle, La Verneda, Barcelona, 2008).

“I love to hear what the others have to say about the music we are listening to. There are always times when I say to myself ‘I never thought to listen with that point of view’ – and then you realise the real value of the tertulias” (Adelaida, participant of Music Circle, La Verneda, Barcelona, 2008).

Cultural intelligence is closely linked with two concepts: competency and skills (De Botton, et al., 2005). This means it acknowledges the universal status of learning (competency), i.e., the capacity that everyone has for acting in the world, and the potential for creativity and cultural creation (skills), i.e., the several forms of knowledge that one can develop in a dialogic society. This concept of intelligence is associated with Habermas’s procedural concept of communicative rationality (Habermas, 2004a) in which participants use knowledge to reach understanding and co-ordinate their actions. Concepts of practical and academic intelligence, although useful, are limited to what Habermas calls ‘teleological action’ (i.e. targeted to achieving personal goals).

Communicative action takes us to a broader concept of intelligence, cultural intelligence, which considers the possibility of people using communicative competencies and developing learning strategies through dialogue and co-operation with others, rather than by using academic or practical skills (Gomez, 2000). Habermas states that the critique of cultural capital (‘value standards’) will emancipate the cultural value so important to cultural intelligence:

“Cultural values do not count as universal; they are, as the name indicates, located within the horizon of the lifeworld of a specific group or culture. And values can be made plausible only in the context of a particular form of life. Thus the critique of value standards presupposes a shared pre-understanding among participants in the argument, a pre-understanding that is not at their disposal but constitutes and at the same time circumscribes the domain of the thematized validity claims.

Only the truth of propositions and the rightness of moral norms and the comprehensibility or well-formedness of symbolic expressions are, by their very meaning, universal validity claims that can be tested in discourse” (Habermas, 2004a:42).

Cultural intelligence has three fundamental elements: interactive self-confidence, cultural transference and dialogic creativity, all present within the practices conducted in the music circles:

- *Interactive self-confidence*, or recognition of important skills possessed in other areas. Within the literary and musical circles, the members talk about how well they can make deals at the market, resolve a family conflict and return to harmonious coexistence, organise a search for a job, etc. (De Botton, et al., 2005);
- *Cultural transference* can manifest itself as the discovery of possibilities for demonstrating cultural intelligence in the new academic context (Flecha, 2000). The oral cultural practices of singing, listening to the radio or even listening to birds' song prove their 'transferability' to the process of listening to classical music, creating in the process deeper music and poetry analyses. Such cultural intelligence is also transferable to an academic context;
- *Dialogic creativity* is related to the confirmation of learning generated by participants' contributions. The various interpretations given can vary from that which has been previously written on the topic, a result of the sharing of experiences, ideas and feelings. The teleological action is put into question with communicative action, sharing the cultural intelligence through egalitarian dialogue. The intelligence of all participants of the dialogic group moves beyond each individual member and 'transfers' to other members of the group.

This creativity is stimulated by a structured curiosity, and the fact that all this material is received through the act of dialogue makes it subject to critical action, transforming its meaning into a coherent epistemological knowledge to the reality of the listener. As Freire said:

“There could be no creativity without the curiosity that moves us and sets us patiently impatient before a world that we did not make, to add to it something of our own making...One of the fundamental types of knowledge in my critical-educative practice is that which stresses the need for spontaneous curiosity to develop into epistemological curiosity” (Freire, 1998:83).

Education is human service work. It is based on a dialogue between students and teachers and amongst students. By listening to classical music, dialoguing and reflecting together, students overcome barriers that have been traditionally excluding them from education and social participation, providing them with valuable tools for developing educational alternatives. These alternatives can include, for example attending a concert and confidently commenting on it; discussing the lives of composers; or learning a musical

instrument to gain more perspective about the music universe. These are experiences that enrich the new democratic and communicative perspective for music education curricula (Arostegui, 2004).

Classical music assumes other meanings with cultural intelligence, putting in question all fetishism impregnated previously as cultural capital. As cultural capital, classical music is alienated from the working class, and only through dialogic learning, where the music can be listened to without being a form of oppression, can this alienation be persuaded to turn the music into part of their reality. Absorbing the knowledge intrinsic in classical music, this type of listening can demystify the nature of cultural capital, allowing participants to acknowledge their own cultural intelligence. By transforming parameters imposed by the élite, bringing closer an art previously denied to them, people can challenge social-class based inequalities not only in education, but in their lives.

A critical approach to classical music is imperative so as to ensure that it is not simplistically converted into something merely 'banal' or, conversely, 'exotic'. That is why it is so important to appreciate the music that one is listening to, to express opinions about it, discover its history and epistemological codes, and more importantly, share that discovery with others. The learning process can thereby become a social event, bringing an enriched meaning to music that the original artists such as Beethoven would have desired.

## Conclusion

Development education has an importance that extends beyond its own borders to education as a whole, and more specifically in the context of this discussion, music education. Freire's perspective helps to break the iron cage where classical music is inserted as cultural capital. As Roland Tormey (2005) suggests, this approach is not only an educational approach but also allows the learner to come to their own decisions rather than having perspectives foisted upon them, albeit for the best possible reasons.

Development education (Edleston, 2006) promotes critical reflection that includes the context as well as the content of learning, where education institutions themselves are challenged. When this critical reflection is placed in the context of learning classical music, the cultural capital embedded within it is challenged as well.

Development education as a transformative process through dialogue can support the making of a complete being and, even, the process of becoming itself (Cruikshanks, 2006). As Freire suggests, we can only attempt to play a part in an ongoing process of transformation, and trust that those individuals who have been moved enough to consider taking action to change the world, will follow through with committed action as personal situations and circumstances allow.

As an epilogue it is worth noting that the practice of music circles illustrated above is currently being increasingly incorporated into development education practice in the city of São Carlos, Brazil. As a music teacher in Brazil, I look forward to extending these practices and assisting in the enrichment of the meaning of classical music with all the diversity of sounds we can find in my country, and with no restriction applied to whoever wants to listen or perform.

## References

Adorno, TW (1983) *O Fetichismo da Música e a Regressão da Audição* (original text from 1938) *Textos Escolhidos*. São Paulo, S Abril.

Aronowitz, S & Giroux, H (1986) *Education under Siege*, Routledge & Kegan Paul, London.

Aróstegui, JL (2004) 'Formación del Profesorado en Educación Musical en la Universidad de Illinois: Un Estudio de Caso' in *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical*, Vol. 1, 6.

Atack, I (2009) 'Peace studies and social change: The role of ethics and human agency' in *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*, Issue 9, Autumn 2009.

Aubert, A, Duque, E, Fisas, M & Valls, R (2004) *Dialogar y Transformar. Pedagogía crítica del siglo XXI*, Graó, Barcelona.

Aubert, A. & Soler, M (2001) *La Verneda-Sant Martí Adult Education Center: Dialogic Learning and Democratic Participation both Within and Without*: <http://www.edst.educ.ubc.ca/aerc/2001/2001soler.htm>.

Bahruth, R & Steiner, S (2000) 'Upstream in the mainstream: Pedagogy against the current' in Steiner, S, Krank, MK, McLaren, P & Bahruth, R (eds.) *Freirean pedagogy, praxis, and possibilities: Projects for the new millennium*, Falmer Press, New York and London.



Baker, J, Lynch, K, Cantillon, S & Walsh, J (2009) *Equality: From Theory to Action, 2nd Edition*, Palgrave Macmillan, London.

Baker, J & Lynch, K (2005) 'Equality in Education: An Equality of Condition Perspective' in *Theory and Research in Education*, Vol. 3, 2, pp. 131-164.

Bourdieu, P (1984a) *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge.

Bourdieu, P (1986) 'The forms of capital' in Richardson, JG (ed.) *The Handbook of Theory: Research for the Sociology of Education*, Greenwood Press, New York, pp. 241-58.

Bourdieu, P & Passeron, JC (1977) *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*, Berkeley, London.

Chaib, D (2006a) 'Comprensión Crítica y Aprendizaje Dialógico: Lectura Dialógica' in *Lectura y vida*, Buenos Aires, Vol. 27, 1, pp. 18-28.

Chaib, D (2006b) 'El Aprendizaje Dialógico y una nueva dimensión instrumental: La Tertulia Musica' in *Idea Sostenible*, Vol. 3, 13: <https://upcommons.upc.edu/revistes/handle/2099/1109>.

CONFAPEA (2005) 'Tertulias Musicales Dialógicas': <http://www.http://www.neskes.net/confapea/>.

Centre for Research of Education for Adults (CREA) (1992) 'Habilidades básicas de la población. Alfabetización funcional en España', Universidad de Barcelona, Barcelona.

Centre for Research of Education for Adults (CREA) (1993) 'Numeracy at the workplace' FORCE, Commission of the European Communities.

Centre for Research of Education for Adults (CREA) (1994a) 'Habilidades básicas de la población adulta', Centro de Investigación y Documentación Educativa (CIDE) Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, Madrid.

Centre for Research of Education for Adults (CREA) (1994b) 'Participación en la educación de personas adultas' UNESCO, Institute for Education, Hamburg, Centro de Investigación y Documentación Educativa (CIDE), Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, Madrid.

Centre for Research of Education for Adults (CREA) (1995-1998) 'Habilidades comunicativas y desarrollo social', Dirección General de investigación y Técnica, (DGICYT), Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia, Madrid.

Cruickshanks, N (2006) 'Breaking barriers through children's global arts' in *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*, Issue 2, Spring 2006.

DeBotton, L, Puigvert, L & Sanchez-Aroca, M (2005) *The Inclusion of Other Women - Breaking the Silence through Dialogic Learning*, Springer, Dordrecht.

Edleston, J (2006) 'Is development education most effective in the formal education sector?' in *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*, Issue 2, Spring 2006.

Elboj, C, Puigdemívol, I, Saler Gallart, M & Valls, R (2002) *Comunidades de aprendizaje. Transformar la educación*, Graó, Barcelona.

Federation of Cultural and Educational Associations for Adults (FACEPA) (1998) 'Declaration of Rights of Adults in Education', European Commission, DG XXII, Socrates Program, Barcelona.

Federation of Cultural and Educational Associations for Adults (FACEPA) (2005) 'Que es una Tertulia Literaria Dialógica?' FACEPA, Barcelona: <http://www.goieskola.net/jardunaldiak/Arrasate/tertulias.pdf>.

Fisas, M, Formariz, A, García Suárez, JA & Lleras, J (2000) 'Habilidades Comunicativas' in *I Jornadas de Investigación en Educación de Personas Adultas*, El Roure, Barcelona.

Flecha, R (1997) *Compartiendo palabras: El aprendizaje de las personas adultas a través del diálogo*, Paidós, Barcelona.

Flecha, R (2000) *Sharing Words. Theory and Practice of Dialogic Learning*, Rowman and Littlefield, Lanham.

Flecha, R, Gómez, J & Puigvert, L (2001) *Teoría sociológica contemporánea*, Paidós, Barcelona.

Flecha, R & Gómez, J (1995) *Racismo: no, gracias. Ni moderno, ni postmoderno*, El Roure, Barcelona.

Freire, P (1969): *La educación como práctica de libertad*. Montevideo. Tierra Nueva.

Freire, P (1970) *Pedagogía del oprimido*, Siglo XXI, Madrid.

Freire, P (1993) *Pedagogía de la esperanza*, Siglo XXI, Madrid.

Freire, P (1997) *Pedagogy of the Heart*, Continuum, New York.

Freire, P (1997a) *Pedagogía de la autonomía*, Siglo XXI, Madrid.

Freire, P (1997b) *A la sombra de este árbol*, El Roure, Barcelona.

Freire, P (1998) *Pedagogy of freedom: ethics, democracy, and civic courage*, Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Lanham.

Freire, P (2001) *Pedagogía de la indignación*, Siglo XXI, Madrid.

Gómez, J (2000) *Learning communities: A social model of education in the information society*, Centre of Research for Education of Adults (CREA): [http://www.die-frankfurt.de/erdi/ESs/ES%202000/jes%C3%BAs\\_g%C3%B3mez\\_crea.htm](http://www.die-frankfurt.de/erdi/ESs/ES%202000/jes%C3%BAs_g%C3%B3mez_crea.htm).

Gramsci, A (1971) *Selections from the Prison Notebooks of Antonio Gramsci*, Hoare, Q & Nowell-Smith, G (ed. and transl.), Lawrence and Wishart, London.

Habermas, J (1987) *The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity: Twelve Lectures*, MIT Press, Cambridge.

Habermas, J (2004a) *The Theory of Communicative Action. Vol. I. Reason and Rationalization of Society*, Polity Press, Cambridge.

Habermas, J (2004b) *The Theory of Communicative Action. Vol. II. Lifeworld and System: A Critique of Functionalist Reason*, Polity Press, Cambridge.

Hochschild, A (1983) *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling*, University of California Press, Berkeley.

Hochschild, A (1989) *The Second Shift: Working Parents and the Revolution at Home*, Penguin, Harmondsworth.

Hogan, D. & Tormey, R (2008) 'A perspective on the relationship between development education and education for sustainable development' in *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*, Issue 6, Spring 2008.

Loza Aguirre, M (2008): *La Prisión como agente formativo de la No-Prisión - Las Tertulias Literarias Dialógicas o de Clásicos Universales*, Vitoria-Gasteiz.

Lynch, K (1999) 'Equality Studies, the Academy and the Role of Research in Emancipatory Social Change' in *The Economic and Social Review*, Vol. 30, 1, January 1999, pp. 41-69.

Núcleo de Investigação e Ação Social e Educativa (NIASE) (2009) *Tertúlia Dialógica Musical*: <http://www.ufscar.br/~niase/tertulias%20dialogicas%20musical.html>.

Puigvert, L (2001) 'Las otras mujeres. Aprendizaje dialógico de personas adultas como generador de transformación social en las relaciones de género', Doctoral dissertation, University of Barcelona.

Puigvert, L, Sorde, T. and Soler, M (2000) 'La Tertulia: A Dialogic Model of Adult Basic Education in the New Information Age', AERC Proceedings: <http://www.edst.educ.ubc.ca/aerc/2000/puigvertl&etal-web.htm> checked in 05/06/2005.

Sánchez Aroca, M (1999) 'La Verneda-Sant Martí: A School Where People Dare to Dream' in *Harvard Educational Review*, Vol. 69, 3, pp. 320-335.

Soler, M (2001) 'Dialogic reading: A new understanding of the reading event' unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Harvard University, Cambridge.

Soler, M (2004) 'Introducción' in *Lenguaje y Ciencias Sociales - Diálogo entre John Searle y Crea*, El Roure Editorial, Barcelona.

Tormey, R (2005) 'Happy Ever Afters: a storybook guide to teaching children about disability' in *Policy and Practice: A Development Education Review*. Issue 1, Autumn 2005.

Valls, R (2000) 'Comunidades de Aprendizaje. Una Práctica educativa de aprendizaje dialógico para sociedad de información' unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Universidad de Barcelona.

Vygotsky, LS (1979) *El desarrollo de los procesos psicológicos superiores*, Crítica, Barcelona.

Weber, M (1980) *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs (original work in 1904-5).

Young, IM (1990) *Justice and the Politics of Difference*, Princeton University Press, Princeton.

**Danilo Chaib** is teaching cello, music theory and research in music education at the Escola de Música de Brasília – Brazil. He has developed his work in the field of music education through projects initiated in 1997 with various settlements of the landless communities in Brazil. This work was further developed through investigative research on 'tertulias musicais' conducted in the period 2004-2006 with the University of Barcelona, Spain. He is

currently building on his doctoral research in the area of sociology of music and music education with the University of Granada, Spain. In tandem with this research, he is also conducting research in the area of sociology of music and conductorless orchestras with the Equality Studies Centre of the School of Social Justice at University College Dublin, Ireland.

## DOES DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION ‘FIT’ INTO ADULT EDUCATION?: OFFERING ADULT LEARNERS THE OPPORTUNITY TO ENGAGE WITH DEVELOPMENT ISSUES

To date, there has not been a strategic focus on the integration of development education into adult and community education in Ireland as a way to promote global citizenship and critical awareness of development issues for adults. In 2008, AONTAS, the National Adult Learning Organisation, in partnership with Irish Aid commissioned a piece of research to explore this topic. **Natasha Bailey**, on behalf of AONTAS, examined whether or not there could be a pedagogical ‘fit’ between development education and adult and community education in Ireland, as well as the challenges and benefits attached to that integration. The research, summarised in this article, also explored how development education could best be promoted to adult and community educators in Ireland. It specifically asked if development education as a process for active citizenship would encourage educators to explore development issues in adult learning. The research concluded that, initially, the integration of development education into adult and community education could happen most easily and effectively in the context of adult literacy education or community education (an education which is founded on community development principles and practices) provision in Ireland. This article aims to convince development educators and development organisations to proactively engage with the adult and community education in Ireland to increase the opportunities available to adults to learn about development issues.

### Introduction

There has been some strategic effort made in Ireland by Irish Aid, development organisation partners and the Department of Education and Science to integrate development education into primary and secondary schooling (see for instance, NCCA, 2006). While this integration is not compulsory, many development NGOs work proactively with schools to provide resources and train teachers, and this work has become more widespread in recent years.

In contrast, adult learners would appear to be, save for a very few development educators, a neglected constituency for development education. Until the publication of the White Paper on Irish Aid (Irish Aid, 2006), few development education stakeholders had made a strategic commitment to ensuring that adults had the opportunity to engage in learning about

development issues. However, in that White Paper, Irish Aid stated ‘Every person in Ireland will have access to educational opportunities to be aware of and understand their rights and responsibilities as global citizens and their potential to effect change for a more just and equal world’ (ibid.,:107). The 2007 Irish Aid Strategic Plan made a similar commitment to exploring how it could support educators to engage adult learners in development education through intermediaries like AONTAS (Irish Aid, 2007). AONTAS is a membership organisation whose mission is ‘to promote the development of a learning society through the provision of a quality and comprehensive system of adult learning and education, which is accessible to and inclusive to all’ (see <http://www.aontas.com>).

In 2008, Irish Aid and AONTAS partnered to carry out a piece of research to explore how development education could be strategically integrated into adult and community education, and whether or not it could be promoted to educators as a process for encouraging active citizenship, as the latter is a strategic aim for AONTAS. The aim of this paper is to persuade development educators, through the findings of the research, to proactively and strategically engage with adult and community education providers and promote the usefulness of development education as a process for fostering key competences in adult learners, including their potential and skills to effect change for a more just and equal world.

To elicit data for this research, a number of methodologies were implemented including: a quantitative survey; semi-structured interviews; mini case studies; and focus groups with key stakeholders in adult and community education and development education. The research was contextualised by literature exploring key theoretical debates about active citizenship, development education and adult and community education. This article will present the theoretical commonalities found in each of these practices; where there are connections and opportunities for curricular integration. It will also briefly summarise how adult and community education is managed and provided in Ireland, as development education stakeholders interviewed for the research described reservations about engagement due to a lack of knowledge about the sector and how it works. Lastly, it will present the key research findings and recommendations pertinent to the development education sector for the strategic integration of development education into adult and community education in Ireland.

## **A note on community education**

The reader may notice that adult education is referred to throughout the article as ‘adult and community education’. This label is used in order to ensure that community education is seen as both equal to and different from formal adult education provision in Ireland. In 2008, there were around 44,000 community education learners in Ireland (Department of Education and Science, 2008). For those who are not familiar with community education, it is an approach that, like adult education, embraces a range of different models that can each result in different outcomes. However, all models encapsulate adult learning that is community-based, non-formal and provided according to the community’s wants and needs. As with the other practices described above, community education can be seen as having a ‘soft’ purpose, which is about providing an educational service to a community for individual development or a more critical purpose, which is evident in the following definition from AONTAS:

“Community education is education and learning which is rooted in a process of empowerment, social justice, change, challenge, respect and collective consciousness. It is within the community and of the community, reflecting the developing needs of individuals and their locale. It builds the capacity of local communities to engage in developing responses to educational and structural disadvantage and to take part in decision-making and policy-formation within the community. It is distinct from general adult education provision, due both to its ethos and to the methodologies it employs” (AONTAS, 2000).

Community education provision in Ireland is also currently subject to a human capital emphasis, because policy makers typically see it as education for disadvantaged groups that can be a bridge to more formal learning that should eventually result in progression to the labour market (Expert Working Group on Future’s Skills Needs, 2007). However, because it is non-formal, providers see it as more flexible and open to different processes and topics than other adult learning opportunities.

### **Adult learning in Ireland and the DEAL project**

In Ireland, the adult and community education is diverse and learning opportunities are provided in a number of programmes and settings. A recent report showed that there are at least 141,255 adult learners participating in Department of Education and Science-funded adult and community education in Ireland (Government of Ireland, 2008). The bulk of adult and community education funded by the Department of Education and Science is delivered



locally as part of the adult education service of the 33 Vocational Education Committees (VECs) through various programmes.

Many adult learning opportunities are accredited through the National Framework of Qualifications (see <http://www.nqai.ie>), a ten level framework of single modules or courses and awards, including a few dedicated global education modules. However, there is no full development education award at any level of the framework.

In 2008, the County Clare VEC commenced the one-year Development Education in Adult Learning (DEAL) project, funded by Irish Aid. This project is the first example of a VEC putting in place a project that aims to integrate development education into adult learning throughout the VEC. Its stated aims are to:

- Encourage and support tutors to integrate development education topics into their course materials and lesson plans;
- Design and pilot a module on global citizenship; and
- Raise awareness of development education work in adult education through the project's website (see <http://www.claredeal.ie>).

### **Finding space for development education in adult and community education**

This research was carried out during a time of great debate about the fundamental purpose of adult and community education in Ireland which touched on key questions relevant to this debate. For instance, many academics and practitioners asked what impact a human capital emphasis on adult education is having on the content and methodology of adult learning opportunities. Some also asked whether there is room for development education in an adult education process that, according to the prevailing policy zeitgeist in Ireland, should focus on the development of skills for the labour market. Baptiste argued that under human capital theory (HCT), the 'qualifications employers want' become the educational outcomes valued (2001:184). Thus, adult learning becomes handmaiden to the market economy.

In this view of adult and community education, providers and the State do not have a responsibility to foster democratic agency separate to that of consumerism. Giroux argues 'democracy necessitates forms of education that provide a new ethic of freedom and a reassertion of collective identity as central

preoccupations of a vibrant democratic culture and society’ (Giroux, 2004). However, the human capital purpose of adult and community education is argued to predominate in Ireland (Grummel, 2007).

This prevailing logic about adult and community education has the potential to limit the space available to educators whose processes and theoretical commitments are concerned with fostering the kind of education that Giroux describes and with which development educators are most likely concerned. It is important to engage in the debate to assert the importance of a more radical and democratic purpose for adult and community education. However, development educators need to be able to persuade adult and community educators who are working within a system governed by human capital logic how development education can help them achieve existing learning outcomes.

For development educators the need for adults to engage in development education is a central element of their practice. The importance of North/South solidarity (Naidoo, 2004), the need to tackle social exclusion on a global level (Najmudin, 2004) and enhancement of community cohesion (Scottish Executive, 2003) are all rationales for ensuring adults have the opportunity to learn about development issues. It may be more challenging to convince adult educators of the rationale for development education. The challenges to doing so could include lack of skills, knowledge or capacity (many adult education tutors are volunteers), and adult educators’ own immersion in the human capital imperative resulting in them not seeing development education as relevant to their teaching. These obstacles could, in part, be addressed by enabling adult educators to see how development education can help adult and community education in meeting strategic commitments at a European level. The European Commission has set out eight key competences that should be fostered through lifelong learning. They are compared in Table 1 against what some of the literature posits as the outcomes of development education for adults.

Table 1. European Union lifelong learning competences and outcomes of development education for adult learners

European Union competences	Development education outcomes
----------------------------	--------------------------------

Communication in the mother tongue;	Knowledge about systems and societies that a nation trades with in order to implement fair business behaviour;
Communication in the foreign languages;	Self-directed learning and problem solving (Toepfer, 2003);
Mathematical competence and basic competences in science and technology;	Understanding and appreciation of cultural diversity;
Digital competence;	Understanding the global employment market (Scottish Executive, 2003);
Learning to learn;	Coping skills for rapid change;
Interpersonal, intercultural and social competences and civic competence;	Social literacy to work with others to address global issues (White, 2004);
Entrepreneurship; and	Making connections between different contexts and situations (Osler, 2004);
Cultural expression.	Research and debating skills;
	Campaigning and protest;
	Critical analysis of complex social issues – ability to connect single events to systemic arrangements; and
	Making value judgements (Rost, 2004).

The table shows that there are many similarities between the strategic directives and the skills fostered through development education. The research presented here also sought to explore whether development education as a process for active global citizenship education could be used as a message to encourage adult and community educators to engage adult learners in development education. However, as with the purpose of adult and community education, the notion of active citizenship is also hotly debated. The focus of policy on active citizenship at a national level in Ireland has placed more emphasis on legal citizenship than cosmopolitan, critical citizenship. In other

words, policy is concerned with enabling ‘soft’ forms of citizenship like voting and volunteering as opposed to critical citizenship involving protest and critical analysis of inequality.

This debate begs the question of what forms of citizenship should be legitimated and taught in adult and community education, using development education processes. Different approaches to development education have an impact on what forms of active citizenship are fostered in learners (Andreotti, 2006). A ‘soft’ or moral stance can result in an uncritical commitment of either time or money to church or state development work overseas. On the other hand, critical development education supports reflection about global social injustice, a commitment to challenging different forms of inequality and working to implement a different vision of the world.

A review of the literature (published in full in the research report) reveals that active citizenship, development education, and adult and community education intersect under two approaches; a liberal approach, or a justice/critical approach, which then show what different types of citizenship and skills for active citizenship are fostered through each (see Table 2 below) (Task Force on Active Citizenship, 2007; Khoo, 2006).

Table 2. Approaches to active citizenship, adult/community education and development education

	Liberal/Humanist	Justice/Critical
Citizenship	A communitarian approach, individuals should make a contribution to the collective good, i.e. volunteering. May not critically examine how some do not have equal access to participation in civic life. Focus on obedient citizen (see Task Force on Active Citizenship, 2007).	Critical citizenship based on human rights and responsibilities. Fosters skills for participation for all out of a recognition that some do not have equal opportunities to participate in democracy. Advocates action for social change whether it is critical of

		decision-makers or not. Takes the side of those who do not have power (see Naidoo, 2005).
Adult/ community education	Learner-centred – the learner returns to learning to satisfy personal goals be they the development of hard or soft skills. Current emphasis on development of vocational skills for personal advancement (for example as described in Knowles, et al., 2005).	Learner and collective-centred employing Freirean methodologies and a concern for radical social change. Fosters learning as a site for analysing and resisting inequality. Fosters critical analysis for social change and individual and collective empowerment (see Mark, 2007).
Development education	Not uncritical about development processes in other countries or interdependence. Learner asked to take action by supporting existing campaigns. Does not seek to foster citizen’s own critical analysis (see Andreotti, 2006).	Employing Freirean methodologies and human rights, fosters idea that we are interdependent and should play an active role in changing unjust social structures that cause global inequality, poverty and injustice. Fosters critical analysis and skills to take action for a more just world, including campaigning and protest (ibid.).

In the liberal tradition the commonalities include a focus on the common good and the individual, and the promotion of action to enhance this focus. It also relies on the individual to make personal choices or changes.

In the justice/critical framework we see a great deal of overlap between the three practices in terms of the importance of critical analysis and recognition of inequality. This framework emphasises fundamental social change and a resistance to the status quo. The process shared in adult and community education and development education in this framework is a participative Freirean methodology. In this understanding of active citizenship and development education there is an emphasis on taking action to achieve equality and social change. The justice approach to all three practices shares the values of equality, social justice, solidarity, empathy and respect for human rights.

It is in the justice/critical tradition that we see the impetus for an understanding of development education as education for global citizenship. Development education has a valuable role to play in contributing to a new broader, more inclusive understanding of active citizenship, which acknowledges the global responsibilities of individuals and communities (Osler, 1994:3).

This research sought to understand what frameworks research participants were employing to make connections between the three practices. Many saw them as well-connected within a justice or critical perspective, which then required them to articulate in which type of adult and community education provision these connections could be implemented. These articulations are presented in the findings section below. The next section describes the methodology used to compile the research.

## Research methodology

A mixed method 'real world' approach was taken to achieving the aim and objectives set for the research. This mixed motive common-sense approach is described by Robson who says that 'the basic claim is that principled enquiry can be of help in the office...or wherever, and in initiating sensible change and development' (Robson, 2002). In other words, the research strategy needed to ensure that the researcher could both access 'hot knowledge' or, 'the developing knowledge generated by professional practitioners who have to...face the client groups' (Kegan, 1999) and those who could offer ideas about how those practical insights could be integrated strategically for practitioners across adult and community education provision. This imperative resulted in the mixed motive design. Quantitative methods were used to access a large number of practitioners to identify trends in practice. Qualitative methods were employed

to gain more detailed insights into both the practice of integrating development education into adult and community education and the ideas of those who were strategically placed in the adult and community education and development education sector consulted for the research. Table 3 below details the levels for which data was collected, the methods used to do so, and the sampling strategies employed.

Table 3. Research Methods Employed

Level	Methods	Sample
Policy / Strategic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- One-to-one semi-structured interviews with policy-makers, managers and leaders;</li> <li>- Focus groups.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 15 interviews with key informants snowball sampled from the adult and community education sector, nine from the development education sector;</li> <li>- two focus groups (AEOs, CEFs).</li> </ul>
Organisation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Survey questionnaire to map the extent of development education in the adult/community education sector;</li> <li>- Case studies.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 256 purposively sampled practitioners in adult and community education;</li> <li>- five purposively sampled case studies:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• one community education centre;</li> <li>• adult educators' training programme;</li> <li>• women's community education group;</li> <li>• adult basic education group;</li> <li>• community education/development education centre.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Tutor/ Facilitator	- Focus group.	- focus group with adult and community education practitioners.
Learners	- Focus group.	- group of basic education learners (sampled from one of case studies).

A total of 301 individuals participated in this research either through the survey, one-to-one interviews or focus groups. An additional five organisations assisted in the development of case studies.

## Research findings and recommendations

The research resulted in a range of findings and recommendations; those presented here are considered to be those most pertinent to development educators and development organisations.

The research showed that development education is not widespread in adult and community education. The survey conducted for the research was sent to over 1,000 adult and community education stakeholders in Ireland and had a response rate of about 26 per cent (256). Of the 256 respondents, about 205 providers delivered some type of development education with their learners most often through the use of materials about international human rights or global issues. A further 77 per cent (175) of those providers ran or supported international events for their learners. Respondents to the survey indicated that they had little knowledge of the concrete themes that could be explored as part of development education, although they did see it as a process that fostered critical analysis and a focus on global social justice.

The survey indicated that a key challenge to delivering development education was a lack of materials and resources showing educators how to educate on development themes. Since the survey was completed by a small proportion of adult and community educators in Ireland it cannot be



considered fully representative of the sample group. However, the research concluded that a great deal of work is needed to create awareness of development education among adult educators and persuade them of its value.

The research reaffirmed that there is not a strategic focus on the provision of development education in adult and community education. It is ad hoc, depending on organisations' and individual tutors' motivation to provide it. Strategic integration is challenged by a number of findings from the research. For example, some of the research interviewees from the adult and community education sector understood development education as being solely about individual and community development and not about integrating a global dimension into learning. Interviewees for the research did not, on the whole, have a shared definition of active citizenship, development education and/or adult and community education. The research also revealed that stakeholders from the development education sector and the adult and community education sector did not know about the work and management of each other's sectors. Of particular note was the fact that development education stakeholders perceived adult and community education provision to be confusing and the sector a challenge to map.

### **Connecting adult and community education, development education and active citizenship**

The qualitative data from the research indicated that there are connections between active citizenship, development education and adult and community education, and that active citizenship could be fostered through development education. However, many of the interviewees across all the sectors were clear that other outcomes from development education are also of value to the learner and should not be limited to what they perceived to be a 'thin' State definition of citizenship. In other words, many saw connections between the three practices within the critical/justice tradition as evidenced in the following quote from a research participant:

“So if you put the three things together, if development education can awaken people's whole notion that what we do has an impact on people across the globe and we have a role to play in trying to help people to attain a better standard of living through adult/community education then active citizenship flows out of that - the three of them together can rub off each other. You can come to any one first but if you can link all

three together and if they can be part of the same equation or the same approach then it is a very powerful force for good”.

The outcomes of development education identified by and for adult learners from the research include: learning to learn; research and problem-solving skills; intercultural communication; increased confidence and sense of agency; collective empowerment; critical analysis; leadership; and active citizenship amongst others. These echo the strategic competences that the European Union calls to be fostered through lifelong learning.

Many interviewees from both the development education and adult and community education sectors perceived development education to ‘fit’ best into community education and adult basic education provision. The features that research participants said were shared by these three types of provision are Freirean methodologies, flexible provision, learner-defined content, community development, critical analysis and individual and collective empowerment. The potential for development education to foster social justice agendas at home as much as abroad was considered particularly relevant to community education and adult basic education. The following quote from a research participant emphasises the relationship between community education and development education:

“If there’s a chance of helping people or facilitating them to make connections between their life and issues at a global level, it’s in literacy and community education that it’s going to occur because a) you can get at [Further Education and Training Awards Council (FETAC)] level 3 or 4; and b) it is about pursuing a very specific educational programme but in the early stages they’re exploring themselves – there’s an opportunity”.

### **Existing curriculum opportunities for integrating development education**

Those interviewed for the research indicated that integrating development education into adult and community education would be a worthwhile venture, albeit requiring a great deal of consultation across the adult and community education sector. The qualitative data indicated that development education in adult and community education should not be an add-on. It should be integrated across provision through themes and case studies and dedicated development education programmes should also be developed. The data indicated that an argument should be made as to how development education can help educators achieve existing aims.

Qualitative data showed that the types of programmes and courses into which development education could be embedded are diverse, including community development, social studies and social care, personal effectiveness, intercultural studies, politics, history and geography. There was consensus that development education might not fit into every programme but that providers should look to see where it would fit most appropriately.

### **Into practice: Examples of integration**

The smaller qualitative case studies conducted for the research and presented in the research report gave examples of adult and community education that had integrated development education into programmes for adult learners. These case studies included life skills training for former drug users, an adult basic education group, a women's leadership programme, a course on gender and development, and an adult educators' training programme. Data used to compile the case studies included tutor feedback and learner evaluations. Each of the case studies involved development education, which was situated within a justice/critical tradition.

It was clear that the nature of the provision in the case studies allowed both learners and facilitators to co-direct the learning, enhancing engagement for both parties. For instance, the women's leadership course learners chose to work towards stated learning outcomes through an exploration of the global nature of violence against women, and the lack of human rights for women globally. It was clear that when the provision is flexible enough for learners to state their needs or interests and those needs and interests are connected to development education themes, it can result in achievements well beyond those originally scoped.

For instance, a key theme arising from the cases was that taking a critical global dimension to the learning broadened the world of participants that, in turn, resulted in an increased sense of agency for them. For instance, the learners in the adult basic education case study constituted the participants in the learners' focus group for the research and made the following statements about the impact of development education on their lives:

“More knowledge made me feel more powerful” (learner focus group participant A).

“I felt as though I could talk about things with my family or friends without feeling stupid” (leaner focus group participant B).

According to tutors consulted in the case studies, this agency fostered confidence, assisted engagement in the learning process and led to participants taking action to address both local and global issues. The learners themselves brainstormed most of the forms of active citizenship carried out across the case study groups. According to evaluations carried out for the programmes spotlighted in the case studies, development education also fostered participants’ insight into their own lives and communities, developed self-esteem and increased interest in the skills elements of the programmes. To demonstrate this, below is one tutor’s summarised observation of her learners in a life skills programme for former drug users, and their feedback from a participatory evaluation done with them at the end of the programme:

“Given their own drug use, they could understand the connections and consequences [of the drug trade in other countries] very clearly. They could understand why there might be poverty, violence and devastation in (for example) Colombia and Afghanistan. Trying to get off drugs, to lead a healthier, happier and less anti-social lifestyle was a big step towards active citizenship. Taking responsibility for their lives and families was a way of becoming active, engaged members of society. The skills practised by the participants in the course included literacy, social skills, listening skills, problem-solving, thinking and reflecting, discussion, decision-making and time management”.

It was evident from the case studies that an exploration of global issues, injustice and inequality using development education methodologies can have wide-ranging and transformative impacts on adult learners. Overall, the research concluded that there is latent potential in the adult and community education sector to integrate development education in an embedded fashion.

## Conclusion

For development educators or organisations that would like to begin to focus on supporting adult and community education providers to engage adult learners in development education this research provides a number of recommendations set out in Table 4.

The ideas, findings and recommendations presented here are a small part of a much larger research report. Interested readers should go to <http://www.aontas.com> to download a full copy of the report. The hope is that this article has assisted development educators to see the potential for them to encourage and support development education in adult and community education provision in Ireland and has provided advice as how it could be done. The article also aimed to show that integrating a critical development education in adult and community education can help to hold a space for adult learning which fosters critical awareness, analysis and active global citizenship for learners.

Table 4. Recommendations for integrating development education into adult and community education

- Lobby vocational education committees (VECs) to present development education to their constituencies as a possible consideration for the next education plan for the VEC area;
- At local level, contact your community education facilitator or adult literacy organiser or local area-based partnership to see if they are interested in promoting or integrating development education themes in their work;
- Identify local champions of development education, such as expert practitioners or innovative projects, and promote them to the VEC or adult and community education providers in your area;
- Identify where the responsibility for continuing professional development (CPD) is held in your local VEC and lobby those stakeholders to integrate development education and critical analysis into their training programmes;
- Bring your ideas about integrating development education into adult and community education to the Irish Development Education Association (IDEA) and see what is happening at a national level; and
- If you have a third level provider locally that trains adult and community educators ask if they integrate development education into that training and promote its value in training for adult and community educators.

## References

Andreotti, V (2006) 'Soft versus critical global citizenship education' in *Policy & Practice: A Development Education Review*, Issue 3, pp. 40-51.

AONTAS, *Community Education: AONTAS Policy Series*, Dublin, 2000.

AONTAS (2004) *Community Education 2004*, AONTAS, Dublin.

Baptiste, I (2001) 'Educating Lone Wolves: pedagogical Implications of Human Capital Theory' in *Adult Education Quarterly*, Vol. 51, 3, pp. 184-201.

Birzėa, C, Kerr, D, Mikkelsen, R, Froumin, I, Losito, B, Pol, M & Sardoc, M (2004) All European Study on Policies for Education for Democratic Citizenship, Council of Europe, [www.coe.int](http://www.coe.int).

Ceccini, M (2003) 'Active Citizenship, Adult Learning and Active Citizenship, Lifelong Learning and Active Citizenship', keynote speech at the European Association for the Education of Adults (EAEA) Conference, Cyprus.

Commission of the European Communities (2005) *Proposal for a Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council on Key Competences for Lifelong Learning*, Brussels.

Development Education Exchange in Europe Project (DEEEP) (2007) *The European Consensus on Development: the Contribution of Development Education and Awareness-Raising*, DEEEP, Brussels: [www.deeep.org](http://www.deeep.org).

Department of Education and Science (DES) (2008a) *The Development and State of the Art of Adult Learning and Education in Ireland*, DES, Ireland.

Department of Education and Science (DES) (2008b) unpublished statistics on profile of community education learners funded through the ALCE Budget.

Expert Group on Future's Skills Needs (2007) *Tomorrow's Skills: Towards a National Skills Strategy*, Dublin.

Giroux, HA (2004) 'Neoliberalism and the Demise of Democracy: Resurrecting Hope in Dark Times': [www.dissidentvoice.org](http://www.dissidentvoice.org).

Glastra, FJ, Hake, BJ & Schedler, PE (2004) 'Lifelong Learning as Transitional Learning' in *Adult Education Quarterly*, Vol. 54, 4.

Government of Ireland (2000) *White Paper on Lifelong Learning*, Government Stationary Office, Dublin.

Grummel, B (2007) 'The 'Second Chance' Myth: Equality of Opportunity in Irish Adult Education Policies' in *British Journal of Educational Studies*, Vol. 55, 2, pp. 182-201.

Irish Aid (2007) *Development Education Strategy Plan: Promoting Public Engagement for Development*, Government Stationary Office, Dublin.

Irish Aid (2006) *White Paper on Irish Aid*, Government Stationary Office, Dublin.

Kegan, M (1999) 'The Impact of Research on Policy' in Coffield, F (ed) *Speaking Truth to Power: Research and Policy in Lifelong Learning*, The Policy Press, UK.

Khoo, SM (2006) 'Development Education, citizenship and civic engagement at third level and beyond in the Republic of Ireland' in *Policy & Practice: a Development Education Review*, Vol 3, Autumn 2006.

Mark, R (2007) 'Too Many Left Behind, Can Current Policy on Adult Literacy Address the Need for Social Change in Ireland?' in *The Adult Learner: the Irish Journal of Adult and Community Education*, 2007.

Naidoo, K (2005) 'Citizenship, Education and Governance in a Global Context', Speech for AONTAS Citizen Learner Conference.

Najmudin, R (2004) 'The Global Dimension in Neighbourhood Community Work in Britain' in *The Development Education Journal*, Vol. 10, 2.

Knowles, M. et al (2005) *The Adult Learner - the Definitive Classic in Adult Education and Human Resource Development*, Elsevier, U.S.A.

Osler, A (1994) 'Introduction: the Challenges of Development Education' in Council of Europe, *Development Education: Global Perspectives in the Curriculum*, Cassel.

Robson, C (2002) *Real World Research*, Blackwell Publishing, UK.

Rost, J (2004) 'Competences for Global Learning' in *The Development Education Journal*, Vol. 11, 1.

Scottish Executive (2003) *Think Global, Act Local: International Education in Communities*, The Stationary Office, Scotland.

Task Force on Active Citizenship (2007) *The Concept of Active Citizenship*, Secretariat of the Taskforce, Dublin.

Toepfer, B (2003) 'Global Education in Adult and Vocational Education - why is it a must in the 21st Century?' in *The Development Education Journal*, Vol. 9, 2, pp. 15-17.

White, R (2004) 'Adult Education and Teilhardian Thought: contextualising Socialisation into Globalisation' in *New Horizons in Adult Education*, Vol. 18, 1, p. 17.

**Natasha Bailey** is an independent research consultant who was contracted by AONTAS to carry out the piece of research described here. Her academic background is in gender studies and communications. She has 10 years of experience in the adult and community education sector in Ireland delivering, managing and training in both those sectors. She is particularly interested in researching and mapping the non-economic benefits of learning such as civic and social engagement, including the potential of adult and community education to foster active citizenship, self-esteem, resilience and critical awareness of learners.



## GROUNDING HIGHER EDUCATION IN THE COMMUNITY: THE CASE OF WATERFORD WOMEN'S CENTRE & WATERFORD INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

In 2004, a group of women engaged in a developmental educational programme in the Waterford Women's Centre (WWC) sought educational progression that would maintain a particular way of learning and teaching. WWC had been involved in the design of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development with the Waterford Institute of Technology (WIT) in 1996, and requested permission to deliver the course in a new partnership arrangement. In this article **Eleanor D'alton, Mary Fenton, Helen Maher and Maeve O'Grady** chart the evolution of the learning partnership between WWC and WIT, evaluate this innovative partnership and summarise the key findings of research undertaken to evaluate the course from the perspective of the main stakeholders. These stakeholders included course participants, lecturers, the co-ordinator, WWC management and steering committee and WIT's academic staff.

The authors highlight good practice in this learning partnership whilst also taking cognisance of the key recommendations to enhance the delivery, operations and management of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development and to formalise the relationship between WIT and WWC. Moreover, the article identifies opportunities for the partnership to be extended internationally in tandem with Tanzanian Women's groups, partners of WWC. It informs both the community and higher education sectors of how effective and sustainable learning partnerships can be created, nurtured and sustained.

### **Introduction: From going round in circles to finding a way forward**

This relationship between the Waterford Women's Centre and Waterford Institute of Technology began in 1995 with the question: how were community activists, engaged in personal and community development work in disadvantaged areas in the region, to gain a qualification that would reflect the work and values of the sector?

The question of access to qualifications had been identified in Mary B. Kelly's (1994) research that showed the problem for women of exclusion from higher education opportunities. The research showed that women engaged in voluntary community work could not afford or were not in a position to leave

their families and take up full-time places in higher education, yet these same women availed of community-based training because it was accessible although it offered no certification. This situation came to a head in the early 1990s as development funding for anti-poverty work became available to disadvantaged communities. The activists who organised groups and submitted funding applications were then rejected for the paid community work jobs that were created, because the jobs went to applicants with academically-recognised qualifications. To add insult to injury, these same voluntary workers were expected to train the newly employed graduates. The wider contemporary context to this marginalisation is considered in the next section.

### **The development of women's groups**

The contemporary development of women's groups in the Republic of Ireland originates in the 1980s, a time of social upheaval where reactions to calls for greater independence and equality for women were met with a backlash of misogynistic referenda and legislation. Linda Connolly (2003) tells the story of the women's liberation movement in the Republic, and Tom Inglis (1994) considered the 'rupture' that motivated many women to form support groups and plan their development through a learning-approach. The motto 'no crèche, no class' began to be heard in the movement for adult daytime education.

By the 1990s, the Department of Social Welfare was providing small grants to locally-based women's groups, enabling them to identify their training needs and pay for programmes and childcare. Community education gradually became established as the accessible means for women's development work. 'Community', according to Powell and Geoghegan (2004), serves as a catch-all concept because it encompasses many different meanings. In addition, the connection with the Department's Scheme of Grants meant that women who could not afford course fees could join consciousness-raising groups. For the first time, access to feminist ideas became more democratic. Community development projects and programmes were created that addressed the needs of less-privileged women.

In 1995, there was a call for applications to the European Social Fund's New Opportunities for Women (NOW) programme. This programme specifically aimed to increase the numbers of women accessing training, education and employment opportunities. A network of women's groups in the south-east region of Ireland identified an area of common concern – the lack of

access to qualifications. They formed a partnership with the Waterford Institute of Technology (WIT), formerly known as Waterford Regional Technical College ('the College'), as the higher education provider to design and deliver a National Certificate in Community Education and Development for voluntary activists.

### **Formation stage: Genesis of a partnership**

The network had researched all available qualifications in higher education in the Republic, and barriers of time, travel or methodology existed in all cases. The target group of women needed an opportunity to study on a part-time basis, and combine study with their community work and family life. The established practice at that time in the Republic required a student to be able to put the rest of their life aside and concentrate on academic study, while working-class women were not in a position to do that because the opportunity cost of pursuing higher education in this manner was far too high. A pathway to third-level qualifications had to be found that could reflect a working-class woman's life.

The Waterford Institute of Technology was one of the first Irish third-level institutions to establish an academic Department of Adult and Continuing Education to cater to the needs of mature learners accessing third-level education. The Department interpreted the mandate of the College to meet the needs of employers by creating courses that qualified workers for new forms of employment. It provided adult learners with access to courses they needed to study: its Educational Development Centre, for example, pioneered a foundation course for adult learners, a training course for tutors of adults, and piloted the first Adult Educational Guidance Service in the Republic. The Department's work with adults resulted in its taking a leading role amongst the Colleges in developing mechanisms for the Recognition of Prior (and Experiential) Learning (APL). The Department's courses were designed in a modular framework, years ahead of the developments in the National Qualifications Framework. The Department had established a reputation for creating access routes for adults, which had the added benefit of being a local programme.

The theoretical framework for community education and development work characteristic of the members in the network is feminism and Freirean praxis, of the type described in Brid Connolly's (2008) *Adult Learning in Groups*. Personal and group development is facilitated through critical discussions, reflecting Freire's *conscientization* (1972). The personal and the

political are linked, and an analysis of power is central. There is a sceptical view of the state and its enterprises, with the 'who benefits' question being brought to any new experience. Relationships of trust are not assumed; they need to be created over time.

In 1995, the College was requested to consult with the community sector as an employer, and with the network as the key partner to design a National Certificate in Community Education and Development. The course was submitted to the National Council for Educational Awards and approved, along with a follow-on year for a National Diploma. These awards under the new National Qualifications Framework are now offered as a Higher Certificate and an Ordinary Degree, respectively. A follow-on Honours Degree was designed and delivered in recent years, as funds became available. The result of this partnership was the development of a suite of accredited courses in Community Education and Development which would enhance opportunities for community activists and volunteers, particularly women, accessing employment within their community.

The network of women's groups, currently known as the ACCESS 2000 NOW Project, targeted and supported voluntary women activists' applications for the course, and provided additional support for mentoring. The women who applied were confident community workers, but were not necessarily confident about their academic skills. The Department was willing to work with tutors recommended by the Project and support them in learning and implementing the assessment processes.

The first independent evaluation of the course (Blackmore & Heynen, 1998) described the learning that benefited three parties: the students, the Project, and the College. The learning garnered informally and non-formally was integrated within formal processes, through negotiation, compromise and agreement. By the time the first National Certificate in Community Education and Development course had been completed, all of the students had achieved paid employment which helped to build the reputation of the course.

The ACCESS 2000 NOW Project retained its relationship with WIT and the course, sometimes as a very active partner with Project workers as students on the follow-on stages of the course, and at other times simply inputting on changes or new directions for the course. Since the graduation of the first cohort, WIT has appointed a co-ordinator and lecturers to the course which enabled many community groups to avail of the course in their own

locality. Research carried out in 2003 established that 163 students had completed full courses, and an additional 53 had studied in modules from the courses in Waterford but mostly in outreach centres located in Wexford, Carlow, Kilkenny, Tipperary, Westmeath, Portlaoise, Newbridge and Nenagh. A total of nine locations were used in addition to the College campus, enabling people in Wexford, Westmeath, Roscommon, Laois/Offaly and Kildare to participate. These outreach centres were all areas without a third-level institution offering educational progression by ACCS (accumulation of credits and certification system) mode and follow-on certificates and diplomas (Deane, Lally & O'Grady, 2003).

### **Stabilising stage: After the pilot project**

In 2000, the ACCESS 2000 Project came to the end of its NOW Project. From the ashes of this phase rose two separate organisations: ACCESS 2000 Wexford, and Waterford Women's Centre. Both focused on early engagement and personal and community development courses for women marginalised by a range of structural factors. As two of the few organisations able to offer childcare support, they have grown in order to meet the demand for supportive courses for women. These courses are funded by the Department of Social and Family Affairs and FÁS, the State training agency, and the course providers are core-funded by (the soon-to-be dismantled) Community Development Programme from the Department of Community, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs.

This type of feminist group work practice was recognised by the Department of Education and Science in its White Paper on Lifelong Learning (2000) for its specifically ideological nature and its ability to engage marginalised communities and adults who lack the confidence to participate in formal adult learning opportunities. The ability to participate in community-based courses builds confidence; however, confidence to engage in further and higher education requires an even bigger step in personal development.

WWC is located in close proximity to WIT's College Street campus. Some of its voluntary members and staff have either been lecturers in or graduates of (or both) the Department of Adult and Continuing Education in the Institute. Many participants in a pre-development course in the Women's Centre expressed a strong interest in undertaking further study. However, many participants did not feel ready to take the next step toward taking the modules of the course being offered in the Institute, although they were interested in

enrolling for the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development in the Women's Centre.

The notion of being able to take more responsibility for the running of the course had to be seriously considered by WWC and the Centre decided to apply to the Department of Adult and Continuing Education for permission to manage, co-ordinate and deliver the course within WWC. The Centre had amassed a considerable amount of expertise in different areas: understanding the needs of women's groups, and understanding the rigours of academic coursework, assessment and co-ordination. They were able to put their expertise to the test in early 2004 when a group of women from WIT, who had already participated in a developmental educational programme delivered by WWC, began seeking an educational progression to higher education that would maintain this particular way of learning and teaching. WWC requested WIT to be given the autonomy to deliver the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development course to women. In September 2004, WWC began the first WWC-based delivery of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development to a group of women who had experienced multiple barriers and obstacles to participation in education and training. Some 30 per cent of the course participants left full-time education after primary school (most of them aged over 40 years) and a further 55 per cent lacked upper second-level education. As a group, they were up until this point educationally disadvantaged.

### **Evaluation of partnership 2004-2007**

The Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development was delivered by WWC from 2004 to 2007 inclusive with the first cohort of women graduating in October 2007. Anecdotally, the delivery of the course appeared to be successful; however, both WWC and WIT were anxious to conduct an independent evaluation of the course. In June 2008, an independent evaluator was appointed to evaluate the delivery of the course and to examine the following:

- The participants' overall learning experience;
- The flexibility and user-friendliness of the course approach and delivery;
- The modules and subject matter covered in terms of their relevance to participants' community work practice;
- The modes of assessment used;

- The lecturers' overall learning experience;
- The experiences of the course co-ordinator;
- Quality assurance issues;
- Outreach and pre-development requirements; and
- Feedback from the participants and course facilitators regarding the relationship between WWC and WIT; the level of service from WIT's School of Education and Professional Development and its Community Education Section; and access to WIT student services such as the library.

The evaluation highlighted good practice in the innovative, sensitive and women-friendly delivery of the course. Moreover, it identified how WWC had succeeded in providing a pathway to a third-level qualification for the women by:

- Adapting the delivery of the course to meet the needs of the women;
- Creating the space and a safe learning environment for women to engage with new knowledge;
- Acknowledging the lived experience of the women;
- Facilitating the women to find their voice and allow them to be heard;
- Adopting an integrated approach to the course delivery;
- Developing creative assessment strategies which are real to the women; and
- Integrating the learning into everyday community work of the women.

The evaluation concluded that WWC consistently demonstrated an openness to innovative approaches to course delivery and assessment methods. In addition, WWC placed a strong emphasis on the process of shared and collective learning as a key feature of the course facilitation. Consequently, participants felt that they had benefitted considerably from the group-based mutual learning and shared experiences. The delivery methods also created an environment in which there was a reduction in the distinctions between the 'teacher' and the 'taught'. Given the participatory nature of the learning, the emphasis was on drawing from participants' own knowledge and experience, which in turn had the effect of creating a shared learning space, considered a facilitated style of education rather than the traditional teacher/student relationship. The evaluator stressed the importance of engendering a supportive learning environment and culture which values collective and interdependent learning rather than independent and sometimes competitive learning.

The course delivery was very learner-centred with a focus on building the capacity of participants to take ownership for their own learning. It was evident that the approach was both consultative and democratic from the learners' perspective. The modes of assessment were innovative and creative, and they helped to develop a broad range of skills. Reflecting on the overall course, a lecturer noted that:

“The participants got skills: new academic skills, powerful recognition and validation through the assessment process; submitting and getting a mark is a transformative experience for someone who doesn't have that confidence and they worked and earned those marks. They got a framework for their experiences and in terms of the most significant impact it was hearing what the quietest person had to say, when a person has not had that opportunity and then they get it, it is the one that has most impact on me when I see it”.

In general, the partnership between WIT and WWC was a partnership of equals which helped to support the innovative practices. This partnership was based on trust, mutual respect and shared experience of working together since 1996.

### **Performing stage: Formalising the relationship**

Notwithstanding the many positive features of the WIT and WWC learning partnership, the evaluator strongly recommended that the relationship needed to be formalised. To this end, both WWC and WIT developed and signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) in spring 2009, which outlines the main duties, responsibilities and expectations of both organisations with regard to the delivery and management of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development. The MOU states that WIT is responsible for the academic management of the course, in consultation with WWC, including: curriculum development; agreement of assessment criteria; the appointment of an external examiner; and the overall academic quality assurance of the Higher Certificate. WWC is responsible for the overall operations and day-to-day management of the course including: recruiting students; appointing and paying for a course co-ordinator to administer the course; appointing lecturers; and identifying the training needs of lecturers.

Both WIT and WWC meet once per semester as a part of a course board, which is comprised of WIT's Head of Department of Adult and



Continuing Education, the WWC steering group and facilitators of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development. A co-ordinator reports on students' progress and feedback from the lecturers and provides a written annual report highlighting the key issues of the course during the academic year which is forwarded to the Academic Council.

The MOU has succeeded in articulating the roles and responsibilities of both WWC and WIT and thus served to strengthen their ongoing relationship. A second cohort is currently pursuing the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development in the Womens' Centre and this group is benefitting from the lessons learned from the first delivery of the course. In a recent programmatic review of the Department of Adult and Continuing Education (November 2009), WWC took a leading role in informing the redesign of syllabi and assessment for the course. This proves that WWC is playing a key role in informing course design and that there is a real dialogue and symbiosis between both WIT and WWC with both partners working together to enhance the course.

## Conclusion

WWC's delivery of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development is based on a model of community education that is transformative in its approach. It is reflective of the characteristics of women's community education (Healy as cited by WERRC, 2001) with the following indicators:

- A woman-centred agenda;
- Community development principles and processes;
- Grounded in and attracting participation in community development;
- Identifying and exploring community needs;
- Promoting a sense of community identity;
- Providing opportunities for social inclusion;
- Contributing to building organisational capacity; and
- Strengthening solidarity networks.

With its sensitivity to the needs of the women and creativity in the course delivery, WWC has succeeded in providing a real pathway to higher education for women who traditionally did not engage with higher education.

The Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development has supported participants to become effective community development practitioners; this is reinforced by the fact that many of the participants are now working in the community and voluntary sector. It is also evident that the success of the course is based on the approach that was undertaken by the WWC and the fact that this approach was supported and facilitated by WIT's Department of Adult and Continuing Education.

Both WWC and WIT believe that such a partnership model is widely applicable, particularly in developing leadership in marginalised communities and challenging inequality in education and enhancing access to third-level. This model recognises the positive impact of locating the learning experience in a non-institutional environment and within a culture and ethos that critically reflects on the barriers to participation and works to remove these barriers. Through its links with a women's project, WWC is currently investigating the feasibility of delivering the course in Tanzania.

## References

- Blackmore, L & Heynen, M (1998) *Evaluation of ACCESS 2000*, Final Report on the NOW Project 1996-1998.
- Connolly, B (2008) *Adult Learning in Groups*, Open University Press, Maidenhead.
- Connolly, L (2003) *The Irish Women's Movement: From Revolution to Devolution*, Lilliput Press, Dublin.
- Deane, A, Lally, J, & O'Grady, M (2003) *Research on Educational Disadvantage: Interventions for Mature Students in Waterford Institute of Technology*.
- Freire, P (1972) *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, Penguin, Harmondsworth.
- Department of Education & Science (2000) *Learning for Life: White Paper on Lifelong Learning*, Government Stationery Office, Dublin.
- Inglis, T 'Women and the Struggle for Daytime Adult Education in Ireland' in *Studies in the Education of Adults*, Vol. 26, 1 April 1994, pp.50-66.
- Kelly, MB (1994) *Can You Credit It: Implications of Accreditation for Learners and Groups in the Community Sector*, Combat Poverty Agency, Dublin.
- Powell, F & Geoghegan, M (2004) *The Politics of Community Development*, A & A Farmer, Dublin.

WERRC (2001) *At the Forefront: The Role of Women's Community Education in Combating Poverty and Disadvantage in the Republic of Ireland*, Aontas, Dublin.

**Eleanor D'alton** is the Waterford Women's Centre co-ordinator of the Higher Certificate in Community Education and Development and she works closely with WIT. Eleanor has extensive experience in education, focusing on educational disadvantage and community education. She is currently pursuing a Masters in Education.

**Mary Fenton** is Head of Department of Adult and Continuing Education at Waterford Institute of Technology with responsibility for managing the Department's undergraduate and postgraduate teaching and research portfolio. Mary is currently pursuing doctoral research into the efficacy of entrepreneurship education in Irish Institutes of Technology.

**Helen Maher** is an Associate Lecturer of Community Education and Development within WIT's Department of Adult and Continuing Education. Helen has extensive national and international experience in research and lecturing in community development, cultural diversity and gender equality in the context of lifelong learning.

**Maeve O'Grady** is a founder member of Waterford Women's Centre. She liaised between the Women's Centre and Waterford Institute of Technology at the development stages of the course, and is an Associate Lecturer with the WIT's Adult and Continuing Education Department. Maeve is pursuing doctoral research into the impact of participating in women's community education courses on identity.

# Perspectives

## BEST PRACTICE IN NORTH-SOUTH RESEARCH RELATIONSHIPS IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE IRISH AFRICAN PARTNERSHIP MODEL

Mary Goretti Nakabugo, Eimear Barrett, Peter McEvoy & Ronaldo Munck

Various partnerships and international research networks linking Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in the global North and South have emerged in the past decades, as an expression of higher education's contribution to international development, and of the need to bridge the North/South knowledge divide. Such partnerships have contributed to enhanced human and infrastructural capacity, as well as to a better integration of the Southern partners in international exchanges. Nevertheless, they have also been criticised for focusing too much on the one-directional 'transfer' of capacity from North to South, at the expense of *genuine* partnership working, mutual learning and responsiveness to need. Furthermore, the challenge of nurturing long term mutual partnerships has frequently proved to be at odds with the shorter-term timelines of most donor-funded programmes. A recent Irish-based partnership attempts to address some of these problems. Drawing on the preliminary results of a stakeholder consultation that was undertaken in thirteen partner universities, we illustrate the potential mutual benefits from partnerships in higher education that stress capacity building in both North and South. The challenges associated with the model and the strategies instituted to achieve a mutual and sustainable partnership are also highlighted.

### Introduction

Historically, many philanthropic organisations and development agencies have sought to facilitate North – South university collaborations, to help tackle issues that mainly affect the global South, such as hunger, ill-health, illiteracy, conflict, human rights abuse, and environmental degradation (see Samoff & Carrol, 2002; Bradley, 2007 for comprehensive reviews of some of the major actors in this field). Within Ireland, new impetus for inter-institutional research for development came in 2006 with the launch of a *Programme of Strategic Cooperation between Irish Aid and Higher Education and Research Institutes 2007-2011*. In an earlier phase, the Irish bilateral aid programme had

supported institutional linkages between Ireland and Africa in the 1980s and early 1990s via an all-island higher education collective, called HEDCO; its emphasis was on capacity building for teaching and learning, as distinct from collaborative research.

In response to an open call for proposals, eight projects across the disciplinary spectrum received funding awards, generally for three years. One such project is the Irish African Partnership for Research Capacity Building (IAP), supported by Universities Ireland, under which all nine universities (University College Cork (UCC), University College Dublin (UCD), National University of Ireland Galway (NUIG), National University of Ireland Maynooth (NUIM), Trinity College Dublin (TCD); Dublin City University (DCU), University of Limerick (UL), Queen's University Belfast (QUB) and University of Ulster (UU)) on the island of Ireland are linked in partnership with four universities in Malawi, Mozambique, Tanzania and Uganda in a pilot research capacity-building initiative, with poverty reduction as the over-arching goal. It aims to develop a coordinated approach to building research capacity both within Africa ('South') and Ireland ('North').

Notwithstanding the significant contribution of earlier North-South partnerships to enhancing research capacity in the South (Gaillard, 1994), a number of weaknesses have been identified. Their impact on research capacity building has often related more to individual capacity building rather than at an institutional level (Velho, 2002). The rationale for most North-South partnerships has also been narrowly focused on addressing capacity gaps in the South and less on the learning and building of capacity within Northern counterparts (King, 2008). North-South partnerships have also been largely managed from outside the developing countries, and their sustainability has been donor-dependent. In addition, while principles of good partnership practice have existed for decades (for example, United Nations, 1979), the actual nurturing of mutually-beneficial North-South partnerships still remains a challenge not least because the '...asymmetry between partners remains the principal obstacle to productive research collaboration' (Bradley, 2007:2).

In view of the challenges and weaknesses identified above, it is clear that there is considerable room for improvement in terms of fostering genuine partnerships where the learning is mutual and HEIs in the North and South view each other as inter-dependent actors within the global knowledge economy. Such a partnership approach is an aspiration of the IAP.

## The Irish-African Partnership for Research Capacity Building (IAP): An overview

In bringing all the nine universities on the island of Ireland together with four universities in Malawi (University of Malawi), Mozambique (Universidade Eduardo Mondlane), Tanzania (University of Dar-es-Salaam) and Uganda (Makerere University), the IAP aims to advance effective policies and strategies for sustainable research capacity building within the thirteen partner universities in the areas of health and education, with gender and information and communication technologies (ICT) as cross-cutting themes. In the Irish context, the all-island character of the IAP is seen as a distinctive attribute which serves to enrich the growing inter-institutional collaborations across both jurisdictions.

The work of the IAP comprises several interlocking components:

- Five residential workshops: three in Africa and two in Ireland, at which researchers and administrators from the partner institutions meet in thematic dialogue;
- A ‘foresight’ exercise to identify the main health and education priorities in Africa over the next 10 years around which specific partnerships could be developed;
- The formulation of a set of quantitative and qualitative metrics to help to gauge the progress of research capacity in the partner institutions, and beyond; and
- Development of a digital repository and research register to provide a prototype online platform for African and Irish researchers working together in the future.

Another key activity of the project was a *stakeholder consultation*, designed to assess existing research capacity in the partner universities, identify barriers to future research capacity and jointly devise ways to overcome these barriers. Fieldwork for the consultation research extended over a five month period in 2008, and involved individual and group interviews with over 300 research and senior administration staff throughout all partner institutions.

Drawing on the preliminary results of this empirical research, this paper illustrates the mutual benefits associated with a higher education

partnership ethos that stresses balanced capacity building in both North and South institutions. The challenges associated with the model and the strategies instituted to achieve a mutual and sustainable partnership within the IAP are also highlighted.

### **The IAP: A mutually beneficial partnership?**

The stakeholder consultation proved to be a valuable exercise of the IAP and, arguably, for the wider development community in Ireland. It provided the opportunity for dialogue, transparency and clarification of partners' needs and expectations at inception.

One anticipated advantage of the partnership was the ability to facilitate multi-disciplinary research engagement, especially between the sciences and the humanities. There was a recognition that research needed to become increasingly multi-disciplinary, prompted by emphasis on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) (education, health, food and livelihood security, etc), and cross-cutting issues such as gender, environment, and human rights. It was therefore hoped that the IAP would enable scientists, engineers and researchers in the humanities to become more attuned to the need for global approaches to the prevailing challenges posed by climate change, environmental degradation, energy shortage, sustainable food production, and disease eradication.

It was also agreed that a structured Irish-African research partnership would broaden research funding opportunities. Recognising that most development research funding agencies are interested in North-South and South-South initiatives, opportunities to engage in collaborative research activities are increasingly promising and these can be linked to development outcomes and improved quality of life. At the same time, such opportunities not only provide a cross-cultural learning dimension, but also build the capacity of Irish and African researchers as a result of joint hands-on experience.

Both Irish and African counterparts also saw the partnership as a great learning experience that would improve the effectiveness of their staff and (ultimately) benefit their students. African partners hoped to benefit from resource and equipment sharing as well as accessing Masters, PhD and Postdoctoral fellowship opportunities that might exist in Irish institutions. Conversely, Irish academics were attracted by prospects of getting good doctoral

students, sharing research samples and accessing student placements where necessary. These differing perspectives indicated a certain divergence in expectations on either side, and suggest that for some partners, their participation in the network was at least partly self-interested, motivated more by what they could get out of the partnership than what they could give to it.

Rather than denying the reality of this divergence, it serves rather to highlight the need to imbed capacity building programmes into the partnership, so as to enhance a shared understanding of mutuality that went beyond short-term extrinsic benefits to long-term intrinsic gains that would in future lead to own knowledge production and sharing on both sides.

### **Towards a mutual partnership within IAP: Prospects and challenges**

From its inception, participation and engagement of the Northern and Southern counterparts in project management and implementation has been a major focus of the IAP, albeit not without challenges.

The IAP is governed by an Executive Committee (EC), on which all 13 universities are represented along with Universities Ireland/Centre for Cross Border Studies. It meets monthly, with a facility for teleconferencing. Co-chairing of the Executive Committee is shared between a Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland and an African representative. However, it has not been possible to secure participation of all the African representatives via telephone or Skype at every meeting. It was therefore agreed that the Dublin-based Irish co-chair would, after the event, brief each of the African partners not present to update them on all discussions and decisions. In addition, the two project researchers attend every EC meeting in person, and since one of these is Ugandan, there is a guaranteed African physical presence and voice at every meeting.

Whereas all four IAP project work packages are led by Irish counterparts, efforts have been made to ensure the involvement of African stakeholders in their implementation. For example, the Foresight work package involved identification of priorities in education and health, and sought significant input from a cross-section of stakeholders in the four partner African universities. The Stakeholder Consultation work package also involved very wide consultation with African academics in the partner universities (75 from Makerere; 35 from Eduardo Mondlane; 33 from Malawi; 30 from Dar es Salaam). The Metrics work package involved consultations with the Directors



of Research in the partner African institutions whose views fed into the draft instrument (currently being piloted at time of writing). Similarly, the development of the Web Portal work package drew from examples of work undertaken by African and Irish counterparts in the development of the prototype digital repository.

Two of the four workshops to-date, which have been central to the IAP's international work, have been hosted by African institutions. In addition, an African institution will host a residential 'Summer School' scheduled for March 2010 in Malawi (dedicated to skills training in effective research management). Similarly, workshop programmes are developed and delivered by Irish-African teams. This kind of sharing has been highly rated by the Southern partners as a means of fostering ownership.

### **Looking to the future: Is IAP sustainable?**

One of the most critical issues for the IAP has been the sustainability of the project beyond the pilot phase. In the following section, we outline four strategies that have been developed as a means of sustaining the work of IAP.

Firstly, arising from the IAP's third workshop in Maputo, Mozambique, research clusters have been formed based on the priority research themes that emerged from the Foresight work package. They include three education research groups, whose membership is made up of Irish and African academics from IAP partner universities, and co-led in each case by an Irish-African team. The three education clusters include ICT and Education, School Support for Student Teachers in Schools and Assessment in Teacher Education.

Dialogue is ongoing via a virtual discussion forum, with the ultimate aim of developing fundable proposals to enable Irish and African counterparts undertake research in collaboration in the future. Despite some early problems in activating the work of the health clusters, a group of individuals from the participating Irish and African universities have come together to respond to an European Union-Africa Framework call for proposals on building capacity for research in health. This group has prepared a proposal on building sustainable research capacity for safer health care in Africa alongside the World Health Organisation (WHO) and other European and African institutions.

Secondly, the Malawi 'Summer School' (March 2010) is seen very much as demand-led, and as a key milestone for the project. The Stakeholder

Consultation exercise described earlier revealed that African research personnel themselves felt disadvantaged in pursuing research opportunities by a deficit of 'process-related' skills. The Summer School has the potential to confer highly practical benefits that will build the capacity of the Southern partner institutions in particular, and is being held in response to a clearly identified need to equip research officers/research coordinators from the four partner institutions in Africa with improved skills for sourcing and managing research contract awards.

It will also help to promote greater articulation between academic and scholarly research on the one hand, and the wider poverty reduction, climate change, and MDG-related policy imperatives on the other. The key target audience is approximately 40 research officers/coordinators/supervisors at middle/senior management level, representing the disciplinary spectrum. Not only will they be enabled to more effectively compete for and manage research contracts, but they will also be expected to disseminate the key learning acquired during the workshop more widely within their institutions; towards this end, a manual and DVD of the training materials used will be produced after the event.

Thirdly, IAP believes that the achievement of a critical mass in all areas of development policy research will be greatly facilitated, and the outcomes of these activities will be greatly enhanced by, a more coordinated, sector-wide approach. IAP proposes therefore the establishment of a national-level platform in which all universities and institutes of technology (or other equivalent institutions) are invited to participate. This would embrace higher education institutions as members (rather than individual researchers or research groups), would seek affiliations with similar bodies internationally, and would work closely with Irish Aid and non-governmental organisations (NGOs), and with philanthropic organisations, both within Ireland and internationally. The platform would act as a stimulus to interdisciplinary and inter-institutional collaboration on research projects, and it would provide a conduit for sharing experience of initiatives such as undergraduate and postgraduate training. It is also hoped that it would act as an interface to the higher education international development sector for the governments of the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland, and would provide a policy development platform which would respond to the increasingly significant profile of development and globalisation issues on the political agenda. The key aspect of what is proposed is the creation of a 'system-level' approach to international development which would act a resource across the development sector and seek to provide leverage for further capacity building.

Finally, the IAP plans to engage with and deliver its key recommendations to policy makers within the HEIs and agencies such as Irish Aid and the European Universities Association (EUA), with the aim of influencing both local and international development policy.

## Interim conclusions

What has been presented here are essentially interim results from an ambitious project which is still underway. Conscious of past shortcomings in North/South research relationships, we have devised principles and procedures designed to lead to more equitable, responsive and sustainable relationships.

Although implementing these may not always be straightforward, one thing that has become clear is the urgent need to address the capacity of the North to engage in meaningful collaborations in development research for poverty reduction. To that end we are proposing an all-Ireland international development platform to empower this side of the equation in terms of ongoing partnerships with our existing and future Southern partners. Although North/South collaborative linkages will not alone ensure democratisation of knowledge generation, they are undoubtedly indispensable to this mission. In the longer term we will need to address systematically the obstacles to development research for poverty reduction in both the North and the South.

But that is a job for another day!

## References

Bradley, M (2007) *North-South Research Partnerships: Challenges, Responses and Trends—A Literature Review and Annotated Bibliography*, Working Paper 1, IDRC Canadian Partnerships Working Paper Series, International Development Research Centre, Ottawa.

Gaillard, JF (1994) 'North-South research partnership: Is collaboration possible between unequal partners?' in *Knowledge and Policy*, Vol. 7, 2, pp. 31-63.

King, K (2008) 'The promise and peril of partnership (editorial)' in King, K (ed.) *The politics of partnerships: Peril or promise*, NORRAG NEWS, No. 41 (Special Issue): [http://www.norrag.org/pdf/\\*NN41.THE%20POLITICS%20OF%20PARTNERSHIP.pdf](http://www.norrag.org/pdf/*NN41.THE%20POLITICS%20OF%20PARTNERSHIP.pdf).

Samoff, J & Carrol, B (2002) 'The promise of partnership and continuities of dependence: External support to Higher Education in Africa' in *Proceedings of the 45<sup>th</sup> Annual Meeting of the African Studies Association*, 5-8 December 2002, Washington.

United Nations, (1979) United Nations Conference on Science and Technology for Development, 20 August to 1 September 1979, Vienna.

Velho, L (2002) 'North-South collaboration and systems of innovation' in Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences *North-South Research Cooperation*, international conference, December 2001: <http://www.knaw.nl/publicaties/pdf/20021020.pdf>.

**Mary Goretti Nakabugo** is hosted by Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick, as the Postdoctoral Researcher in education for the Irish-African Partnership for Research Capacity Building (IAP). She is on leave from Makerere University, Uganda, where she is Senior Lecturer in the School of Education. She has previously worked as a Visiting Professor at the Centre for the Study of International Cooperation in Education, Hiroshima University, Japan (2006-2007) and as a Fellow of the Japan Foundation at Naruto University of Education (2008). Her research interests include curriculum reform, assessment for learning, education development and international cooperation in education.

**Eimear Barrett** is a Postdoctoral Researcher in health for the Irish African Partnership for Research Capacity Building (IAP). She is hosted within the Centre for Public Health at Queen's University Belfast. She was awarded a PhD in molecular biology from University of Ulster in 2006 and spent two years as a Scientific Advisor for an Irish clinical diagnostics company before joining the IAP in 2008. Her interests include health promotion and communicable disease control.

**Peter McEvoy** is Project Manager for the IAP. He has over 20 years' experience in the management of international development projects and programmes, especially in the areas of human resource development, training, organisational analysis and capacity building. Before joining the IAP team, he worked extensively (in 25 countries) as an independent development consultant on behalf of missionary bodies, NGOs, Irish Aid and other bilateral donors, and the European Commission. He has also served with Irish Aid as resident Country Programme coordinator in Lesotho. A graduate of Queen's University Belfast, he is the holder of a higher degree in Economics & Public Policy from Trinity College Dublin.

**Professor Ronaldo Munck**, is Co-Chair of the Executive Committee of the IAP, and is theme leader for internationalisation, interculturalism and social development at Dublin City University. Previously he was the first post-apartheid Chair in Sociology at the University of Durban-Westville in South Africa where he directed a major project on gender and empowerment. He has written widely on development issues, including *Critical Development Theory: Contributions to a New Paradigm* (London, Zed Books, 2000) and on his native Latin America, most recently *Contemporary Latin America* (London, Palgrave 2008). His recent work has focused on the impact of globalisation in *Globalisation and Labour: The new Great Transformation* (Zed Books, 2002); *Globalization and Social Exclusion: A Transformationalist Perspective* (Kumarian Press, 2005) and *Globalization and Contestation: The new great counter-movement* (Routledge, 2007). He is currently working on globalisation and migration in Ireland and edits the e-journal *Translocations* (<http://www.translocations.ie>).

# NAMING THE WORLD: COMING TO TERMS WITH COMPLEXITY

Helen Young

## Introduction

First world, third world; developed world, developing world; global North, global South; minority world, majority world. This terminology is constantly being debated and changed for various reasons, such as geographical inaccuracy and a questioning of the primacy that 'first world' implies. However, all these terms share an assumption that the world can be, or is, divided in two, which makes them problematic in any form. This article sets out why the two-worlds concept is not a useful way of understanding the world and argues that terminology which implies that the world can be clearly divided hinders global learning. It proposes that those working in global learning need to allow learners to develop a one-world concept which values all people and recognises inequality and injustice wherever it is found.

This discussion around the specific case of the two-worlds concept is also meant to highlight why it is essential that learners recognise the socially constructed nature of all conceptual frameworks, appreciating that they are frequently dependent on contexts and agendas. It is necessary to be open to using a variety of frameworks to understand issues from a range of perspectives.

## The limitations of the two-worlds concept

Perhaps the most obvious problem with the two-worlds concept occurs at the country level. There are an increasing number of countries which are hard to fit into either category. In the 1970s, the separation of countries into one category or another was still questionable but more clear: there were a group of countries which were mostly high on a range of indicators from wealth to life expectancy, and a group of countries which were mostly low on the same range of indicators. This is no longer the case, as there are an increasing number of countries which fall along the middle range on scales of these indicators, or rank highly on some and lower on others. For example, where should we place countries such as Bahrain, Brazil or Belarus? In a few years, China is likely to have the highest gross national product (GNP) globally but maintain a low per

capita GNP (Jacques, 2009); i.e. it will be a very rich country with a lot of poor people, a reality with which the two-worlds concept struggles.

One of the reasons for the persistence of the two-worlds concept is that a number of global learning organisations are funded by Ministries of International Development such as the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DfID). These organisations often adopt the model of their funder which divides the world into the donors and the recipients (even though a number of countries are actually both). Hence organisations such as DfID support activities such as 'North-South linking' that perpetuate the use of terminology promoting the two-worlds concept.

Tinker (2007) explains why he finds the North-South paradigm dangerous for international development, an explanation which is also useful for educators. He draws attention to the power of transnational corporations and financial bodies (another obvious addition would be international non-governmental organisations), the mass migration of people around the world, and the wealth of elites in countries where some of the poorest people in the world live. These are tangible reasons why the paradigm is not working but he also adds an important point relevant to learners' identities and world views:

“For the North, the North-South mentality is too often mere patronage, a 20<sup>th</sup> century version of noblesse oblige, a duty towards the less fortunate. Not wholly unworthy motives, but ones that are uncomfortably rooted in an illusion of superiority” (Tinker, 2007).

This is a major issue which is tackled elsewhere (Andreotti, 2007) but which needs consideration by educationalists to avoid approaches which lead to that illusion of superiority. For example, thinking about whether (or how) fundraising for people in other countries is done in educational contexts can be a useful starting point for considering how to avoid such an illusion.

Concepts which are useful in understanding history are not necessarily useful in working towards a better future. We certainly need to understand the past, including the horrors of the racial hierarchies constructed to justify slavery and colonialism, in order to understand modern day racism and globalisation. Exploring the two-worlds concept is critically important, therefore, for historical understanding. However, we need to develop forward-looking ways of seeing the world in order to change it.

## The needs of learners

Paulo Freire's work has provided an invaluable foundation for development education and global learning. He wrote at length about 'naming the world' (taken literally in the title of this article). He emphasised that the way we understand the world affects the way we change it, stating that, in problem-posing education, learners:

“...develop their power to perceive critically the way they exist in the world with which and in which they find themselves; they come to see the world not as a static reality, but as a reality in process, in transformation” (Freire, 1996:64).

However, the oppressed/oppressor dichotomy which forms a foundation of Freire's work, and which was arguably appropriate to the socio-economic context in which he was working, has been extrapolated to the global scale in learning based around the two-worlds concept. Young people need opportunities to develop a more complex understanding of globalisation and of global power relations than that provided by the two-worlds concept.

From a teaching point of view, using a two-worlds concept as a basis has a tendency to lead to a focus on difference between 'us' and 'them'. Making lists of opposites is always an easy teaching technique. However, using a two-worlds lens can lead to activities such as 'we live like this so how do you think *they* live?' with the assumption being that it will be the opposite. It tends to lead to an idea of a homogenous and exotic other. Education needs to move beyond focusing on difference between 'two worlds' and recognise diversity within countries and similarities between people from a range of countries.

A key element of global learning is recognising similarities between people in different countries and making the connections between the local, the national and the global. The two-worlds concept with its broad generalisations can exclude and devalue the experiences of people who suffer poverty and oppression in countries where this is not part of the generalised expectation. Learners need to understand the complex nature of power and consider the similarities and differences between different forms of oppression and the interrelationships between them.



Recognising diversity within countries (including their own) is as important as recognising diversity between them and in many countries this is increasing along a range of indicators (Rosling, 2009). It is very valuable to learn about stories of individuals and groups in distant localities but there always needs to be consideration by educators and learners about which aspects can be generalised from these stories (maybe insights about power, for example, rather than assumptions about lifestyles).

Global learning has always had as a central element the challenging of stereotypes. However, there is a danger that the two-worlds concept exacerbates the issues around representation. If young people are learning about the lives of students in a particular school in a particular place in Ghana, it is important that they recognise that the experiences of these young people are not representative of the whole of Ghana or of the whole of Africa. When learners are presented with the two-worlds concept, they are in danger of going even further and thinking that the particular experience of these young people is representative of the whole of the 'global South'.

We all need our stereotypes challenged and education certainly has an important role in presenting a range of images, including more positive images, of people and places that are negatively represented by the wider media. However, education can do much more than this. We need to build on learners' experience of having specific stereotypes challenged to develop their meta-understanding of stereotypes, not just the challenging of specific stereotypes. The two-worlds concept, by introducing an extreme generalisation, is not helping to address this. Learners need to understand how psychology and social structures lead to the development and acceptance of stereotypes in the first place, and how easily these can escalate into prejudice and discrimination. They need to recognise that we all use stereotyping as cognitive shortcuts to make sense of the world, but that cognitive shortcuts are an inadequate basis for greater understanding and for appropriate responses. Opportunities to discuss issues around the idea of representation, for example in what way one person can represent a group of people, need to be provided. Both educators and learners need to appreciate the relationship between individuals' constructions of their own identities and their constructions of 'the other'. They need to consider what social norms and constructions of difference existed in extreme situations such as Nazi Germany or Rwanda that allowed people to carry out evil acts (for further discussion of these issues, see Stainton Rogers, 2003).

## Conclusion

We will always need conceptual frameworks to describe the world, but when they no longer serve useful purposes, we need the flexibility to use others while always recognising that they are merely maps, not the actual territory. Learners need to fully understand Freire's (1996) key message in recognising the distinction between nature and culture and recognising that the conceptual frameworks we use are not 'natural', they are constructions which can help us to understand the world and which will always have limitations.

This article has argued that the two-worlds concept is doing more harm than good in helping us to understand the world and to change it for the better. To live in an interdependent world, which is unequal in numerous, overlapping and cross-cutting ways, we need a one-world concept which values all people as equals and explores the root causes of poverty and oppression wherever they are found.

## References

- Andreotti, V (2007) 'The contributions of postcolonial theory to development education' in *DEA Thinkpieces*: <http://www.dea.org.uk/getinvolved/thinkpieces.asp>.
- Freire, P (1996) (first published 1970) *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, Penguin, London.
- Jacques, M (2009) *When China Rules the World: The Rise of the Middle Kingdom and the End of the Western World*, Penguin, London.
- Rosling, H (2009) 'Gapminder': <http://www.gapminder.org>.
- Stainton Rogers, W (2003) *Social Psychology: Experimental and Critical Approaches*, Open University Press, Maidenhead.
- Tinker, J (2007) 'The Drum Beat 401 - Should We Dump the North-South Lens?' in *The Communication Initiative Network*: [http://www.comminit.com/drum\\_beat\\_401.html](http://www.comminit.com/drum_beat_401.html).

**Helen Young** is a doctoral student at the Institute of Education, London. She was formerly Policy and Research Manager at the Development Education Association.

# ART IMITATING REALITY: THE SCREENING AND NON-SCREENING OF THE FILM *BALIBO* AND THE ONGOING STRUGGLE FOR TRUTH RECOVERY AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN INDONESIA AND TIMOR-LESTE

Paul Hainsworth

## Introduction

This article is a ‘real to reel’ case study, focusing on the recent feature film *Balibo* (2009) directed by the Australian Robert Connolly. It is important to note that there is always a danger of underestimating the impact of a cultural artefact, when assessing it whilst the product is still gathering attention, analysis and controversy. At time of writing, *Balibo* (visit <http://www.balibo.com/>) certainly fits into this category since, as yet, it has enjoyed limited distribution globally and has been banned in Indonesia. The latter situation is very much part and parcel of the narrative surrounding *Balibo*. The film has already garnered considerable publicity in Indonesia, Timor-Leste and beyond, much of it because of the banning. This article, therefore, is not so much a detailed review of the film but more a commentary on its impact to date and an interim analysis of how the film and the discussion around it might serve the cause of human rights maintenance in Indonesia and Timor-Leste.

## History of Balibo

The title of the film is the name of a small town located 6 kilometres inside the Timor-Leste (East Timor) border from (Indonesian) West Timor. The town of Balibo has become synonymous with the 1975 invasion of the town by the Indonesian military and East Timorese forces loyal to it before occupying the territory of Timor-Leste, and the subsequent killing of six journalists. Amidst Indonesian (and their Western backers’) attempts to hush up the reality of the invasion of Timor-Leste, five journalists from Australia, Britain and New Zealand were tasked to investigate what was happening on the ground. Working for Australia’s Channel 7 and Channel 9, they travelled to Balibo only to meet their fate violently at the hands of incoming Indonesian forces. Subsequently, a sixth journalist, Australian Roger East, was also killed by the Indonesian military whilst endeavouring to set up an East Timor Press Agency.

East, the central character of the film, is played by Anthony LaPaglia, who invested a lot of personal time and initiative in the project.

### ***Balibo* and its criticisms**

The film, shot in Darwin and Timor-Leste, has been well-received by sympathetic and curious audiences. Moreover, the making, outcome and distribution of the film have enjoyed active support from the families and friends of the murdered journalists, who have been campaigning for truth and justice over what happened in Balibo for thirty-five years. The most prominent critic of the film has been John Pilger, the well-known investigative journalist and author. Pilger is justly renowned and widely praised for his ground breaking and influential documentary film, *Death of a Nation: the Timor Conspiracy* (1994), which brought the brutality of the Indonesian occupation and the suffering of the East Timorese to a global audience. For Pilger, *Balibo* fails to highlight the complicity and cover-up of the Australian government in the Balibo events. It seems some of the film script's earlier versions placed greater emphasis on this aspect prior to editing and revisions of the narrative.

Following a visit to Dili, *Balibo* director Connolly took the view that 'the story of us pursuing 34 years later in detail what was going on in Canberra became less relevant to me in my intention to tell the story of what happened in East Timor to the Timorese' (quoted in Koc, 2009). Pilger describes the film and its claim to be a true story as 'a travesty of omissions' and 'largely fictitious' (Pilger, 2009:10). Unsurprisingly, this viewpoint is not shared by Connolly, the film's producer John Maynard or historical advisor Clinton Fernandes. According to Fernandes:

"The competing demands of accuracy, concision and aesthetics mean that one has to decide in advance what to leave out, what to leave in, and how to re-enact certain events...We made some creative changes to get the best out of the unique advantage enjoyed by films - their ability to show you 'what it feels like to be there'" (Fernandes, 2009).

Another reviewer finds the film to be 'long on factual fidelity' and sees it rightly as not solely an account of a handful of journalists' deaths, serious enough as that is: 'it spreads its attention wide, to capture the full horror of what happened to East Timor in late 1975' (Byrnes, 2009). Indeed, 1975 was just the beginning of a quarter-century of brutal rule for the people of Timor-Leste and Balibo became a symbol of this reality.

*Balibo* is not a totally accurate reflection of the real situation. For instance, the character and on-screen movements of Roger East are re-imagined somewhat, as are the movement and location of some of the other characters and happenings. Notwithstanding Pilger's critique, it is questionable whether such examples of directorial *dirigisme* and *auteurship* detract from the film's overall thrust, integrity and sincerity. According to one reviewer, Bruce Honeywell:

“While honed to a partly fictional narrative to meet market expectations, the accounts of the deaths of the journalists and crew are chillingly accurate to the eyewitness accounts” (Honeywell, 2010).

Whatever the verdict on its accuracy, the film does not stand alone as an interpretation of the events that took place at the dawn of the Indonesian occupation of Timor-Leste. The film is based on the veteran Australian journalist Jill Jolliffe's book *Cover Up* (republished recently as *Balibo*), whilst other authors such as Tony Maniaty (2009) and Peter Cronau (2010) have covered various aspects of the occupation as well. What unites all the interpretations is an evidence-based conviction that the official version of events maintained by the Indonesian authorities and accepted or colluded in by other countries is not the reality of the events in *Balibo* in 1975 (Robinson, 2010). Indeed, as *Balibo* refused, or was not allowed, to 'go away', the quest for truth recovery and justice has continued.

## Demand for truth

For reasons of space, this article cannot examine the official enquiries, nor do justice to all the campaigning and other efforts to uncover the truth about *Balibo*. Significantly, such campaigning, lobbying, and re-visiting have proliferated even in recent times. For instance in Timor-Leste, The Report of the Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation (CAVR) in 2005 urged 'the governments of Australia, Britain and New Zealand [to] undertake a joint initiative to establish the truth about the deaths of six foreign journalists in Timor-Leste in 1975 so that the facts and accountability are finally established' (CAVR, 2005:159; Jolliffe, 2001; 2009; Dowson, 2005; Fernandes, 2004; Leadbeater, 2006; Robinson, 2009; Hainsworth, 2010). In 2007, in one of the case's most significant developments, an Australian New South Wales (NSW) coronial inquest found that the journalists had been killed deliberately by Indonesian military forces to cover up the invasion, rather than caught in

crossfire between rival East Timorese factions or executed by ‘rogue elements’, as originally claimed by Indonesia. In response to the NSW inquest, the Australian Federal Police (AFP) in September 2009 announced a further investigation into the Balibo killings with the Indonesian Special Forces (*Kopassus*) as the prime suspects. The Indonesian government has refused to cooperate with the investigation on the grounds that the case was closed and could be detrimental to bilateral relations.

The making, screening and banning of the film has arguably added to the pressure both at home and abroad for truth recovery and human rights maintenance in Indonesia and Timor-Leste. To date, in 2009 and 2010, the film has been screened in several countries including Australia, Britain, New Zealand, Timor-Leste, etc., at prominent international and human rights film festivals in London (twice), Melbourne, Palm Springs, Pusan, Santa Barbara, Toronto and Wellington. At screenings presented by international organisations such as Human Rights Watch and Amnesty International, those involved with the making of the film and Timorese spokespersons and people, family members of the Balibo victims, campaigning organisations and others have participated in question and answer sessions, and panels. In Timor-Leste, dubbed into the local Tetun language, the film enjoyed a week of screenings in the country’s capital, Dili, the scene of part of the film’s trajectory. At a special event in Dili, President José Ramos-Horta, a central figure in the film (played by Oscar Isaac), awarded the director and producer with the Presidential Medal of Merit for the film’s contribution to the country’s history and memory.

Subsequently, some re-branding of the film title has taken place – from *Balibo* to *The Balibo Conspiracy* – in order to make it more attractive to an audience in the USA and elsewhere.

### International effects of *Balibo*

Appropriately it is within Indonesia itself that the film has had a significant and specific impact. At time of writing, the film has not been screened officially in Indonesia, the country, or rather the regime, at the heart of the film’s narrative.

Despite some signs of the post-Suharto regime(s) opening up, the authorities have not been receptive to allowing the Jakarta International Film Festival to screen the film to the general public. The banning decision of the Indonesian Film Censorship Agency in effect gives further substance to the stated position of the Indonesian regime that Balibo is finished business.

However, the proscription of the film has opened up a hornet's nest of discontent and civil society opposition. In particular, the Alliance of Indonesian Journalists (AJI) contested the censor's ruling and prepared to challenge it in the courts. In early March 2010, the Jakarta chapter of the AJI filed a lawsuit against the censor, just a week or so before Indonesian President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono's state visit to Australia. In addition, following the ban, bootleg copies and screenings proliferated in the Indonesian capital. The *Jakarta Globe* reported on 14 December 2009 that the ban had encouraged various arts organisations and journalist groups, including the AJI and the Jakarta Foreign Correspondents' Club, to arrange private screenings for thousands of filmgoers. Shopkeepers reported high demand for pirated copies of the film. Clearly the banning backfired as the film attracted a growing interest and curiosity precisely because of the ban. Also in December 2009, a retired Indonesian army colonel, Gatot Purwanto, appeared to shed further light on Balibo by contradicting the official line that the journalists had been killed in the crossfire. Purwanto's interview in *Tempo Magazine* is perhaps the most important of the three occasions so far, with senior Indonesian military participants in the Balibo saga trying to undermine the official version of what happened in 1975.

With the scheduled showing of the film at the Human Rights Watch (HRW)'s Film Festival in London in March 2010, the organisation's Deputy Asia Director, Elaine Pearson, called upon the Indonesian government to rescind the censoring of the film:

“The Indonesian government should be protecting free expression, not censoring controversial films. *Balibo* may very well provoke public debate about the military's past actions, but the Indonesian government shouldn't be afraid of that discussion. Instead of spending its time trying to airbrush from history what had happened in East Timor, the Indonesian government should keep its promise to hold those who committed horrendous abuses, such as the killing of these six journalists, accountable” (Human Rights Watch, 2009).

In a press release, HRW also noted that representatives of several Indonesian government bodies, including the official spokesmen for the armed forces and both the Defence and Foreign Affairs ministries had welcomed the censorship as a measure to preserve the country's image and diplomatic standing abroad. Clearly, as the *Balibo* 'story' illustrates, the Indonesian regime is not comfortable with past human rights abuses being re-visited. But, by the



same token, the democratic maturity of the Indonesia regime will be measured at home and abroad.

## Conclusion

From a development education perspective, what are the summary lessons of the above analysis? First, the issues of truth, justice and human rights surrounding Balibo persist. Despite the events taking place thirty-five years ago, the call for redress remains strong and constant, and the screening or non-screening of Robert Connolly's film makes an impact here. Second, as the narrative and truth about Balibo reaches ever wider audiences, the international dimensions of the tragedy, present from the beginning, become more and more apparent. In this respect, terms such as 'cover-up' and 'conspiracy' will probably be used increasingly. Third, awareness raising and active learning about Balibo and the issues surrounding it have helped to promote an understanding of what happened and why it happened in 1975. Again, the film and its screenings - organised around relatives' participation, the film-makers/actors' key-note inputs and various panels, question and answer sessions and the like - have played a role here. Fourth, with increased international coverage, the role of Kopassus in Balibo and beyond has become more understood and criticised, an important consideration as many organisations and individuals are currently lobbying the Obama administration to oppose any cooperation with or assistance to the Indonesian Special Forces (ETAN, 2010). Fifth, the director of *Balibo* also has used the film as an opportunity to highlight the dangerous situations that many investigative journalists have been exposed around the world. To sum up, the educational process and engagement bound up with the *Balibo* narrative can serve to foster an ongoing demand for justice, solidarity and human rights at home and abroad. In this context, it is not surprising that Jakarta-based journalists and media-focused organisations held screenings of the film markedly for educational reasons.

**Note:** In completing the above article, the author would like to acknowledge the advice and information provided by Hugh Dowson, who of course has no responsibility for the final product.

## References

Byrnes, P (2009) 'Balibo: Long on factual fidelity, short on movie hyperbole, *Balibo* is tragic, dramatic and enraging':

<http://www.smh.com.au/news/entertainment/film/filmreviews/balibo/2009/08/13/1249756382624.html>.

Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation Timor-Leste (CAVR) (2005) *'Chega!' The Report of the Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation Timor-Leste*. Executive Summary: <http://www.cavr-timorleste.org>.

Cronau, P (forthcoming) *The Last Reporter*, ABC Books, Sydney.

Dowson, H (2005) *Declassified British Documents Reveal U.K. Support for Indonesian Invasion and Occupation of East Timor, Recognition of Denial of Self-Determination, 1975-1976*, The National Security Archive, Washington, DC: <http://www.gwu.edu/~nsarchiv/NSAEBB/NSAEBB174/indexuk.htm>.

East Timor Action Network (ETAN) (2010) *U.S. Training of Kopassus: A Bad Idea Whose Time Has Not Come*, 4 March 2010: <http://www.etanaction.blogspot.com/2010/03/us-training-of-kopassus-bad-idea-whose.html>.

Fernandes, C (2004) *Reluctant Saviour: Australia, Indonesia and the independence of East Timor*, Scribe Publications, Carlton North.

Fernandes, C (2009) 'Response from Balibo consulting historian to John Pilger' in *Green Left*, 19 October 2009: <https://www.greenleft.org.au/2009/814/41874>.

Hainsworth, P (2010), 'Past, present and future: British government policy and some critical perspectives in relation to impunity and justice matters in Timor-Leste', in Leach, M, Mendes, NC, da Silva, AB, Ximenes, AC & Boughton, B (eds.) *Understanding Timor-Leste*, Swinburne Press, Hawthorn.

Human Rights Watch (HRW) (2009) *Indonesia: Drop Censorship of Critical Film*, Press Release, 4 December 2009: <http://www.hrw.org/en/news/2009/12/04/indonesia-drop-censorship-critical-film>.

Honeywell, B (2010) 'Media ANZACS - a film everybody in the Asia-Pacific region should see' in *Pacific Scoop*, 15 February 2010: <http://pacific.scoop.co.nz/2010/02/media-anzacs-a-film-everybody-in-the-asia-pacific-region-should-see>.

Jolliffe, J (2009) *Balibo*, Scribe Publications, Carlton North.

Koc, E (2009) 'Balibo: a film every journalism student should see' in *Upstart*, 15 August 2009: <http://www.upstart.net.au/balibo-a-film-every-journalism-student-should-see/>.

Leadbeater, M (2006) *Negligent Neighbour: New Zealand's Complicity in the Invasion and Occupation of Timor-Leste*, Craig Potton Publisher, Auckland.

Maniaty, T (2009) *Shooting Balibo: Blood and Memory in East Timor*, Penguin, Melbourne.

Pilger, J (2009) 'The great "Balibo" cover up' in *Sight & Sound*, October 2009, pp. 10-11.

Robinson, G (2009) *'If you leave us here, we will die': How Genocide was Stopped in East Timor*, Princeton University Press, Princeton and Oxford.

**Paul Hainsworth** is a Senior Lecturer in Politics in the School of Criminology, Politics and Social Policy at the University of Ulster.

He is a co-founder and was chair of the East Timor Solidarity Campaign (Northern Ireland). Among his publications is (co-edited with Stephen McCloskey) *The East Timor Question: The Struggle for Independence from Indonesia*, I. B. Tauris, London and New York, 2000.

## GLOBAL EDUCATION AND MUSIC

Alexandra De La Torre

### Introduction

Global education has increasingly become part of the agenda of voluntary organisations in Northern Ireland, including many that traditionally have not seen their role as delivering education on global issues. However, many of these organisations have developed activities and strategies towards addressing and tackling attitudes against racism and sectarianism within the local community.

These activities are not only the result of the social response to the local conflict, recent history and current peace processes over the last 10 years, but also represent a contribution to the social challenges associated with the arrival of migrant workers in Northern Ireland.

With increased inward migration, it might seem that the historical feelings of suspicion and intolerance between the main Protestant and Catholic communities are being transferred to the new arrivals. Years of conflict, division and sectarianism between the two main communities in Northern Ireland have made necessary new methods to address these attitudes and to encourage understanding of how they affect the conflict and local division.

The general consensus has been that the best approach to reduce and eliminate negative attitudes against ‘other’ groups, such as migrant workers or ethnic minorities, is through the formal education system. This is because schoolchildren provide a receptive audience and are likely to absorb new ideas that they can share with their families and because schools are becoming increasingly multi-cultural and keen to address the challenges that these changes bring. Partnerships between schools and voluntary organisations have become a widely accepted approach to maximise efforts to create a more open-minded society.

Beyond Skin is a locally-based voluntary organisation that has begun to incorporate global education within its activities. In its many years delivering workshops in schools to address racism and sectarianism, this organisation has used the universal language of music to bring a message about increasing understanding of and respect for the greater diversity of cultures and

communities in our society. Beyond Skin has also provided the opportunity for the pupils to meet musicians from the global South living in Northern Ireland.

This article describes Beyond Skin's *Exploring Global Issues through Music* project, delivered in 2008-2009 in partnership with six schools across Northern Ireland. The project provided an innovative way of addressing the connections between: local problems and global concerns; the challenge of talking about racism; and looking at migration as a global phenomenon which has origins in poverty and inequalities between 'rich' and 'poor' countries.

## The project

The project was funded by the Department for International Development (DfID), and targeted two main aims of DfID's strategy for the promotion of global education. First, it involved incorporating projects related to 'global issues or development education' into school curriculum activities and second, it engaged migrant workers and ethnic minorities in its delivery. Beyond Skin worked in partnership with the development organisation Children in Crossfire to utilise their extensive experience in global education practice. This partnership added value to the programme by enriching its content and methodology which music as an engagement tool and a resource to create a friendly and non-threatening environment.

## Why music?

Music has particular value in promoting global issues. It is a universal language, and is easy to understand and share with others irrespective of their culture. Music is non-threatening and is appreciated by people of all ages. Teenagers especially, who can often be resistant to formal learning situations and unwilling to take part in group activities, are generally highly receptive to music and eager to engage with musicians. Within the Northern Ireland context, where different kinds of music and musical instruments are associated with the two main communities, many groups have worked to break down these cultural boundaries by bringing the music of one tradition to the other. Cross-cultural music, for example where both Lambeg drum and bodhrán are played, has been championed by a number of groups. The approach used by Beyond Skin, where both the music and musicians reflect the increasingly multi-cultural nature of Northern Ireland society, is recognised as having an increasingly important role in local and global understanding.

## Bringing the world to the classroom

One of the main strengths of the programme was the diverse background and profile of the musicians who took part as co-facilitators. All of them live permanently in Northern Ireland, and although most of them were formally trained professional musicians, most of them are now working in a job unrelated to music. However, being part of Beyond Skin gave them the opportunity to perform in occasional concerts or music workshops.

Training sessions were organised in order to help the assorted musicians perform effectively as part of *Exploring Global Issues through Music*. The musicians were also informed that the programme would not have the usual format of a single workshop where they only introduced themselves and played; the programme would require them to contribute actively as co-facilitators.

The musicians participated in a one day training seminar delivered in two parts. The first session introduced them to the concept of development education and was delivered by a facilitator from Children in Crossfire. This provided the context of the programme and gave an overview of the main issues in terms of the concepts and activities associated with global education. The second session was delivered by a facilitator from Beyond Skin and focused on the practicalities of the programme: the objectives, activities and methodology. Other practical issues, such as child protection policy and the need to obtain permissions for photographs were also discussed. The training session provided an opportunity to design the programme with consideration of the musicians' experiences and opinions about their global South roots, the connections between their previous life and present life in Northern Ireland, and the challenges they faced to adapt to living in a new country and culture.

Once the project began delivery in schools, the students were able to interact with the musicians and ask them questions related to their countries and also to increase their knowledge about topics such as geography and politics. The musicians' complete involvement in the programme development and delivery gave the sessions a global atmosphere, talking in other languages and exploring local dialects, for example, as ways of pronouncing the students' names. This dynamic provided the confidence and trust needed to openly discuss negative attitudes and address erroneous perceptions about ethnic

minorities within the classroom. The diversity within the team really enriched the content and interventions during the sessions.

### **The programme: Learning, activities and piloting new methodologies**

The programme was delivered in six schools in Northern Ireland: two in Derry, one in Bangor, one in Lisburn and two in Belfast. The number of participants per school was on average 25-30, with an age range of between 13 and 17 years. Four 75 minutes sessions were delivered in each school although it was necessary to keep the programme flexible to meet school needs. The schools were initially contacted by Beyond Skin, with either the principal or the music teacher informed about the objectives, content, methodologies and activities involved in the project. Five or six co-facilitators and one main facilitator delivered the programme in each school.

Once the schools agreed the dates, the team met the teacher in charge to learn more about the group. Information such as class size and whether any of the children had learning difficulties or other problems was collected in order to adapt the activities according to these needs. The teachers of music and geography in all of the schools were very supportive and participated in the sessions. The sessions provided these teachers with ideas for activities they could use in their own classes to address global issues such as poverty, migration, international debt and fair trade.

The programme was divided in four main parts. In the introductory session the facilitators and musicians introduced themselves and their instruments, and the students were given information about the project and asked about their expectations. The students were also required to agree with some team rules. The session included ice breaker activities that were different in each school, varying according to the size of the class, the age of the students and the particular needs of the class (such as presence of children with learning difficulties). Some ice breaker activities involved finding a country on a world map, guessing the tutor's identity or testing the drums. All these activities aimed to put into context the concepts to be discussed in the next session.

The second session of the programme looked at general global concepts, such as the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), interdependence, fair trade, racism, poverty reduction, migration, globalisation, international debt and the environment. These topics were only touched upon,

however it was important to assess how familiar the students were with these concepts. Despite the majority of the students not having previous training in global education or a great deal of knowledge about the issues, it was interesting that in some schools students were very aware of issues such as fair trade and migration. Most of the students agreed that they had some knowledge or understanding of these concepts through the media or global campaigns, including campaigns in which famous musicians organised a free concert to raise money for causes such as poverty, justice or human rights. This awareness gave us the opportunity to talk about how music has contributed to global education and how through global campaigns such as Make Poverty History and Stand Up Take Action, musicians and local and international non-governmental organisations (NGOs) have been able to raise global awareness of the issues that affect all of us.

The third part of the programme was focused on activities in which the pupils could discuss the chapter 'Money' from the *One Giant Leap* film. Using rhythms from different cultures as a background, the video illustrates a journey around the world showing images of rich and wealthy places in contrast to very deprived areas, and industrial zones in contrast to quiet and sacred places. After being asked if the video reflected the real world in which we all live, the students concluded that the video raised issues such as inequalities between the global North and South, injustice, lack of opportunities and education in some places and an excess of goods in others particularly in consumer-driven societies. In general all the students identified one common element to all the places: no matter how rich or poor they are, music is a common language that everybody can relate to.

These reflections contributed to the development of the next activity called 'Making a better world'. The pupils were asked to list ten solutions to the global problems addressed in the video. They made suggestions on how to reduce poverty, extend primary education, protect the environment, promote and develop health campaigns to reduce HIV and other diseases, develop working partnerships between rich and poor countries, enforce better rules to create a more equal international market, and in general, increase awareness of social and global problems. They were surprised that the list of common sense principles they compiled to address these issues correlated directly to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), one of the most important United Nations initiatives to reduce global poverty. This prompted the question: if this list is so easy to draw up, why are these goals so difficult to achieve and what is then needed to secure a real and effective implementation of the MDGs?



Other activities such as ‘would you buy?’ and the ‘country card’ were delivered to increase knowledge and understanding of issues related to international debt and fair trade. These complemented and added a more focused approach to the main activities. Music workshops within these sessions helped to bring a new dynamic to the group, especially after intense discussions or activities that required more concentration or reflection.

The final part of the programme explored the capacities of the pupils to create a product that showed a sense of world citizenship and could contribute to a promotional campaign to reduce poverty or raise global awareness. The students were given many examples of how music has contributed to the promotion of the Millennium Development Goals and poverty reduction campaigns. In some schools, students listed ten well-known songs that conveyed a message of peace, education, poverty or social justice and then explained their selection. In other schools the students prepared a song with lyrics that referred to the MDGs or global issues. Both demonstrated the capacity of the students to associate the concepts learnt with their own initiatives to promote global awareness.

During all the sessions the discussions were recorded and edited to be broadcast on Beyond Skin’s online radio Homely Planet. This was an initiative to link the schools that participated in the programme and promote the positive outcomes and discussions the students had while participating in this programme.

## Conclusion

Delivering the *Exploring Global Issues through Music* project was a challenge for the Beyond Skin team, but also a great opportunity to incorporate global education into the ethos and agenda of this organisation. Many of the musicians found the project a creative opportunity in which they could incorporate not only their abilities and knowledge as musicians but also their own life experiences. Moreover the project gave them confidence to develop an awareness training and helped them realise the potential of music to promote and develop global education initiatives.

The teacher and principals, who were very enthusiastic and pleased with the response of the students, realised that the methodologies applied and the activities delivered offered an alternative way of learning. The programme

also provided a basic understanding of how these kinds of projects could be included in citizenship and global education studies in the curriculum.

And finally, as the main facilitator and coordinator, this project has been a very rewarding personal experience. Joining Beyond Skin and its musicians in this journey has given me a new insight into the power of music to stimulate and make different audiences more receptive to global education. I would encourage all organisations that work to tackle and address racism and sectarianism to move beyond their traditional activities, to be adventurous and to learn through discovery as we did delivering our project.

# LET US WALK THE TALK: SUCCESSES AND STRUGGLES IN IMPLEMENTING GLOBAL EDUCATION AS A REGULAR COURSE AT UNIVERSITY LEVEL

Otilia Chareka, Garry Leyte & Alicia Mills

“Never doubt that a small group of thoughtful citizens can change the world. Indeed, it is the only thing that ever has” (Margaret Mead, anthropologist).

## Introduction

In this article Otilia Chareka, Garry Leyte and Alicia Mills emphasise the importance of teaching global education at university level as a regular course, and reflect on the successes and struggles of trying to implement global education at university and school level in the Canadian context. They also focus on the need for the inclusion of global education courses in the university calendar as a regular elective course both for the graduate Masters in Education program and Bachelor of Education program.

## Global education

In a world increasingly interconnected through technological advances, it is becoming more critical for today's students to become globally educated. Students need to learn how their actions and the actions of others are affecting people around the world, and how they can promote change through their own critical thinking and actions. In order to provide students with the skills to think critically about global issues, teachers must be confident and creative in providing the students with opportunities to discuss and explore these complex issues through the delivery of global education. Chareka (1994) argues in the context of continual discussion about a shrinking world, that global education and its inclusion in formal education is becoming more important than ever before. The inclusion of global education at St. Francis Xavier University to teach students to think critically and reflect on global issues is a focus within the Masters of Education (M.Ed.) Program at the University where the course is still taught as a 'special topic' to practicing teachers, however not taught at all to students in the Bachelor of Education degree (B.Ed.) program.

This article aims to encourage colleagues to teach students about global issues and the importance of being a global citizen in a proactive manner that is transformative in respect to knowledge and development. Educators need to equip students with knowledge, critical thinking skills and values which can help them become informed citizens. Osler and Vincent (2002) contend that teachers face the challenge of teaching for equity, justice and solidarity. Teachers need to realize that their position gives them a degree of power and authority that dictates what their students learn, understand and how they act. The Secretary of the Economic and Social Council for the United Nations in 1986 argued:

“A child born today will be faced as an adult almost daily with problems of a global interdependent nature, be it peace, food, quality of resources. He [the child] will be both an actor and beneficiary or victim in the total world fabric and may rightly ask: Why was I not warned? Why did my teachers not tell me about these problems and indicated my behaviour as a member of an interdependent human race? It is therefore the duty and the self-enlightened interest of governments to educate their children properly about the type of world in which they are going to live” (Alladin, 1989:8).

### **The limitations of the University system**

Despite the positive feedback of students who have taken the global education course, it should be noted that it was only taught online as a ‘special topic’ as it is not in the University calendar. University policy stipulates that a professor cannot continue to teach a course as a special topic after teaching/offering it on three consecutive occasions. Given the positive impact of this course on all the three streams Chareka has taught, it was very disappointing to no longer be able to offer the course unless it is approved and listed in the University calendar in the future. Inspired by continual positive feedback from students including co-authors Mills and Leyte, Chareka persevered, and has developed the special topic ‘global education’ into a course in October 2008 that is currently awaiting approval as an elective in the University calendar.

The positive experiences and feedback of the students who took the online global education course demonstrated that it helped provide in-service teachers with an opportunity to become more confident in teaching global issues and provided opportunities for students in to become active, responsible global

citizens. In a more interconnected world, it is important for students to learn global issues and bring about positive developmental changes as Chareka and Van Dommelen argued:

“Students should know and understand social justice and equity, diversity, globalization and interdependence, sustainable development, peace, conflict and others. The key skills students should be developing include: critical thinking; ability to argue effectively; ability to challenge injustice and inequities; respect for people and things; cooperation; and conflict resolution. The values and attitudes global education and citizenship education fosters are: sense of identity and self-esteem; empathy; commitment to social justice and equity; and value and respect for diversity. As authors, we feel that if all teachers can be taught to understand this, and their students [are able to] grasp such knowledge, values, attitudes and critical thinking skills then the world might be a better place to live in. However, in order for teachers to teach this effectively, they need to be equipped” (Chareka & Van Dommelen, in press).

### **The need for global education in the formal education system**

Leyte and Mills utilised the knowledge gained in the online global education course in their own teaching both pre-service and in-service. Leyte developed and adapted various global education resources which Mills has also adapted and both used in their classes. They found that teaching global education with an interdisciplinary infusion approach helped young students to situate themselves in the global context as evidenced by Bourn (2008), who argues the critical need for young people to make sense of their identity and develop a sense of belonging, in order to establish the relationship between global processes and local experiences.

Engaging in global education inspired both Leyte and Mills to continually seek out new knowledge about world issues such as child labour, fair trade, HIV/AIDS, global warming and the global water crisis, and to share this new knowledge with their students. Specifically, global education helped to broaden his very limited perspective on several international issues, particularly HIV/AIDS and how it has impacted on developed and developing countries, including Canada.

In their teaching, the authors recognize the importance of guiding and facilitating learning among their students, motivating them to be active citizens and bringing about developmental change at a local level which has a global impact. Students realized that they can be proactive by not seeing ‘us’ and ‘them’ and not perpetuating the ‘otherness’, but by bringing a sense of local, national and global community belonging, and realizing that we are all human beings sharing one earth who need and want the same things to survive, for example clean water.

Global education helps students to recognize that they are also contributors to the global problems shared by rich and poor countries alike, and they need to take action to address these problems. This view is supported by Andreotti in her analysis of global citizenship education where she discussed the idea of empowering learners and stated:

“In this sense, critical literacy is not about ‘unveiling’ the ‘truth’ for the learners, but about providing the space for them to reflect on their context and their own and others’ epistemological and ontological assumptions: how we came to think/be/feel/act the way we do and the implications of our systems of belief in local/global terms in relation to power, social relationships and the distribution of labour and resources” (Andreotti, 2006:7).

Students should learn about global issues while having the opportunity to critically engage with the material. Rather than being presented concepts that promote the ‘otherness’ of other cultures, such as dress, music, dance and food, students should have the opportunity to engage with issues that they can relate to and could be affecting them as well. Andreotti argued:

“...this approach tries to promote change without telling learners what they should think or do, by creating spaces where they are safe to analyse and experiment with other forms of seeing/thinking and being/relating to one another” (Andreotti, 2006:7).

## Conclusion

Considering the evidence of success in engaging in global education and the need for it in today’s world, why does it take so long for a course to be approved at University level? Various institutions around the world, even here in

Canada, have taken global education seriously in their teacher training programs either as a required course or as an elective. There is obviously a need to support teachers, both in-service and pre-service, as they embark on teaching global education given that the school curriculum has global education objectives. However, most teacher education programs in Canada lack global education content, and where it is offered, it is an elective and not a required course. It would be interesting to see how the issues and politics of institutional power and bureaucracy influence decision-making in regard to courses that are approved to the University calendar.

Despite the positive influence on the authors' work and worldviews and the need to integrate global education initiatives into pre-service and in-service teacher education programs, it should be noted that the course is still in the process of being approved. However there are grounds for optimism facing into the future. The newly created Faculty of Education has new administrators, and a new course approval procedure and Committee has been formed for professional studies. These new operating structures offer some hope that our teacher training program will soon be approved.

## References

Alladin, I (1989) 'Teaching for global awareness' in *The AT Magazine*, Vol. 69, 4, pp. 6-10.

Andreotti, V (2006) 'Soft versus critical global citizenship education' in *Policy & Practice: A Development Education Review*, Vol. 3, pp. 1-9.

Bacon, NA, Kischner, GA (2002) 'Shaping global classrooms' in *Educational Leadership*, Vol. 60, pp. 48-51.

Bourn, D (2008) 'Young people, identity and living in a global society' in *Policy & Practice: A Development Education Review*, Vol. 7, pp. 48-61.

Canadian Red Cross (2009): <http://www.redcross.ca>.

Chareka, O (1994) *Justification for the inclusion of the study of global interdependence in the Zimbabwean school curriculum*, Unpublished Master's Report, University of New Brunswick, Fredericton.

Chareka, O & Van Dommelen, P (forthcoming) 'From a global education idiot teacher to a competent global education educator' in *Why global citizenship education in Canadian teacher education programs?*

National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) (1982) 'Position Statement on global education', Washington, DC.

Osler, A, & Vincent, K (2002) *Citizenship and the challenge of global education*, Trentham Books, Stoke on Trent.

**Dr. Otilia Chareka** is an Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Education at St. Francis Xavier University. She Obtained her DAUS, M.Ed. and Ph.D. from the University of New Brunswick. Her areas of specialization are global education, multicultural education, diverse cultures, human rights and citizenship education, quantitative and qualitative research methods in education, program evaluation and school data management. She teaches in both B.Ed. and M.Ed. programs.

**Garry Leyte** is an elementary school teacher in western Newfoundland. He received his B.Ed. from Memorial University and his M.Ed. in education (literacy) from Mount Saint Vincent University. He is currently working on his M.Ed. (administration and leadership) from St. Francis Xavier University. He has a passion for providing learning engagements which enable his students to make connections to their lived experiences and to simultaneously compare this to the experiences of others, especially children, from around the world.

**Alicia Mills** is a Research Assistant with Dr. Otilia Chareka at St. Francis Xavier University. She obtained her B.Ed. and B.Sc. with honours in mathematics from St. Francis Xavier University. Her focus as an educator is in mathematics and science with special interest in incorporating global issues, diverse cultures and



inclusive practices. She teaches in the Strait Regional School Board, Nova Scotia, Canada.

## TALES OF HUNTING

Jaya Graves

### Introduction

An old Yoruba proverb states ‘until the lions have their historians, tales of hunting will glorify the hunter’. Succinctly, the proverb captures the essence of the work of Southern Voices (SV) and the rationale for our current project, ‘Weaving Stories’, which is delivered in collaboration with the Museum of Science and Industry (MoSI) in Manchester.

Priyamvada Gopal (*Guardian*, 28 June 2006), lecturer in postcolonial studies at Cambridge University, suggests that the history of British colonialism is being ‘reworked into a fairy tale of our times’ by historians like Niall Ferguson, who ‘puts the white man and his burden back at the centre of heroic action’. A story of ‘slavery, plunder, war, corruption, land-grabbing, famines, exploitation, indentured labour, impoverishment, massacres, genocide and forced resettlement...is rewritten into a benign developmental mission marred by a few unfortunate accidents and excesses’. (Ferguson’s response can be found in the *Guardian* 11 July 2006.)

Gopal’s views are echoed by historians like Piers Brendon, John Newsinger, Mike Davis, Caroline Elkins and Gideon Polya. Davis (author of *The Blood that Never Dried*) explores the relationship between English policies and famine in India over a 200 year period. He concludes that over 30 million deaths, the total estimated to have resulted from famines under British colonial rule, could not be attributed to ‘natural causes’, but instead were a result of the British laissez-faire policy of non-intervention; that in fact, they were preventable. Wilby, in the *New Statesman*, quoting from AN Wilson’s *The Victorians*, describes how ‘bayoneted prisoners were roasted over fires and Muslims sewn into pigskins before execution’ in the aftermath of the 1857 War of Independence in India. Brendon (author of *The Decline and Fall of the British Empire*) describes white settlers in Kenya who ‘hunted down Kikuyu trouble-makers’ like wild animals, torturing them at will. Lindqvist, traveler and historian, uses newspaper accounts to describe a genocidal picture of European colonialism: British massacres of wounded Sudanese rebels after the siege of Omdurman; German concentration camps in southwest Africa; a Belgian captain who used the skulls of troublesome plantation workers as lanterns to

decorate his garden. His book traces Belgium, Swedish, French and British intervention in Africa, and claims that such actions were routine not exceptions (Lindqvist, 1997).

This article does not aim to make an unbiased presentation of history but instead argues that *all* history is biased. Even academics from the global South use the same frameworks and terminology in their description of history. For instance, it is quite normal to hear Indian historians referring to the 'Indian Mutiny' and the 'granting' of independence. Some redress to this imbalance is necessary. This is not to suggest that young children should be exposed to narratives of such barbarity, but that our presentation of history from all sides of events needs to be better known, particularly among educators. . I have deliberately included graphic examples because the notion of 'benign colonialism' still stalks educators, the media and image-makers. For example, some politicians believe that colonialism has 'good aspects'. Many development education (DE) practitioners have limited awareness of the complexities of colonial history. Countries in the global North are still propelled to violent intervention on the assumption of superiority, and the goodwill notion of sharing 'our values' and 'our way of life'. They continue to inscribe our attitudes onto each other, preventing cohesion and sustaining racism.

Many issues and themes addressed in global education and global citizenship have roots in colonialism, like poverty, various ethnic conflicts, social injustices, environmental degradation, and a global imbalance of power and racism. Unless we have a deeper understanding of our history and its mythologising, the excesses of the past will be repeated. We will continue to imagine that the Northern way of life - its systems, ambitions and values - *must* be recreated elsewhere.

In a society that has been inter-racial for hundreds of years, this partial view of history is increasingly challenged. It alienates people who see no reflection of their reality and experience, either in terms of their countries of origin or their histories. This article will consider how Southern Voices's Weaving Stories initiative uses education and awareness raising to consider the enduring impact of colonialism and how it can reclaim history deleted by many mainstream historians.

## Weaving Stories

Weaving Stories is an initiative that aims to challenge the casual deletion of colonial histories and the outcomes of colonial oppression. Although this initiative alone cannot comprehensively address the inaccuracies of history as it has been written, it can draw attention to the continuing legacy of colonialism and how it influences contemporary thinking.

The Weaving Stories project has two major strands: an exhibition and workshops, both of which are carefully and widely researched. The exhibition uses artifacts from the MoSI's archives as well as from community members. Workshops are led by presenters from the global South in the Museum, schools, community centres and libraries using widely researched exhibition material, personal and social narrative and community methodology. The workshops feature a mix of experiences, perceptions, methodology and opportunities, to essentially produce a potent and living experience for children.

For the exhibition theme, the textile industry was chosen because of its centrality to Manchester's industrial supremacy and the rise of England as an imperial power. Consistently ignored in the written history of the textile industry is the destruction of a thriving textile industry in India, of an established trade in textiles between India and China, as well as the wrecking of small-scale rural manufacturing in England. As the textile industry grew to thrive in England, textile manufacturing in India was almost entirely destroyed and raw Indian cotton fed the hungry mills of Lancashire. Later the textile industry in Egypt and Sudan suffered similar destruction. The Egyptian historian Afaf Lutfi al-Sayyid Marsot says, 'Egypt (was seen) only as a provider of raw material'. Various European countries, particularly France and Russia, fought for control over the region as it also guarded access to India. This demonstrates how European colonialism impacted upon countries outside their direct realm of colonial control, but were subject to the regional economic and social consequences of colonial expansion.

Related events in the Weaving Stories programme of activities (for example exhibition launches, cross-sector workshops, interactive discussions) are organised to bring together different sectors and communities to encourage cross-sectoral learning and catalyse new partnerships and work. This is based on a broad public education agenda.

Weaving Stories thus aims to bring different interpretations to museum collections and different perspectives to education. It also aims to

suggest that different *kinds* of knowledge have value. In many Southern countries and ancient cultures, memories and narratives are both important tools in the preservation of culture and identity, and are maintained as a reservoir of historical data. Often the primary means of historical education is the retelling of narratives by elder members of the community, that is subsequently reinforced by reading. This does not undermine its value; ‘transmission’ validates our most sacred teachings. These can be *experienced* and *tested*, which is indeed being done in sectors like the cognitive sciences. Knowledge and understanding therefore cannot be reduced to a Western matrix.

## Education and engaging with difference

Education allows learners to be exposed to different perspectives, narratives and analyses through which they can shape their understanding of the world. However, society often legitimises some knowledge and narratives while excluding others. The content and delivery of education is subject to the scrutiny of government and other external influences including the agendas of grant-giving agencies, which has consequences beyond what organisations know or intend. An example is the bi-centennial commemoration of the abolition of the Slave Trading Act in 2007, for which funds were accessed through the Heritage sector rather than going directly to black community groups. The proposals and applications were developed without the involvement of black community groups and/or the descendants of slaves even at the *project development* stage. This lack of participation from representatives of the black community in either the planning or operational aspect of the commemoration was met with anger and criticism. A similar scenario occurred in a development education (DE) Network with which I used to work. The Network decided it needed to ‘do something’ about slavery, to which I suggested that it commission black individuals or organisations to develop a project to address the issue of slavery considering the lack of black or minority ethnic representation in the group. An added benefit to externally commissioning an educational initiative on slavery was the opportunity it afforded for collaboration by the DE organisation with the BME sector; a sector with which the Network had not previously engaged. However, the Network chose to instead host an event on ‘modern day slavery’, thus not requiring any external engagement outside of their comfort zone or any reflection on their current practice or knowledge.

In order to critically engage with different perspectives, they need to be known and understood. It must also be understood that different perspectives

cannot always be encountered through normal educational channels and must be gathered from a variety of sources and educational pathways. The development and DE sector do not engage with communities outside the sector or seek out different perspectives as often as they should. Habitual and traditional views are more likely to be challenged outside comfort zones, but such 'nodes of tension' also serve as origins of creativity. In a Freirean model of education, 'schools become spaces where students interrogate social conditions through dialogue about issues significant to their lives' (Coffey, 2006). But when someone works in the sector long enough feel they have become or have come to be seen as an 'expert', critique becomes criticism and is difficult to countenance. An ethos has emerged in DE where discussion or self-examination is minimal. 'Learning' and 'training' events are concluded with information *about* this or that, and the gathering becomes more about 'knowledge transfer' than self-reflection.

## **Southern Voices and Southern perspectives**

Southern Voices (SV) was founded on the perception that there were few Southern people visible or involved in development NGOs, development education networks, charities and university departments. SV took the view that in the late 20th century this was an inexcusable state of affairs. Initially, the fairly unique perspective of SV was welcomed; however as it became apparent that SV was prepared to critically assess the positions and perspectives of agencies and centres, its critique and analysis has become less welcome.

Methodologies have evolved that focus on the need for different perspectives and varied experiences within a group. Some proponents of these methodologies have suggested that Southern Perspectives (SPs) are no longer more relevant or valid than other perspectives, and that SV in particular does not engage with the 'complexity of our current society'. SV was set up as an international and intercultural network of people, with the specific rationale of engagement between differences. SPs are still crucial to the North-South dynamic and cannot be lost in the notion of 'different perspectives'. Our own learning and the development of SPs is created by dialectical engagement. We do not claim to be 'experts' but we do have perceptions and understandings central to global education and DE, which may challenge mainstream assumptions and documentation. Our sources and analyses are different, but our experiences are raw and our commitment is constant. We base our analyses on dialogue with others to help interrogate our own assumptions, thereby strengthening our knowledge and understanding.

A variety of ethnicities present within an organisation or event does not ensure the presence of SPs. An organisation ‘can be multi-ethnic but mono-cultural’. Organisations that have made a conscious effort to include various ethnicities may be promoting ‘equal opportunities’, but it does not imply an actual ‘engagement with differences’.

SV has written on the eight concepts elsewhere (Graves, 2002; Graves, 2007). However I feel that they fail to address additional crucial underlying issues in global development. First, economic poverty is not a measure of poverty in every sphere. There are different measures of poverty and wealth. Attempts at ‘wealth creation’ will leave our planet a husk in which life is unsustainable. If we are serious about environmental challenges and ‘poverty’ alleviation we must address the issues of over-consumption of resources. If the current ‘Make Poverty History’ slogan was ‘Make *Wealth* History’ (as in insatiable greed), what would have been required of the North? At the very least, the spotlight would be turned upon this society. Consumption and re-distribution would have to be considered, a concept far more challenging to the stimuli of our current socio-economic system.

The second issue is power. We cannot address any of the concepts and ignore the imbalance of power that distorts all relationships. Interdependence and social justice (two of the eight global dimensions), for example, are meaningless terms without examining power.

## Conclusion

A project exploring colonial history may seem ‘out of date’ but it exposes issues central to development education. We cannot undo the actions or the effects of colonial history, but understanding it is important if we hope to find solutions of the continuing legacies of colonialism that are capable of having any success. Open-market policies that killed millions in Indian famines were not a panacea for economic growth and prosperity; however the construct of racism grew with slavery and colonialism. The question of whether historical mythologising still determines official actions at home and abroad must be asked together with a questioning of the role of the history of the developed world in creating violence and racism on our streets.

It is obvious that with the rise of migration and diversity in the United Kingdom and Ireland, racism has also increased. Despite calls for social justice,

poverty eradication, etc., from the development and DE sectors, it is still rare to find development organisations engaged in ‘partnerships’ with Southern perspectives (apart from occasional references to Freire and subaltern literature).

Southern views or perspectives are infrequently reflected, and Southern or ‘minority’ people rarely attend or present at workshops and conferences held in the sector. There are limited references to *development* debates, development writers and development theory; even the language used is unintentionally paternalistic and burdened with hierarchy. The issues raised here should be kept in mind by DE practitioners when working with and in the development sector. This means acting from a point of responsibility, not guilt. It means that we must be willing to engage with *difference*. ‘Experts’ belong in a rarified world. Praxis requires that we need to be in the field. We need to engage with peoples’ experiences, and be critical of any and all information with which we are presented.

## References

Bahl, V (2000) ‘Situating and Rethinking Subaltern Studies for Writing Working Class History’ in Dirlik, A, Bahl, V & Gran, P (eds.) *History after the Three Worlds: Post Eurocentric Historiographies*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, Maryland.

Brendon, P (2006) *The Decline and Fall of the British Empire*, Jonathan Cape, London.

Coffey, H (2006) *Critical Literacy*, Chapel Hill: <http://www.learnnc.org/lp/pages/4437>.

Davis, M (2001) *Post Victorian Holocausts: El Nino and the Making of the Third World*, Verso, London.

Elkins, C (2004) *Imperial Reckoning: The Story of Britain’s Gulag in Kenya*, Henry Holt and Company, New York.

Gopal P (2006) ‘The story peddled by imperial apologists is a poisonous fairytale’ in *Guardian*, 28 June 2006, Manchester.

Graves, J (2002) ‘Developing a global dimension in the curriculum’ in *Curriculum Journal*, Volume 13, 3, pp. 303-311.

Graves, J (2007) ‘The changing landscape of development education’ in *Policy & Practice: A Development Education Review*, Vol. 5, Autumn 2007.



Lindqvist, S (1997) *"Exterminate All the Brutes": One Man's Odyssey into the Heart of Darkness and the Origins of European Genocide*, New Press, New York.

Lutfi al-Sayyid Marsot, A (1984, 1994) *A History of Egypt: From the Arab Conquest to the Present*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Newsinger, J (2006) *The Blood That Never Dried: A People's History of the British Empire*, Bookmarks, London.

Wilby, P (2006) 'Who's the twerp and who writes twaddle' in *New Statesman*, 26 June 2006, Blackfriars.

# Resource reviews

## PROMOTING DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION IN YOUTH WORK TRAINING

Hilary Tierney

Whether it is called global youth work or development education, 2008-2009 was a productive year for research on its relationship with youth work and youth work education and training with at least three research projects undertaken.

De Montfort University in Leicester examined global youth work in higher education institutions (HEIs), my own university, the National University of Ireland Maynooth, explored the attitudes of young people and youth workers to global justice issues and finally, the Centre for Global Education in Belfast commissioned research on development education in Community Youth Work courses at the University of Ulster (UU), Jordanstown. The latter research report titled 'Promoting Development Education in Youth Work Training' is the subject of this review.

The research was guided by an advisory group and adopted a qualitative approach to explore how 'development education is and can be further addressed within the youth and community work courses at the University of Ulster' (2009:9). The research participants included lecturers, students, members of the North South Education and Training Standards Committee for Youth Work (NSETS) and the Youth Work Training Board in Northern Ireland (YWTB).

The research sought to build on the success of a 'Global Youth Work' programme (accredited by the Northern Ireland Open College Network - NIOCN) delivered to youth workers on an in-service basis and, specifically, to identify new opportunities for collaboration in strengthening the global dimension in professional youth work programmes. The fieldwork was carried out in late 2008 by Aine Wallace and Stella Murray of Dare to Stretch consultancy on behalf of the Centre for Global Education in Belfast and the University of Ulster (UU). It was funded by a grant from the Department for

International Development (DfID) Development Awareness Mini-Grant Scheme.

The research takes the United Nations' definition as its starting point, highlighting development education's mission to 'enable people to participate in the development of their community, their nation and the world as a whole' through their engagement in actions that promote social justice and equality. The report also notes the differing terminologies used in youth work contexts to describe the process of enhancing understanding of international development issues and enabling individuals to develop the skills, values and attitudes to that end. These include global youth work, development education in youth work, global justice in youth work, education for sustainable development and global citizenship, all of which were used interchangeably during the research.

The research outcomes are grouped under five headings: relevance, most appropriate training courses for global youth work, internationalisation of global youth work, resources, motivation and wider support. These headings are expanded in the main body of the report to include a more detailed discussion of opportunities and challenges associated with incorporating global youth work in the professional programmes at UU. The findings and analysis are organised by group, firstly, lecturers followed by NSETS members, the Youth Work Training Board and finally students at both the Jordanstown and Magee (Derry) campuses. A number of tables provide useful summaries of the findings.

The findings are presented in great detail and it is impossible to do them justice here so I will highlight a few that resulted in specific recommendations and attracted my attention while inviting you to read the full report to satisfy your own interests. Firstly, the report highlights the role of highly committed staff members in promoting the inclusion of a global youth work dimension in the absence of explicit agreed curriculum content on global issues/education. It was interesting therefore to note that there was general agreement among participants that there is both the potential and an imperative to consciously incorporate a global justice perspective into professional youth work programmes by maximising existing opportunities rather than creating a separate module (2009:30). The possibility of offering students the opportunity to specialise at post-graduate level was also suggested (33). This makes sense in a context where one of the biggest challenges cited by the research was that of time to add on additional curriculum content into an already congested

timetable. In addition, the diverse range of terminology was seen as confusing and was identified as a further challenge in focusing on global justice aspects of youth work, a point borne out by the De Montfort research (Sallah, 2009:2).

For instance, the ‘internationalisation’ of global youth work may promote a tendency to focus on faraway places and contribute to an ‘othering’ at the expense of a commitment to diversity, social justice and interdependence locally and globally (2009:31). Equally, opportunities for students to undertake fieldwork practice placements in other countries were seen as valuable in contributing to their awareness of global justice issues.

Secondly, the research noted that the current focus of youth work on promoting young people’s personal development is perhaps made at the expense of their wider social or political development. This is reflected in a lack of demand for the inclusion of a global dimension in professional programmes from the wider sector and may be related to perceptions that youth work students themselves are less political than in the past. At the same time, twenty-five out of thirty-two students described themselves as ‘very motivated’ or ‘motivated’ in relation to incorporating a global justice dimension into the programmes at UU.

On a related issue, concerns were raised about the availability of youth work-specific resources for global education practitioners. The perception in the youth sector is that most existing resources are developed for formal rather than informal education and may not be suitable without time consuming adaptation for youth work audiences which can be a deterrent in a busy work context. While it was acknowledged that some specific youth work resources are available, participants queried their ability to source and utilise them appropriately. This finding is consistent with research carried out in NUI Maynooth in 2008. One proposal made to address this situation is the development of a toolkit for lecturers to enable them to incorporate global justice concerns across a wide range of modules. Such a toolkit could usefully be developed for youth workers to the same ends.

The report itself is attractively presented in seven sections and laid out in a horizontal A4 format over forty pages making for an informative and substantial read, certainly providing more detail than can be reviewed in this short article. The comprehensive five page executive summary could usefully be made available as a downloadable pdf document to maximise access and distribution. This would support the author’s stated aim of sharing the learning from the research with a range of statutory and voluntary youth work and

development focused organisations and those higher education institutions providing professional education and training for youth workers.

While the research findings relate specifically to the University of Ulster programmes they clearly resonate with other recent findings in the youth sector (Devlin and Tierney, 2009; Sallah, 2009). For those committed to global youth work, it would be gratifying to think that this recent research activity signifies a significant step in embedding a global justice dimension into the training and education of youth work professionals. Such an added dimension could promote youth work's contribution to the social and political education of young people as well as their personal development.

Centre for Global Education (2009) *Promoting Development Education in Youth Work Training*, University of Ulster, Jordanstown, Centre for Global Education, Belfast: <http://www.centreforglobaleducation.com/documents/105>.

## References

Devlin, M & Tierney, H (2009) *Attitudes of Young People and Youth Workers to Development and Global Justice Issues and their Implications for Youth Work Practice*, National Youth Development Education Programme, National Youth Council of Ireland, Dublin.

Sallah, M. (2009) *The State of Global Youth Work in HEIs (Summary Report)*, De Montfort University, Leicester: [http://www.dmu.ac.uk/Images/Global%20Youth%20Work%20Report%2001c\\_tcm6-44144.pdf](http://www.dmu.ac.uk/Images/Global%20Youth%20Work%20Report%2001c_tcm6-44144.pdf).

**Hilary Tierney** works in the Department of Applied Social Studies at the National University of Ireland at Maynooth, Co Kildare

# *GLOBAL EDUCATION GUIDELINES: CONCEPTS AND METHODOLOGIES ON GLOBAL EDUCATION FOR EDUCATORS AND POLICY MAKERS*

Charo Lanao-Madden

I came across this useful guide while doing a Google search for the phrase ‘what is global education?’ This resource is not only a guide for understanding and practicing global education, but also a pedagogical coaching tool to implement and enrich global education practices.

The guidelines are intended to strengthen the delivery of global education and to assist practitioners in both formal and non-formal education by introducing general elements which they can develop using their own experiences and according to the needs of their practice. They also help to identify existing global education approaches and practices, and to support educators in becoming more aware of their own global education activities.

To achieve these objectives, the guidelines describe global education approaches, related methodologies and evaluation criteria by sharing existing practice and tools, and providing an extensive list of resources, including a bibliography. I found the guidelines particularly useful for the design and delivery of a global educators’ training programme. I would recommend the resource to global education practitioners, and to individuals interested in understanding what global education is and requiring practical guidance as to how to include it in their practice. The resource features a clear and accessible structure; however I would have preferred more examples and more accompanying graphs and images.

Chapter A provides definitions of the term ‘global education’. It also explains its rationale for its focus on global education as a transformative learning process, which involves a ‘deep, structural shift in the basic premises of thoughts, feelings and actions. It is an education for the mind as well as for the heart’ (North-South Centre, 2008:13). It describes how the purpose of global education is not just to learn about global themes, world problems and how to find solutions by working together. It is also meant to help us envision a common future with better life conditions for all, connecting local and global

perspectives, and learning how to make this vision a reality, starting from our local communities.

Chapter B asks ‘Why Global Education?’ The guidelines explain that our world today is a globalised world and how globalisation poses fundamental challenges for all areas of education. It also details the aims of global education, including: ‘educating citizens in social justice and sustainable development’; ‘opening a global dimension and a holistic perspective in education in order to help people understand the complex realities and processes of today’s world and develop values, attitudes, knowledge and skills that will enable them to face the challenges of an interconnected world’; ‘developing learning communities, in which learners and educators are encouraged to work cooperatively on global issues; and ‘stimulating and motivating learners and educators to approach global issues through innovative teaching and pedagogy’ (North-South Centre, 2008:18).

Chapter C explains that ‘global education enables people to develop the knowledge, skills, values and attitudes needed for securing a just, sustainable world in which everyone has the right to fulfill his/her potential’ (North-South Centre, 2008:20). It explains the difference between the traditional understanding of education as a collection of previously approved content and global education, which is a process that encourages learners to explore the roots and causes of events and developments. It also delves into the types of knowledge, skills, values and attitudes it aspires to enable in learners.

Chapter D is titled ‘Methodology’. It describes the fundamentals of global education methodology, presents methodological approaches such as cooperative-based learning, problem-based learning and dialogue-based learning. It also outlines criteria for planning and evaluating global education activities, criteria for selecting and evaluating resources, and criteria for curriculum design for formal and non-formal settings. This is one of the most practical chapters and is highly recommended as a resource when delivering any global education training or activity.

Chapter E provides a comprehensive bibliography and list of resources. The resources support global educators at a practical level by:

- Clarifying fundamental questions related to global education;
- Suggesting strategies on how to build content;

- Proposing aims, skills, values and attitudes;
- Offering guidance on methodologies, curricular design and programme evaluation; and
- Listing useful contacts and links.

The *Global Education Guidelines* recognise that ‘global education is not just concerned with different perspectives on globalised themes and what you teach and learn about them. It is also concerned about how you teach and learn and the contextual conditions in which you teach and learn’ (North-South Centre, 2008:20). They balance the importance of content with that of the context in which the learning process takes place.

The resource was developed by the Global Education Week Network in coordination with the North-South Centre of the Council of Europe. There is a hard copy of the guidelines available from the North-South Centre of the Council of Europe and an electronic version available from the Council of Europe website. The latter version has an additional chapter with useful global education-related links.

## References

North-South Centre of the Council of Europe (2008) *Global Education Guidelines: Concepts and Methodologies on Global Education for Educators and Policy Makers*, North-South Centre, Lisboa-Portugal: <http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/nscentre/ge/GE-Guidelines/GEguidelines-web.pdf>.

**Charo Lanao-Madden** grew up in Peru, where she worked for different organisations on issues of fair trade, gender and development and management of natural resources. Charo is an experienced trainer and facilitator on antidiscrimination, antiracism and diversity. She was deeply involved in the development of the Latin American Association and served as the coordinator from 2003-2005. From 2005-2007 she worked for Community Change providing training on governance and strategic planning for community groups. On 2008 she worked for Rural Community Network as the Good Relations



Officer. Since September 2008, she has worked for the Centre for Global Education as the coordinator for the Making Connections Project, a global education project for the ethnic minority sector in Northern Ireland. She has a BSc in Sociology, a MA in Conservation and Development, Post Graduate Diplomas in Gender Studies, Community Drama Facilitation and recently obtained her accreditation as an NLP practitioner.